HOW COLLEGES CAN BALANCE FACULTY CAREER AND LIFE NEEDS
WHILE BETTER MANAGING THE INSTITUTION

JoNeil Mundt, Eberhardt School of Business, University of the Pacific, Stockton, CA 95211 (209-946-2467)
Russell W. Driver, College of Business, The University of Oklahoma, Norman, OK 73019 (405-325-2651)

Higher education in the U.S. is evolving toward a fundamentally different operating environment which is likely to forever change the way it does its business. The use of financial, physical, and human resources is being more closely scrutinized than ever before. There is a call from constituents for teaching improvements, evaluation of the research function, increasing institutional effectiveness, reducing administrative overhead, and being truly accountable. We believe this is not a cyclical issue which will soon pass. Conceptually, it reminds us of the forces behind recent fundamental and radical changes in U.S. businesses.

In this paper, we discuss predictions of increasing supply of students and simultaneous shortages of faculty during the next 15-20 years. This is followed by a discussion of well-being, life-needs, and morale among faculty, and the related impact of those on students and the looming faculty supply/demand imbalance. Then we suggest that those issues can be addressed, and perhaps even resolved, by schools expanding the envelope of faculty staffing options.

In the discussion of well-being, life-needs, and morale of faculty, we address the following. Frustration is influenced by lack of institution/professor "fit." Frustration is influenced by discordant activity/reward relationships. Morale and retention problems are often related to salary compression and inversion. Morale and resultant retention problems are often due to gender discrimination. There can be a lack of fulfillment from professorial job responsibilities which affects fulfillment of overall life-needs and well-being.

We suggest that in order to deal with some of these issues we might take a lesson from U.S. businesses. Many companies report success with such things as flex-time, job-sharing, hiring consultants, providing leaves-of-absence and sabbaticals, having "mommy" and "daddy" tracks, and "boundaryless career" concepts. They have succeeded in spite of or perhaps because of going outside the normal envelope of staffing options. We believe the envelope of faculty staffing options must be expanded and moved away from the traditional thinking that the only faculty staffing alternatives are adjunct, tenured, and tenure-track faculty.

It is important to maximize faculty productivity, to include the effects on their productivity of their well-being and the extent their personal and professional life-needs are met. We suggest development of systems which allow for more creative job options for faculty as they progress through their individual, family, and career life cycles. These could include: allowing for both full-time and part-time (different from adjunct) faculty; differential weighting of performance components; allowing position requirements to evolve with faculty personal and professional lives; accommodating opportunistic (i.e., not so rigidly-timed) leaves for career development; paying part-time faculty based on their educational level rather than per course; allowing for varying levels of job security; allowing for job sharing among professors in the same school; allowing for sharing of faculty between institutions; allowing for more flexible time with regard to blocks for teaching and research; and unbundled pay options.

Ideally, faculty could, over the course of their careers, create potent and challenging assortments of professional and personal responsibilities to the extent that they become and remain excited about and engaged in their careers, and by life in general. The results could be better education for students, especially a higher degree of saliency of educational content based on real-world interaction and experience, more pertinent and involving research, and a higher degree of interaction between and among institutions, faculty, students, community, businesses, donors, and taxpayers.

REFERENCES

The full paper, to include references, is available upon request.
Implications of Service as an Emerging Factor in Retention, Tenure and Promotion Decisions

Tom Jordan
San Jose State University · San Jose, CA 95192-0055 · 408/924-7555

ABSTRACT

Service has long been recognized as a necessary but insufficient ingredient in the retention, tenure, and promotion process at most colleges and universities. The relative importance of service is growing with the emergence of the concept of the metropolitan university and new alliances and expectations among the university and its various publics. The service dimension may prove to be especially important for those with marketing and communications knowledge and skills. This paper cites some of the standard and more current thinking on service, then provides a service "how-to" guide, for those on the tenure track process.

HOW MUCH SERVICE IS ENOUGH?

The question of how much weight to give service relative to teaching and scholarship, the traditional three areas of consideration for retention, tenure, and promotion (RTP) is often posed and never finally answered. I will not answer it here, but hope to show that the importance of service is growing as expectations of the university change, and that those of us in the marketing and communications disciplines are well positioned to lead this growth and make it positive.

Centra (1979) notes that public and community service is infrequently recognized or rewarded. His survey of department heads found that only two percent considered public and community service a critical factor in evaluating faculty members. Stroup (1983) suggests that community service should include "offices held in academic, professional, and scholarly societies, public and governmental service/community service activities relevant to the faculty member's role at the university, and consulting activities."

Bowen and Schuster (1986) measured involvement in public service, as a percent of total faculty time, ranging from three to five percent: if one adds in institutional governance and service, with between 16 and 21 percent reported, the total for service related work rose to between 20 and 25 percent. They argued for a broader definition of service and said, "a new breed of professors has emerged who move easily between the academic world and business or government."

Melville (1991) talks of the emergence of the Metropolitan Grant University in which faculty is rewarded for locally focused research and "a real commitment to local service." This model is driving a reassessment and self evaluation process on my campus and at many large, urban campuses.

Dills, et al (1994), distinguish service from citizenship, calling citizenship: "what is expected of faculty members as their minimum contribution to the joint efforts of the academic unit so that it may continue to function. Citizenship, unlike service, does not necessarily require the application of substantial professional expertise or knowledge." When service is discussed, it is well to remember this distinction.

Braskamp and Ory (1994) trace the concept of service back to the Morrill Acts of 1862 and 1890. Among other definitions, they cite the Schomberg and Farmer definition of public service as "a set of activities utilizing faculty expertise to solve societal problems or to help others to do so, intended to benefit the public and contribute to the welfare of society." They make a good case for the practical application of knowledge being, in itself, good scholarship. In particular, cite "professors in professional disciplines" as more likely to engage in this type of scholarly work than are professors in humanities and sciences. It is my belief that those of us with marketing and communications knowledge and skills, because of what we have to offer in the applied sciences, are in a better position to provide service to our universities and our communities and that, consequently, the service may have more meaning when it is considered for retention, tenure and promotion.

My university's policy covers service under professional achievements and says: "Professional achievements include, but are not limited to, active participation or leadership in professional associations, meetings, panels, activities or workshops; patented inventions or discoveries; consulting; service on editorial boards or as editor of a professional journal or newsletter; adjudicator, or translator or reviewer for publishers, or other agencies and associations; public lectures; honors and awards."
In general, professional achievement consists in (sic) active participation or leadership in the CSU or in professional associations related to a faculty member’s discipline. Service to other associations and to the community, state, nation, or international community in a capacity related to the faculty member’s discipline and requiring the application of the faculty member’s professional knowledge or skills shall also be recognized as a professional contribution or achievement.” (ARTP Criteria, San Jose State University, 1994). This broad definition allows much interpretation, but it does specify that the faculty member must apply professional knowledge or skills. That is, just being on a board carries no weight; using your skills and knowledge does. The policy goes on to state that these achievements (service) must be thoroughly evaluated by one’s disciplinary peers, within and/or outside one’s department, not merely enumerated.

The Department of Psychology at Florida State University also has an enlightened view of service, calling it “a responsibility that falls upon the shoulders of the professor by reason of his/her professional, academic, and state-employee’s identification.”

The department breaks service down to Department service, College service, University service, and professional service, to include both academic and public service. The department policy says that professors, by being appointed to public advisory groups, “serve in an advisory capacity governmental agencies and public and private social service agencies on state, national, and international levels. These service activities not only provide service to humanity, but bring prestige to the University.”

Indeed, those of us in marketing and communications are often ideally positioned to provide valuable knowledge in the service of our university or community. In practice today, consulting activities and the involvement of the local business community in special projects are already bridging some of these new alliances. In live case studies and internships, for example, we blur the lines between the purely academic and service to the community.

Live case studies benefit the sponsoring organizations, and the donations they make to our department benefit the department directly and the university indirectly by providing soft money for department programs. Students benefit enormously from the "real-world" experience, and it often leads to employment for top performers (Jordan, a, 1993).

Internships benefit the sponsoring organization and the students. The sponsor recognizes the student’s value by paying the tuition for the course, $450, and the internship may become employment for students who have applied themselves and impressed their sponsors (Jordan, b, 1993).

In his inaugural speech, Robert J. Caret, the newly installed president of San Jose State University said, “There will be an emphasis on teaching, on learning outcomes, on professional service to the community ... We will work with the local government to help solve the social and economic problems of the region. We will continue to be an engine of economic development, and we will enhance our role as catalysts for social change. We will be recognized as the resource we are, not because of what we say, but because of what we do. We will work with local communities to help them realize their dreams, which, by definition, are our dreams” (Caret, 1995).
Clearly, the course is set. At many urban and metropolitan universities, service seems likely to increase in importance as a factor for consideration in the RTP process. The balance of this paper is addressed to those faculty who are on the tenure track and are therefore accountable for service as well as teaching and scholarship. It also addresses any interested faculty in the California State University system. All the new rules have not yet been written, but with the new contract it appears we will be in direct competition with all other faculty members for pay increases. Service may loom large as a criterion in the new schema.

GEETING STARTED

First, a caution for those on the tenure track—don't ever believe that service will replace scholarship or teaching. New paradigms may evolve in which service, particularly service to the community, dominates, but it remains a solid support player in today's faculty evaluation criteria. In other words, probationary faculty members should continue to concentrate teaching and scholarship as the primary reason they will be evaluated.

I will leave to others the task of defining service and differentiating it from citizenship and consulting. In my experience, the lines are blurry and evaluation committees will consider each case individually, weighing outstanding service in some cases more heavily than others. In the absence of clear cut and agreed upon criteria and definitions (and I believe we will never have a definition that will apply universally), it is imperative that each Department or other decision-making unit, whether it is a College, School, or University, make its best attempt to clarify local policy for the benefit of the tenure track faculty, and for those evaluating them. It is critical, for instance, that Department and University-Level definitions and criteria be consistent, so that faculty do not conduct themselves on the assumption that their activities will be considered strongly only to find out that these activities carry little importance at higher levels in the evaluation process.

Inconsistent application of existing policies sends up a warning flag to the attentive probationary track faculty member, compared to evaluation of service, evaluations of teaching and scholarship are relatively straightforward and consistent. Given the inconsistencies we have all seen in these areas, it is no wonder that people are leery of committing too much time and effort to service. A department may value and reward on-campus service, whereas the school, college, or university levels are looking for, and reinforcing, community service.

A clear signal from the top, such as President Carey's statement, goes a long way toward bringing not only direction but consistency to the process. But even in the absence of such clarity, all the signs point toward the increasing importance of service—to the university, but especially to the community, for those of us in public universities.

WHERE TO SERVE

The dictum to think globally but act locally is a wise one. Good citizenship/service begins in the department. Showing up is the starting point. With all its flaws, the RTP process still seems to recognize that the Department level, with the candidate's day-to-day colleagues, has the most say. At my university, as at most others today, we have significantly fewer faculty doing all the same work we did five years ago, and it's imperative that each of us contribute, or those who do the work must also bear the burden for those who don't. People on the tenure track should make it their business to attend all meetings and serve on at least one Department committee. That is serve, not merely attend. Ideally, the junior faculty member will assume a leadership role in a department activity or function; at the minimum, active participation and a substantive contribution are expected.

The question posed in the RTP committees is: "should we choose as a colleague for the next 20 or so years a person who has not shown any inclination to pitch in a help out with the work we all share?"

In conjunction with a senior faculty mentor, each probationary track faculty member should plan a course of service over the five or six years leading to tenure, a course that will, naturally, continue after tenure is granted. That course should have a base of service in the Department, but include service to the School, College, and University. At whatever level, make the service meaningful. Committee membership without contribution carries little if any weight with any RTP committee I have served on.

At the College and University committees level, the work of the committee may be less familiar, but there is often a greater opportunity to contribute based on knowledge and skills you bring to the table. Most of us in the marketing disciplines have a solid grasp of applied research or planning or communications that will augment the knowledge and skills that our colleagues from other Colleges bring with them.

Working with colleagues from around the campus broadens our horizons and provides the opportunity to get more involved in shared research projects, consulting, grant or proposal preparation, and other activities. Cross-disciplinary research and teaching
projects are almost always perceived as more prestigious than work done by an individual or by two people within the same academic unit.

Get Appointed

Being appointed to a committee on campus is easy—just ask. Try to choose a committee that’s a good fit for you, your skills and interests, and one on which you can make a meaningful contribution. Service at these levels is expected; you can make that service significant by assuming a leadership role.

Get Elected

Run for your Academic Senate. As an Academic Senator you will play a role in the governance of the University, a clear message that you understand the concept of service and are willing to do more than your share. At the Senate you will come to understand how the business of the university is conducted—the role of faculty, administration, and support services. You will establish a set of contacts throughout your campus, resources for you to call on as you become a resource for them. I recommend the experience, though it is not for everyone.

Get Involved

I was asked by my College Curriculum Committee to make a presentation on how to get involved in service to the community, (that presentation grew into this paper). In my final dossier for tenure I had evaluative letters and commendations from three mayors, two county supervisors, and five or six city council members. I had completed a grant for the state, with a colleague from Environmental Science, which resulted in publication of a brochure. More important to me, personally, were the evaluative letters from board members at a local recovery house where I had helped with research and publications that were sorely needed. I do not recommend this level of involvement for everyone—may not for anyone—but the possibilities are there if you choose to avail yourself of them.

Join

Join the Western Marketing Educator’s Association (WMEA), or other academic associations. Again, just joining is not enough. You have to be active, reviewing papers, writing papers, participating on panels, and doing some of the work it takes to make an organization worthwhile. This takes on meaning if you become an officer of the organization. I also recommend industry groups. My serving as the University liaison as a vice president of the Business Marketing Association has benefited me and my Department in University-wide and national industry-wide exposure.

Get in the Service Loop

Yes, it exists. Mine started when an acquaintance asked me to join the board of a recovery home for men just off-campus. Boards for non-profits can almost all benefit from the knowledge and skills any university professor, but especially a marketing professor, can bring to it. I was not naive. I knew that I was being asked because work had to be done, there was no money, and I had the skills to do it. In my continuing work on this board, I am regularly recruiting accountants, lawyers, construction experts, and anyone else with a skill we need and an urge to serve.

Because of this work (it showed up in my first year dossier as pro bono consulting), and my expertise in communication, my Dean asked me to help the Mayor of our university’s city (almost a million people) with a communication program targeting at-risk teenagers with alcohol and drug avoidance messages. This led to my appointment to the University President’s special advisory committee on drug and alcohol abuse.

Two years later, my service on that task force was instrumental in my appointment to a county advisory commission on alcohol and drug prevention.

Three years later, it also led to a paid consulting job with my former Dean in her new position as Chancellor of a Community College District. This is not to say that the motive for doing pro bono community service is that it will or even that it may lead to paid consulting, but the possibility is there. The point is that being involved in the community and being visible will open up many opportunities that might otherwise not have appeared.

Get a Grant

I got on my university foundation’s grant list, wrote a proposal, and received a grant to research, document and publicize the state’s efforts in environmental mitigation. The grant was lucrative for me, and my university made 25% off the top. Contributions like this, always valuable, are becoming even more important as state funding diminishes.

Get Re-appointed

Because I plan to live where I am for a long time, I went to my city (population 100,000) council and volunteered to serve on a commission. An appointment made by the council. I was named to the Cultural Advisory (Arts) Commission and served for
four years. When I left, my position as chair was taken
over by the Chair of the Art Department at another
local University (and now friend). I moved on to
become a Trustee for the City Library and currently
serve as Secretary on that Board.

As a result of my work and visibility with my own city's
council, I was asked by our mayor to help her publicize
the national convention of the White House
Conference on Learning and Information Systems
Technology (WHCLIST) that she had managed to
bring to town. I did, happily.

As I went through this busy time of service, I did not
really plan any of these fortuitous coincidences. But I
was involved and most of all willing. I don't
recommend service to anyone who is not
predispoused to it. I feel like I want to make a
difference and service to the community allows me to
do that (or at least gives me the illusion of doing that).

If the concept of service is calculated merely to show
up in a dossier, I would recommend a concentration
on research or scholarship, and confine service to on-
campus committees. That is, don't do service if you're
doing it reluctantly.

Many academics will doubtless continue to prefer the
relative seclusion of the campus community, the
pursuit of scholarship and teaching. But as public
university support is re-examined, many would like to
see more accountability from the universities, more
visibility in the community, and stronger connections
among all the complex interest groups and individuals
who contribute to and benefit from a metropolitan
university.

For those of us who enjoy this interaction, a new path
is being created. Each university must establish its
own criteria for service, then be certain that those who
choose to do a lot of service are recognized and
rewarded consistent with their expectations. Even at
metropolitan universities, with good direction and
encouragement from the President, it will be difficult.
At smaller, more isolated campuses, the service
model may not be appropriate.

Where it is appropriate, and it is implemented
consistently, it presents the possibility that all parties
win.

The individual wins. When faculty contribute to their
universities, and their communities, they enrich
themselves with personal contact and a sense of
accomplishment even beyond their teaching and
scholarship.

The university wins. As faculty become involved with
the communities both on and off campus, the bonds
that are formed are powerful and make solutions to all
common problems more achievable. Just as the
university asks faculty to be good citizens of the
university, the university itself must be a good citizen
in its community.

The community wins. The wealth of knowledge and
talent available among the faculty at any university is
staggering. A wag once said that the reason
Washington D.C. is in such a mess is that all the
people with all the answers are busy teaching at the
universities. Maybe it's time for a few of us to spend
some time applying our know-how to problems or
needs in our communities, our state capitols, or—why
not—Washington D.C.

~ ~ ~

REFERENCES

Anonymous, "Promotion, Tenure, and Third-Year Review
Guidelines for Tenure-Track Faculty," Florida State
University, Department of Psychology (Revised
1/10/95).

Anonymous, "Appointment, Retention, Tenure, and
Promotion Criteria, Standards, and Procedures for
Regular Faculty Employees," San Jose State
University Policy 94-6, 1994.

Bowen, Howard R. and Jack H. Schuster, American
Professors, a National Resource Imperiled, Oxford

Braskamp, Larry A., and John C. Ory, Assessing Faculty
Work, Enhancing Individual and Institutional

Caret, Robert L. President, San Jose State University,
Inaugural Address October 6, 1995.

Centra, John A. Determining Faculty Effectiveness.

Dills, David A., Lawrence J. Haber, and Donna Bialik,
Assessing What Professors Do: An Introduction to
Academic Performance Appraisal in Higher

Jordan, Tom, (a) "A Perennially Successful Live Case
Project," Proceedings, Western Marketing Educator's
(WMEE) Conference, April, 1993.

Jordan, Tom, (b) "An Exemplary Internship Program."

Miller, Richard I. (1987) Evaluating Faculty for Promotion

Plater, William B., "Future Work: Faculty Time in the 21st

Melville, John "Charting the Future of the Constrained
Metropolitan University" Metropolitan Universities

Stroup, Kala M. "Faculty Evaluation: Issues in Faculty
Personnel Policies." Jon W. Fuller, Ed., New Directions
for Higher Education Series, No. 41 Volume XI,
number 1. 1983.
ABSTRACT

There has been some interest in applying SERVQUAL to the assessment of satisfaction among university students, as part of Total Quality Management efforts in academia. This exploratory study used focus groups to examine the meanings business students derive from selected dimensions of the SERVQUAL instrument. Focus group interviews substantially improved the understanding of SERVQUAL responses and provided useful information for improving the quality of student educational experiences.

INTRODUCTION

The issue of student satisfaction has become increasingly important as universities strive for accountability. This concern is partly the result of the increasingly competitive environment that universities are experiencing. It is also the result of an emerging recognition of the links between student satisfaction and post-purchase behaviors, such as complaining, recommending the institution to relatives, friends, and business colleagues, and providing donations to the university (Kotler and Fox 1995). The application of consumer satisfaction research to the services provided by a university not only has the potential of benefiting current students but can augment the efforts of the institution to market itself and obtain competitive advantage.

A very popular instrument for studying satisfaction has been the SERVQUAL instrument originated by Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry (1985, 1988). The instrument in its original form employed two companion 22-item scales measuring expectations and performance. The gaps between the service the consumer thinks they have obtained and the consumer’s expectations for that service define the level of service quality received. Although heavily criticized in recent years (for example, Brown and Swartz 1989; Cronin and Taylor 1992), SERVQUAL has been used extensively to study satisfaction in services industries such as health care (Babakus and Mangold 1989), financial services (Bojanic 1991), and retail stores (Finn and Lamb 1991).

Carman (1990) applied SERVQUAL in four settings, a hospital, a dental school clinic, a business school placement center, and a tire store, and found stability of the SERVQUAL dimensions across industries was impressive. However, the study indicated that services that involve multiple functions, may need separate administrations for each function. Recent modifications of the instrument attempt to remove the problems associated with gap analysis and allow for a consumer “zone of tolerance,” representing the range that a consumer considers satisfactory (Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry 1994).

Surprisingly, there have been few applications of SERVQUAL to the assessment of educational quality. In fact our literature survey showed only one attempt to adapt the questionnaire for studying marketing education (Ford, Joseph, and Joseph 1993). The study, which examined the quality assessments of education among American and New Zealand students, found that there were relatively few differences between the two samples in ratings. The differences that did exist were primarily in the importance placed on various dimensions by the respondents, with New Zealanders placing more importance on reliability and less on empathy and the tangible aspects of the service than Americans. Despite these differences, the relative similarity between the samples suggested that students in different environments have many common requirements upon which they base judgments of service quality.

Although there are other legitimate ways of looking at students (as products, for example), in this paper we assumed students to be the consumers of a service and that the faculty to be front-line service providers. This assumption underlies the process of student evaluation of faculty and provides a basis for applications of SERVQUAL to studying student satisfaction. We also believed that information obtained from the questionnaire would have limitations in application. While it is interesting to know about student expectations and performance evaluations, difference scores tell us little about how gaps between the two might be narrowed. The answers to this question involve ferreting out the behaviors that students associate with each SERVQUAL dimension. Therefore, this
exploratory study attempted to delineate students' understandings of a selected set of SERVQUAL items. The purpose of the project was to determine how much focus group interviews could enrich student information obtained through SERVQUAL. The final aim was to develop some specific recommendations for improving ratings of service quality in our institution.

METHODOLOGY

Sample
The sample of students participating in the focus groups (n = 22) was drawn from a population of students who had previously completed a SERVQUAL questionnaire adapted for use in a College of Business (N = 736). Student focus group participants were members of sophomore, junior, senior and graduate classes representing an array of business concentrations including marketing. They were selected to be representative of their class. That is, there was no attempt to select students from any particular ability group although there was an attempt to obtain equal gender representation in the groups. Target focus group size was 6-8 persons per group. Actual groups ranged from 2 to 10 members. The smallest group represented the senior level course, the largest group represented graduate students. The other groups contained equal numbers of students (5 per group).

Instrumentation and Procedures
The primary methodology employed in the study was focus group interviewing (Krueger 1994). All of the students in the focus groups had previously participated in a student survey that incorporated an adapted SERVQUAL questionnaire (Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry 1988), presented in the original format with corresponding sets of items asking about expectations and performance. Time limitations on focus group discussions made it impossible to investigate all items, so specific items were selected from each of the SERVQUAL factors. The factors were: Tangibles (physical facilities, equipment and the appearance of personnel), Reliability (dependability and accuracy of service performance), Responsiveness (promptness and willingness to help), Assurance (employee courtesy, knowledge, and ability to inspire trust), and Empathy (individual attention and caring). Items were chosen on the basis of large computed discrepancies between expectations and actual performance relative to other items loading on each particular factor. All focus groups were conducted in a conference room by a moderator and two assistants. In order to facilitate the interview and help ensure uniformity between focus groups, a written interview schedule containing meaning probes and a question about how gaps might be narrowed was constructed for the moderator's use. Each interview began with introductions, discussion of the roles of the moderator and assistants, and presentation of instructions. After the warm-up question about reasons for coming to the College, students were read a SERVQUAL statement, asked to give a rating of the College's performance in that area on a standard Likert scale, and asked what the statement meant to them. Student responses were written on a flip chart, visible to all of the interviewees. Students were asked to respond one at a time so that their comments could be recorded. The closing question focused on which of the previously discussed issues was most important. Each focus group interview lasted approximately one hour and a quarter. All of the interviews were audiotaped.

Following the interviews, typed transcripts were created from the audiotapes, from the flip chart record, and from other notes. Content analysis of these records was conducted by reviewing the transcripts, one category at a time, and developing emerging themes from the focus group discussions. Issues in the analysis were the content of the responses, the consistency within the group, the frequency and extent of the comments, the specificity of the comments, and intensity or depth of feeling.

RESULTS

The focus group interviews produced a large amount of qualitative information. Sample results of the content analysis of this information are presented by SERVQUAL factor. Illustrative quotes are included to exemplify the kinds of data produced by the focus groups and portray areas where colleges might focus when attempting to improve student perceptions of educational quality.

Reliability
The Reliability question ("when faculty and staff promise to do something by a certain time, they do so") generated three behavioral themes: keeping promises, prevention of hassles, and an accuracy/help theme. Keeping promises was linked with professionalism by students. It tended to be construed as the faculty member consistently
handing back assignments and tests on time and being available office hours. an issue about which students spoke at length and with much feeling. A particularly thorny issue, from the student point of view, was faculty over-promising and under-delivering.

"... they [faculty] expect the student to hand things back on time, and the student should expect the professor to hand things back on time."

"I guess my biggest problem is when they say a certain date that they're gonna have it done and they don't."

"On that note, I've had teachers miss an appointment all together and just say, 'oh, I forgot.' So it's like I sit there for 45 minutes, and then they don't come. Okay, I could have been doing something else with my time."

Some promisses were viewed as particularly important by students. This feeling especially applied to faculty provision of feedback on projects where the evaluation might help the student get a better grade on a subsequent project.

"I still have one part of a project to do for an accounting class. . . . I am not going to get [feedback] till Wednesday, which is after I turn my final project in. So I feel there should have been more thought going into this."

The "preventing hassles" aspect of reliability was illustrated by concerns with the smoothness with which exchange programs with other universities ran. A program was viewed as reliable if the student received paper work promptly and had enough information about important areas (in this case, housing and course work) to feel secure. The "accuracy/help" dimension was connected to trust in advising. Trust in advising meant not only providing accurate information to students but being willing to "go a second mile" for students. For example:

"I was in an accident recently and I called him [advisor] and he took care of everything."

Responsiveness
The responsiveness item was: "faculty and staff are always willing to help students." Student statements in response to this item reflected the feeling that helpfulness was a general attitude on the part of faculty. Six specific areas were discussed: assistance with scheduling and program development, testing, office hours, additional faculty assistance in courses, career guidance, and creating conditions for the student to excel. In general, students felt that faculty and staff should be available, convey the impression that they want to help, and avoid creating conditions that inadvertently penalize the students. Statements illustrating testing and assistance areas include the following.

"... Write the test based on what they taught us. Do things from homework; that's what homework is about."

"I guess I've run into [situations] where I've had a whole lot of questions. . . . like it seems to take up too much of their time. Even if there isn't someone waiting [during scheduled office hours], I felt like I was being rushed through because they have something else they needed to do."

"It's like being receptive. Little subtleties [show] you are more receptive."

Focus group discussions also indicated that student concerns about responsiveness differed with level of instruction, possibly reflecting the needs of students at different points in their programs. This was particularly true in the area of career guidance which graduating seniors and MBAs, more than sophomores and juniors, tended to associate with helpfulness.

Empathy
The empathy item (giving students individual attention) generated three themes: personal contact within the classroom and during office hours, general attitudes toward students, and provision of information about faculty. Behaviors associated with the first theme were accommodating the student by expanding office hours, knowing individual student's names, taking situational factors into account when dealing with students, and spending time with students. Concerns about faculty attitude involved more general statements succinctly summed by one MBA student:

"Just have them treat us as customers, not nuisances."

Empathy tended to blend in students' minds with responsiveness in that a primary indicator of "individual attention" was the time the instructor was willing to spend with the student and doing
things for the student. Undergraduate students tended to view this issue of over-all faculty attitude as the most important factor determining their satisfaction with the program.

"I think state of mind, because under [the right] state of mind all those other things fall into place."

Assurance
The assurance item, "faculty and staff of the College of Business get adequate support to do their job," was the least well understood of the items. Of the emerging themes, the most prevalent response was one of no understanding. When pressed, some students thought perhaps it might mean emotional support from other faculty members which they did not feel qualified to assess. Also mentioned (by MBAs only) were financial support, being able to obtain a GTA or grading assistant, computer and technical support, and an administration that backs up the faculty. Undergraduate students tended to alter the question in their minds to mean support for the student. One student gave a professor's response to a student request as an example of lack of support:

"I can't do this. I have to publish."

Coordination of assignments between classes was another issue that students thought was important. However, their primary concern involved meeting student needs rather than faculty and staff needs.

"Coordination of assignments is one element in that. When a professor gives an assignment, he should confer with other professors [to see] if this is overloading the students."

Tangibles
When students thought of up-to-date equipment, the principle equipment that they considered was the computer. Computer issues included the quality and modernity of the physical equipment, the quality of the software, and the abilities of the support staff. Dissatisfaction responses centered mostly on the support staff (insufficient numbers and training) and laboratory facilities (especially crowding at certain times during the term).

"I was doing a project for one of my classes and one of these guys, I asked him to do something and he did something entirely different. [He] lost the whole thing and my disk got all messed up because he just started hitting this button a million times."

"I feel the computer lab is really excellent, but it's very frustrating... it's impossible to find a seat down there."

Undergraduate students were often unable to differentiate between equipment and the physical facilities and their maintenance. The latter issues were of special concern for graduate students because they reflected on the image of professionalism presented by the program.

"When I think of a business building, think of something that looks really nice... the perception of the rooms kinda takes away from the prestige of the program."

DISCUSSION
Focus group discussions added to our understanding of the meaning our students assigned to the SERVQUAL items and provided information about specific characteristics and behaviors driving performance ratings. In particular, the tendency for dimensions to blur into concerns about the general attitude toward students has implications for improving process aspects of our services. Specifically, it suggests (consistent with Kotler and Fox 1995) that interventions should involve attention to faculty attitudes and awareness of the importance that students place on faculty/student interactions. Further, the study suggests ways to improve students' perceptions of reliability, responsiveness and helpfulness through organizational modifications.

The focus groups also showed that not all discrepancy scores were equally reliable. For instance, the Assurance item (about support of faculty) was not well understood by students, even though it was rated during the survey just as better understood statements were. The result of this interpretation failure must be that the performance/expectation gap score contains a larger amount of error than gap scores for other items. As has been noted in the past (Peter, Churchill, and Brown 1993), reliability is a major potential problem for the use of difference scores. Without follow-up interviews the tendency might be to view all scores as equally informational.

The numbers of students involved in the focus groups described in our study were small. This may be considered a major limitation in drawing generalizations from our findings. Certainly, the
specific conditions driving discrepancies between expectations and performance could be limited to the specific institution studied, although we suspect that some are fairly generalizable to other institutions. However, the research does suggest that using SERVQUAL, and probably other surveys alone, is risky business. We propose that, where possible, such measures of satisfaction with educational experiences be supplemented with some other methodology. The focus group methodology used in this small study could be successfully employed to this end by other institutions.

REFERENCES


Values and Ethical Principles of Portuguese, Armenian, and American MBA Students: 
A Comparative Analysis

Harold H. Kassarjian and Traute M. Kassarjian, Department of Marketing
California State University, Northridge 91330-8245; (818) 885-4637; Hal.Kassarjian@csun.edu

ABSTRACT

In this paper we empirically compare the ethical standards of MBA students in three countries: Portugal, Armenia, and USA. Data collected from businessmen in the earlier study are presented for some additional comparisons. It must be emphasized that this work is a study of ethical standards and not actual behavior of individuals.

INTRODUCTION

Ethical and moral standards are defined as deep-seated, enduring values learned over a lifetime and carried forward from generation to generation. As pointed out by Clark (1965, 1966) the historical roots of the American ethical and value systems go back to the pioneering spirit of the American west and before it the pioneering spirit of the early colonists. The colonists brought with them the Protestant ethic, which in many ways became the American ethic. The more recent immigrants, eastern and southern Europeans, the Hispanics, the Catholics and Jews were to bring somewhat different sets of values and moral standards, and they too melted into the dominant culture adding their bit of color and considerable flavor.

The business ethic from a Protestant point of view can perhaps best be seen in the writings of Max Weber (1904, as presented in Clark 1966). The highest value is the pursuit of profit within the limits of the law, and within the limits of personal honesty and integrity.

In our study we expected that American business persons and American students in training to become business people would demonstrate more characteristics of this sort than would such an individual from another cultural setting, in this case Portuguese or Armenian students. We expected from the Portuguese more emphasis on Catholic values. Unlike the individualistic nature of the Protestant ethic, we expected emphasis on the social nature of man - equality, the basic rights of others, justice and fairness. For example a fair and just price, and not only to labor, but to the producer, the middleman and the consumer alike (Clark 1965). This sort of "interpersonal consciousness" is a view to be found in the stereotypical Catholic and Jew alike. We felt Portuguese MBA students would reflect this catholic view much more than would American MBA students.

The third group in the study were Armenian MBA students in at the American University of Armenia in Yerevan, Armenia. Here we see a newly emerging interest in the free market. For centuries Armenians had been under Ottoman Empire rule and then for 75 years under Soviet regimes. We expected survival to be a dominant theme in the Armenian value system. Values, personal ethics and integrity, we felt, would be heavily imbued with protection of the self, the family, the Orthodox religion, and the "race" - the need to survive. Under Soviet rule, much too often, societal needs and social responsibility was relegated to the government: "let the government do it." Hence we expected that Armenian students would score lower than Portuguese students on measures of social responsibility. We made no prediction on the variable of personal integrity and pursuit of profit. On one hand individual gain and pursuit of profit are not exactly Soviet values, while on the other hand, survival often meant an entrepreneurial skill and ability to bend or work around the rules of the governing authorities.

Hence three groups of MBA students were compared. All three were in American style MBA programs, about the same age and social status.

* These data were collected while the first author was a visiting professor at the Universidade Catolica Portuguesa in Lisbon in 1992; and at the American University of Armenia in Yerevan in 1994. Appreciation is expressed to Naira S. Haroutunian, research assistant, at the American University for much of the clerical work and data collection in Armenia. Special thanks to our previous co-author, Barbara E. Kahn at the Wharton School for her contributions and to Ronald E. Godstein and Jai Sengupta for their criticisms of an earlier draft.
METHODOLOGY

Thirty years ago, a scale was developed at UCLA by Father John Clark, a Jesuit scholar completing his doctorate in management, that purported to measure these sorts of variables. The scales appeared to be valid and reliable and easily understood by subjects. (See Clark and the more recent studies using the scale in the references.)

Clark developed a set of vignettes or incidents - abbreviated cases - as his instrument. Example of the five-point (strongly approve to strongly disapprove) vignette is:

#4. James Sherman sells used cars for Harrison Auto Company. Although he feels that the cars he sells are reasonably priced for the market, in his sales talk he is forced to match the extravagant claims and tactics of his competitors. The company engages in such practices as setting back speedometers, superficially hiding major defects, and putting pressure on prospects to close a deal on their first visit. Sherman knows that the company could not survive without such practices, yet he personally feels repugnance toward them. Nevertheless he follows these practices.

The final scale consisted of 26 such vignettes. From this set Clark distilled two ethics sub-scales.

The Personal Ethics Sub-Scale (PES)

This scale consists of the first eleven vignettes evaluating the respondents' commitment to the ideal that ethical responsibilities are coexistent with the *rules of the game* of competition. Such a person has a firm commitment to personal integrity and honesty, even at the cost of personal gain. He or she is further determined to obey all the laws which govern the conduct of business, regardless of personal conviction as to the usefulness of the law. Nevertheless, when this has been done, s/he considers her ethical responsibilities fulfilled. Beyond these commitments he or she is free to conduct business as he pleases, without acting unethically.

The Social Responsibility Scale (SRS)

This scale, consisting of the first item and items 12-17, measures the degree to which an individual considers himself ethically responsible for the social effects of business decisions: the effect of decisions on the welfare of others. According to Clark, the ethics involve responsibilities beyond the interest of the stockholder, and considers how business decisions affect employees, customers, suppliers, and the community in which these business persons operate.

The remaining nine items in the 26 item scale are a miscellaneous set that do not seem to fit on either scale but have been left in the instrument. We collected data on all 26 items.

Subjects

The American subjects consisted of 51 first year MBA students in introductory core courses at UCLA. Demographically they represented the typical University of California graduate student in business - median age under 35, 33% female, mostly but by no means entirely Protestant. The Portuguese subjects consisted of 32 MBA students at the Catholic University of Portugal in Lisbon. Again the age was primarily under 35, 80% male, and 97% Catholic. The Armenian respondents consisted of 54 MBA students - almost the entire first year class and a few second year students at the American University of Armenia in Yerevan. Most were under 35 years of age, 60% male, and mostly Armenian Orthodox. Greater details on the demographic characteristics of the samples can be found in Appendix A (omitted due to space limitations. Available at the conference or by contacting the author.) Both the Portuguese and the Armenian degree programs are almost identical with the programs found at major American universities.

In addition to these data, we also present in this paper some of the results from a sample of 76 business executives from our previous study (Kassarjian, Kassarjian, & Kahn, 1990). Those subjects were attending a one year executive program class at UCLA. They were considerably older, mostly Protestant, mostly male.

RESULTS

The PES Scale

Recall that this scale measures a firm commitment to personal integrity and honesty above personal gain and personal profit. Beyond that, one's ethical
responsibility is to remember that the business of business is profit. Henry Ford fits this category well: "The worst sin I can commit as a businessman is to fail to seek maximum long-term profitability by all decent and lawful means."

The mean scores for the PES scale are presented in Table 1, as is the average score for the 11 items (based on a 5 point scale). A higher score represents the more ethical or more idealistic position.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean of Item Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Americans</td>
<td>46.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>37.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenians</td>
<td>37.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Execs</td>
<td>46.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

We had expected that American MBA students would score higher on this scale than either Portuguese or Armenian students - the individualistic point of view rather that a group oriented view of responsibility beyond profit. This scale is close to the Protestant ideal as expressed by Weber, and in fact the American students did score significantly higher than either the Portuguese or the Armenians.

Further, we had expected that American students, supposedly one of the most idealistic segments of our society, would score higher that business persons and business executives who must live with ethical dilemmas in the real world of competition. Students and executives scored equally high on this scale - those differences are not significant (using either parametric or non-parametric statistics). It is interesting to compare these results with those of Clark a quarter century earlier on a group of very similar business executives. His group of businessmen had a mean score of 43.3, quite a bit lower than the 46.4 of today's executives. (Although statistical tests of significance were not possible since the raw data from 30 years ago were not available, the difference is undoubtedly significant.) Apparently modern executives feel a stronger responsibility to stockholders and the profit motive than executives did in the early 1960's.

### The SRS Scale

This scale purports to measure one's ethical responsibility for the social order, the sacrifice of personal gain for social goals. It is a responsibility beyond that to the stockholder with an ideal that considers how an action affects employees, the community, and the society. We had hypothesized that these sorts of social values are closer to Catholic ideals than the Protestant view, and hence the Portuguese would score higher than Americans. We felt that the Armenians would score lower than either the Americans or the Portuguese. We expected a value system in which social welfare and social responsibility is the business of the government and not the individual citizen in the society. The overall differences were not significant (either on a t-test or a chi square test.) Table 2 presents these results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean of Item Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Americans</td>
<td>19.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portuguese</td>
<td>18.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armenians</td>
<td>20.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Execs</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Portuguese sample did not score higher on social responsibility as we had hypothesized, in fact, if anything, their scores are a bit lower. We had expected that the need to survive and putting the individual and family first among Armenians would lead to lower scores among Armenians. Again, we were wrong. The data indicated, if anything, the opposite result. The Armenians scored higher on this scale, although the differences are not dramatic. Perhaps the need to survive is seen as being best served by socially responsible and interpersonally cooperative behavior within the society.

In general our subjects seem notably less willing to accept the values of the social-responsibility scale than those of the business-ethics scale. Overall, our respondents scored higher on the Personal
Ethics Scale than on the Social Responsibility Scale. The mean of the item means on the PES scale are above the neutral point of 3.0 while on the Social Responsibility Scale the mean of the item means is below 3.0. This implies that perhaps something in the order of half of the respondents displayed negative attitudes towards the values represented in the questionnaire. As Clark also pointed out for his data, these subjects - Armenian, Portuguese and Americans - show a greater reluctance to sacrifice personal gain for social goals than they do for the well-recognized principles of honesty and integrity. This does not imply irresponsibility on their part. Rather, it may simply point to the fact that they tend to agree with Henry Ford that failing to seek maximum long term profitability is to subvert economic reason. Our subjects seem to agree with this position, one which sees businessmen as best serving the community interests by devoting themselves to performing their economic function in the most efficient way possible.

On both scales there is a wide divergence in responses of individuals to the various items, that is, a large variance. With such a wide divergence, it becomes all the more difficult to call one behavior pattern as within the bounds of accepted ethical standards and some other action as unethical.

**Item Analysis**

Analysis of the individual items leads to some interesting differences between the groups. The data are presented in Appendix B (available from the author). For example, Armenians seem more willing to use "insider information" for personal gain than do the Americans or the Portuguese. Of course, it is true that such behavior is considered illegal in the US and most likely not in Armenia. Portuguese are more willing to pirate a competitors employees in order to learn trade secrets than are Armenians or Americans, while Americans are far more willing to improve profits by discharging older, more experienced employees who are more highly paid than are Armenians or Portuguese.

Other differences involve such issues as price fixing (Americans find such behavior as more unethical), bribery (Armenians and Portuguese find this to be less unethical than Americans) and following a superior's unethical orders (Americans appear to be less willing to do so).

In addition, as was done in previous studies, we asked our subjects how business ethics could be improved. Omitted due to space limitations, results are available from the author. Differences between the four groups were minor.

What seems to emerge in this study is not that groups differed from each other as hypothesized, but rather how amazingly similar these subjects from diverse cultural backgrounds seem to be. Perhaps, it can be explained by the fact the Protestant-leaning Americans, Catholic Portuguese and Orthodox Armenians are really not all that different in the core values of their societies. Since all three groups have emerged from Judeo-Christian Indo-European roots what we may be seeing is that ethical principles and standards are indeed long lasting values that reach back to the basic beliefs about appropriate behavior, be it business or social relationships. Perhaps if we had studied Moslems or other non-Judeo-Christian peoples or non-Indo-European societies our results would have been different.

**REFERENCES**


THE INFLUENCE OF CULTURAL ATTRIBUTES ON ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE

David Lohmann, Hawaii Pacific University
1188 Fort Street, Honolulu, Hawaii 96813 (800-544-0298)

ABSTRACT
The influence of cultural attributes on academic performance was assessed for 386 students within a multicultural student body. Significant differences were found in the relationships between cultural attributes and academic performance. Performance in case oriented classes was compared to performance in non-case oriented classes among national groups. Comparisons were also made between performance on complex cases and performance on both more comprehensive tasks and simpler ones. Cultural attributes were found to be significantly related to performance, although the effect is small compared to other student attributes and to attitudes. Questions are raised concerning teaching methods and use of the case method in light of these findings.

INTRODUCTION
Greater consideration is being given to the transcultural nature of business education (Light 1993). There is more international movement of students, and greater numbers of cooperative relationships among international business schools. More students are now studying outside their native culture. With the increasing internationalization of business, business schools and the student bodies of these business schools, educators face the challenge of reexamining pedagogical techniques to determine if they are adequate to the international challenge.

BACKGROUND
The student studying abroad faces unique challenges. These can include language barriers and unfamiliarity with the higher education practices of the new country such as classroom participation and frequent tests (Selvadurai 1991-1992). Research has shown the relationship among demographic variables and performance (Hanson and Swann 1993), and that high-performance minority students favor certain learning techniques (Kerr 1992). Nagasawa and Espinosa report that Asian Americans behave in distinctively different ways as college students, which may enhance their academic success (1992). Students also vary in what they believe learning to be. Some hold that learning is the accumulation of facts; these wish for simple, unambiguous knowledge. Others stress understanding. Students also believe that learning is accomplished in different ways.

According to Schommer, these differing perceptions are influenced by family structure, rule conformity and encouragement toward independence (1993). All of these vary as a function of culture.

Definition of Culture
Hofstede's definition of culture is used in this paper. In his work, culture is defined as the collective mental programming of a people in an environment (1984). By inference the definition includes the evidence of collective mental programming and consequences to include common behaviors, decision making methods, and criteria. Culture is persistent once learned and accepted. Culture influences the way a person sees and reacts to a particular situation. One can intuine that since marketing cases represent actual situations a student's culture will alter his or her approach to the case.

Culture also affects the way we communicate, our relations with others, our determination of right and wrong, and the determination of what is reasonable and unreasonable (Phatak 1995). For the student analyzing a case, what is right or intuitive in one culture may be wrong or contrary to common sense in another.

The challenges of a marketing case analysis may be new to the student formerly educated using the lecture and examination method. In the case method, the student is not asked to retain a specific set of facts. He or she is held responsible for analyses including problem identification, discovery of relationships, understanding and resolution of different perspectives, balancing non-quantitative and intangible factors with quantitative results, and development of a means to deal with complexity. The student is also expected to develop a healthy skepticism and a critical view toward analyses while being able to make decisions with incomplete information. Ultimately, the student should be able to draw generalizations from the case analysis experience and integrate these into an overall body of business knowledge and skills. The case method should, if successful as a pedagogical tool, foster the student's self-confidence in his or her decision making abilities in practical situations. These are skills not commonly fostered in lecture-examination systems. The qualification examinations of business students in school systems based upon British tradition are usually multiple choice or short answer. These examinations can be passed by memorization of readily available material.
(Gabriel 1988) (Ishak 1987). On the other hand, Asian students may have an advantage in complex case analysis. Hofstede and Bond contend that shared cultural values of greater collectivism and Confucian roots may give Asian societies advantages in complex and dynamic situations (1988). The potential problems for students crossing cultural boundaries could, therefore, include:

- Proficiency in the language of instruction.
- Unfamiliarity with linear methods of problem solving.
- Cultural constraints on participatory behavior in class.
- The ex cathedra problem, i.e., not challenging the instructor's suppositions and statements.
- Inability to understand the cultural milieu of the marketing case.
- Use of inappropriate criterion constructs for decision making based on one's own culture.

**METHODOLOGY**

A survey was administered to 386 upper division and graduate students at a multicultural American university. One hundred and nine were U.S. citizens (US). The 277 students of other nationalities (Int) in order of representation were: Hong Kong (62), Malaysia (48), Singapore (36), Taiwan (28), Indonesia (24), Japan (12), Thailand (12), Korea (8), and the Philippines (2). (The average entering TOEFL score was 569 and ranged from 450 to 900.) Genders were equally represented. The average age was 26 and the average work experience was 5.44 years. Two hundred and ninety-one of the respondents voluntarily provided student identification numbers which permitted linking of university registration background and academic performance to the attitudinal measures. The data were collected during the 1993–1994 academic year. Performance and background data were collected from other sources for the 291 students who voluntarily provided identification numbers. These performance data included in-class measures, to include performance on class participation, midterm examinations, final examination, large projects, computer projects, competitive simulations, large writing assignments (theses), minicases and regular cases from the Harvard Business School collection. Students were also assigned the cultural dimension scores, according to their nationality, from Hofstede’s four dimensions of culture. The scores used are shown in Table 1.

**RESULTS**

Scores on cultural variables, as defined by Hofstede, student attributes and student attitudes were correlated with four performance measures. These were official university grade point average on a scale of zero to four; class mark, which is the number of points accumulated in a semester from zero to one thousand; cases mark, which is the percentage of points earned on Harvard Business School written case analyses assignments; and minicases mark, which is the percentage of points earned on written case assignments for simple cases of less than 500 words in length. The minicases do not require critical and complex analysis skills. The results are shown in Table 2. University Grade Point Average was correlated with three of the four cultural dimensions, power distance, uncertainty avoidance and individualism. Only one of these, uncertainty avoidance, is correlated with class performance and case performance; and none are correlated with performance on the relatively simple task of minicase analysis. This may be because students with low uncertainty avoidance may be greater risk takers, less bound by convention, and more confident of their ability to master the complexity of the case.

Two self-reported measures, confidence in the student’s mastery of the course material and level of comprehension of course lectures, were also evaluated. Self-evaluated level of comprehension was positively related to complex performance. Self-evaluated mastery of course material was positively related to case analysis, both complex and simple.

The countries in the sample population with low uncertainty avoidance scores (Singapore, Hong Kong, Malaysia) have had a tradition of English language instruction and ones with high uncertainty scores (Japan and Taiwan) have not. Because of this bias, the correlation analysis was rerun controlling for TOEFL scores, with the results shown in Table 3.

---

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PD</th>
<th>UA</th>
<th>IDV</th>
<th>MAS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(K)</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(I)</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(J)</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(M)</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(S)</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T)</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(H)</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(U)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PD - Power distance (equality of power distribution)
US - Uncertainty avoidance (threatened by uncertain situation)
IDV - Individualism
MAS - Masculinity (assertiveness, gender roles)

(Source: Hofstede, 1984)
### TABLE 2
PERFORMANCE CORRELATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Measures</th>
<th>PD</th>
<th>UA</th>
<th>MAS</th>
<th>IDV</th>
<th>INTL</th>
<th>TOEFL</th>
<th>Time in US</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Years of Work</th>
<th>Mastery</th>
<th>Lecture Understanding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade Point</td>
<td>-1.224</td>
<td>-1.327</td>
<td>-1.627</td>
<td>-1.221</td>
<td>2.945</td>
<td>1.667</td>
<td>0.3316</td>
<td>0.2697</td>
<td>-1.192</td>
<td>0.1836</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>(246)</td>
<td>(246)</td>
<td>(162)</td>
<td>(279)</td>
<td>(88)</td>
<td>(279)</td>
<td>(276)</td>
<td>(270)</td>
<td>(259)</td>
<td>(279)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Mark</td>
<td>-2.071</td>
<td>3.836</td>
<td>2.074</td>
<td>1.644</td>
<td>1.369</td>
<td>2.948</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(254)</td>
<td>(88)</td>
<td>(267)</td>
<td>(260)</td>
<td>(269)</td>
<td>(269)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case(s) Mark</td>
<td>-1.173</td>
<td>4.070</td>
<td>1.783</td>
<td>1.544</td>
<td>2.596</td>
<td>1.638</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(162)</td>
<td>(53)</td>
<td>(177)</td>
<td>(175)</td>
<td>(180)</td>
<td>(179)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minicases Mark</td>
<td>p=.027</td>
<td>p=.000</td>
<td>p=.000</td>
<td>p=.000</td>
<td>p=.025</td>
<td>p=.000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>0.2819</td>
<td></td>
<td>(50)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE 3
PERFORMANCE–UNCERTAINTY AVOIDANCE CORRELATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Total Population No Control</th>
<th>Controlling for International Competence</th>
<th>International Students Only</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Grade Point</td>
<td>-1.327</td>
<td>-1.1813</td>
<td>-2.391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>(246)</td>
<td>(214)</td>
<td>(153)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p=.038</td>
<td>p=.008</td>
<td>p=.003</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class Mark</td>
<td>-2.071</td>
<td>-2.253</td>
<td>-2.657</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(254)</td>
<td>(215)</td>
<td>(186)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p=.001</td>
<td>p=.001</td>
<td>p=.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case(s) Mark</td>
<td>-1.173</td>
<td>-1.1896</td>
<td>-2.158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(162)</td>
<td>(136)</td>
<td>(108)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p=.027</td>
<td>.025</td>
<td>p=.025</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minicases Mark</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Correlation coefficients increased for class mark and cases mark when controlling for English competence, lending support to the contention that a cultural characteristic, uncertainty avoidance, may influence the student's ability to perform case analyses. The correlation between uncertainty avoidance and grade point average, and class mark, improved. This may indicate that English competence has a stronger influence on overall university performance than on case performance.

Attempts to predict case performance using stepwise regression analysis identified overall university GPA as a strong predictor, uncertainty avoidance as a weak predictor and none of the other research variables as significant. This can lead one to the somewhat obvious conclusion that students who are generally good in intellect and motivation will be good at case analysis. It can also lead one to the more interesting observation that students can do well on case analysis without regard to their nationality or cultural upbringing.

In-class performance was compared across four nationality groupings. There are no statistically significant differences in mean performance between American and international students in either case oriented courses or other courses. In-class performance was also compared between students whose language of instruction prior to entering the University was English and those whose language of instruction was not English. There is a significant difference between the performance of students educated in English, Cantonese or Mandarin and those educated in other languages. Students proficient in Mandarin or Cantonese had higher in-class performance than the other non-native English speakers.

**CONCLUSION**

Students learn in different ways and the methods they select and the activities they believe important are influenced by their cultural background. A student's
culture can also adversely affect academic performance if it encourages attitudes and values in opposition to those considered appropriate in a different culture. The clearest example of this is the adverse influence of the lack of tolerance for ambiguity and high uncertainty avoidance on performance in American business school case analyses. In this academic setting, incomplete information and the acceptability of multiple solutions may confound a student searching for definitive solutions.

Culture may influence decision making approaches as well. Linear Western thinking may seem simplistic to a student raised to value more holistic methods. Also, if the cultural context of a case is too rich or too complex it may interfere with the ability of the student to understand the case issues.

The findings of the research indicate that culture can influence a student’s academic performance, but that culture is a relatively weak predictor of performance when compared to overall student intellectual skill, maturity and self-confidence. We can, therefore, conclude that this research supports the view that students can cross cultures and still perform well. Good students learn the culture of their new academic environment. Perhaps poor ones cannot.

RECOMMENDATIONS

It appears that marketing educators, particularly those who profess to write cases, need to answer some basic questions. These are:

- What level of cultural knowledge do case materials presuppose of their readers?
- Does this level appropriately achieve the objectives of greater cultural understanding without interfering with a fundamental goal of stimulating enhanced decision making processes?
- To what degree should writers neutralize the cultural context of their cases? Does this neutralization make the case more understandable to students from many cultures but at the expense of an appreciation of the culturally diverse context of international business?
- How do we teach cultural appreciation? Isn’t the case method an excellent mechanism for doing so? Or is enhancing decision making skills the singular purpose of case analyses?
- At what point does the cultural context interfere with the student’s ability to learn the important case concepts?
- Are we preparing students to work in a multiple or unitary culture?
- Should we teach appreciation of a specific set of cultures or should we teach adaptation to any culture?

Thoughtful responses will certainly enhance the academic experience for students in multicultural settings.

REFERENCES


MEASURING THE EFFECTIVENESS OF DIRECT MARKETING AND NATIVE LANGUAGE APPEALS TO MARKET HIGHER EDUCATION

Helena Czepiec
Patricia Hopkins
Juanita Roxas
International Business and Marketing Dept.,
California State Polytechnic University,
3801 W. Temple Ave., Pomona, CA 91768
(909) 869-4532

Abstract
In trying to attract ethnic students from a community college, this study tested the effects of whether a greeting in a students' native language on a letter will attract more responses to a direct mail solicitation compared to just the simple letter with no greeting. Letters were sent to a list of Hispanic students from a local community college qualified to transfer. Treatments were assigned at random so that half the students received letters with a greeting in Spanish while the other half didn't. Results showed significantly more students who received the greeting responded compared to those with no greeting. This study also illustrates the effectiveness of using direct mail to help attract students to transfer to a four-year state university as well as discusses measures undertaken to ensure that those students who showed interest actually enrolled.

INTRODUCTION
Public colleges and universities nationwide are starting to experiment with a variety of marketing techniques as enrollments and state funding decline dramatically. These activities include participation at school fairs, mass advertising, direct marketing. However, little is known about which of these techniques is most effective and efficient for attracting a market which is shrinking in size but increasing in cultural diversity. It is also uncertain how well techniques developed by business will transfer to marketing publicly supported academic institutions.

The public institutions of higher learning who embark on the marketing highway face both internal and external challenges. Internally, public academic institutions often lack marketing experience. When student bodies grew steadily in the 1970s and 1980s, colleges and universities kept their marketing activities to a minimum.

Today they lack marketing plans and integrated communication programs. Tightened budgets do not leave much money for marketing activities when academic programs face extinction. Moreover, faculty often resist acting as recruiters. Faculty dislike viewing students as customers and dislike the idea that institutions are in a competitive market.

Externally, the decrease in 18-25 year olds and increase in college costs has resulted in dramatic drops in enrollments. For example, at one state university in California, enrollments dropped from an all time high of 21,838 students in 1990-91 to 18,571 in 1993-94, a decline of approximately 1,000 students per year.

The racial and ethnic makeup of the target market has become more diverse, especially in states like California. For example, based on 1993-94 statistics at this state university, approximately 63% of the students were from identified ethnic groups, including 3 percent African American; 35% Asian and Pacific Islanders; 37% Caucasian; 18% Hispanic and 1% Native American. According to the U.S. Bureau of the Census and the State Department of Finance, by 2020 the population of California will be 36.5% Hispanic, 34% Caucasian, 20% Asian, 8% African American, and 0.8% Native American. During the next ten years the percentage of Hispanic students in California public schools is expected to increase from 36% to 48%. Asian students, including Pacific Islanders and Filipinos will increase to 16%. The percentage of African American students will grow only slightly.

METHODOLOGY
During July, 1995, The state university conducted on a trial basis a direct mail campaign to help turn around its lagging enrollments. Other limited recruitment tactics, particularly print and radio
advertising, had met with minimal success. Direct mail was perceived to be a more effective way to reach qualified students with a tailored message.

The direct mail package consisted of a letter and a self-addressed, postage paid return post card. The letter informed students that the state university was still open for application in the Fall and cited the top ten reasons for enrolling at the state university. The letter urged the students to act immediately by returning the post-card requesting additional information. On the return post card, the respondents were asked to indicate how likely they would be to attend the state university and why. Some 443 of the letters contained a greeting in Spanish, “We’re Open For You”. The rest of the letters, totalling 456, did not. The letters were signed by hand, using a blue pen, by the associate director for academic affairs. They were metered and mailed first class.

The letter was sent to 899 self-identified Hispanic students from a local feeder community college. This included students who declared themselves to be “Mexican, Central American, South American, Hispanic, or Other Hispanic”. Only students who had completed 40 semester units by Spring, 1995, with a grade point average of 2.0 or higher, were targeted. The Cal State University system requires that transfer students complete 56 semester units with a grade point average of 2.0 to qualify. Thus, by requesting a list of students with 40 units or more, it was assumed that students taking summer classes would have accomplished this requirement by Fall and be qualified to transfer.

TABLE 1 - Comparison of Ethnicity of The State University Students and Ethnicity of General Population of CP Service Area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>African American</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Caucasian</th>
<th>Hispanic</th>
<th>Native American</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The state university</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>immediate area</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA County</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orange County</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: This data was derived from reports provided by the U.S.

TABLE 2 - Comparison of the Ethnicity of The state university Students and the Ethnicity of the 1993 Twelfth Grade Graduates of California Public Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>African American</th>
<th>Asian</th>
<th>Caucasian</th>
<th>Hispanic</th>
<th>Native American</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The state university</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LA County</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>39%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orange County</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This data is derived from the California Department of Education report, Racial or Ethnic Distribution of Staff and Students in California Public Schools.

The Spanish greeting was tested because a number of companies have found that using Spanish language and media has been an effective way to market to their Hispanic customers. It has been successful in such industries as health care (Jaklevic, 1994), banking (Danowski, 1993; Holiday, 1993; Mink, 1994), and telecommunications (Brill, 1994). Ethnic media are less expensive than mainstream media and some believe that today’s immigrants unlike previous ones feel less obligated to assimilate (Brill, 1994). However, it is uncertain how individuals seeking a higher education respond to an appeal that recognizes their ethnicity. They may be flattered and more responsive or may be turned off by an appeal which calls attention to their differences.

The purpose of this study is twofold: 1) To measure the effectiveness of using direct mail as
a marketing tactic to increase interest among students transferring to a four-year university from community colleges; and 2) To determine whether using a personalized greeting in the language of the recipient will help increase interest among Hispanic students.

FINDINGS

One month after the letters were sent, 14 percent or a total of 121 responses were returned. This suggests that the use of direct mail, especially in a case where there is an urgent and timely message is decidedly applicable for university recruitment. Sixteen percent of the students receiving a letter with a Spanish greeting returned the postage card seeking more information compared to 10.9 percent of those who received a letter with no greeting. The response rates for the two groups were significantly different at α=.01. Fifty nine percent of the total 121 respondents had received letters with the Spanish greeting and 41 percent had received letters with with no greeting.

Thus, direct marketing strategies aimed at ethnic groups where the native language is used to attract attention and increase response is also applicable in this setting.

Table 3  Willingness To Attend The State University Of Greeting Vs. No Greeting Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Likelihood of Attending</th>
<th>Greeting</th>
<th>No Greeting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Definitely Will 1</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitely Won’t 5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Those individuals who responded were highly qualified leads. Not only did they meet the grade point and unit requirements, they indicated that they were highly motivated to attend the university. When asked to indicate on a five point scale how likely they will attend The state university with 1 being “definitely will” and 5 being “definitely won’t”, 45% checked 1, 27% 2, 24% 3, 2% 4 and 2% 5. The individuals who responded to the letter with the Spanish greeting were some what more motivated to attend than those responding to the letter without a greeting (Table 3).

Students were most interested in enrolling in the college of business (41), followed by the college of education (30), engineering (17) and sciences (17) (Table 4). Table 4 shows the frequency of students’ preferences when asked to indicate which college they wished to receive more information about. The students could check more than one college.

Table 4 Respondents’ College Preferences - Greeting Vs. No Greeting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College</th>
<th>Greeting</th>
<th>No Greeting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Design</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotel Restaurant</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Responses</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MANAGERIAL IMPLICATIONS

In an era of shrinking budgets and declining revenues, state funded institutions of higher learning must make the most of their marketing dollars. This study suggests that a direct mail marketing campaign may be one of the most effective means of recruiting new students. Direct mail is appropriate because lists of prospects are available at little or no cost from community colleges and high schools. Moreover, these lists can be segmented in numerous important ways such as grade point average, units completed, ethnicity, zip code, and university preference. The direct mail message can be
modified easily depending on the university's objectives. These objectives may include notifying students of the availability of space, financial aid, and admission requirements. It may be used to reposition the university or to build public awareness.

The message can be successfully personalized depending on the target audience's demographic characteristics. As this pilot study shows, the message can be made appealing to a culturally diverse, ethnic population.

Direct mail is very cost efficient for universities especially compared to media like newspapers and radio. For example, this trial, including printing and mailing costs, was conducted for under $500 and had an overall 14% response. The cost of obtaining one enrolled student was $4.14. The responses to the direct marketing campaign were followed up by personal telephone call by an individual who helped the prospective student through the application process. Approximately 90 percent of those students who were contacted and admitted were subsequently enrolled in the university. Historically realization rates are 33 to 35 percent.

A newspaper ad which was run for similar purposes cost $11,500 and resulted in only a single request for information. A similar appeal on a radio station costing $5,000 did not yield a single inquiry.

Segmenting the market by ethnicity also seems to be very effective. Given the success of reaching Hispanic, the campaign should be extended to other ethnic groups from other community colleges and high schools. This is particularly heartening given California's increasingly ethnically diverse student population.

Since personalization seems to be so effective, the response rate in the future could be increased by mail merging the letters and including the name in the salutation. Instead of labels on the envelope, the names and addresses of the recipients should be typed directly on the envelope.

Activities like the direct mail campaign should not be conducted in isolation. Instead it should be coordinated with other activities like the distribution of posters to the community colleges and high schools, placement of ads in the school newspapers, development of recruitment brochures, and a program of personal visits to the school campuses. Follow up is also key. The students who requested the information should be mailed information promptly and contacted personally. Without prompt and courteous follow up the impact of the direct mail campaign may be diluted. Implementing these suggestions, on the other hand via well conceived direct mail campaigns may hold the key to increasing enrollments and attracting culturally diverse students.

REFERENCES


Mink, Mary, Jan.-Feb. 1994; "Marketing To Minorities," Credit Union Executive, Vol 34, Iss 1, pp. 18-25.
WRITING IN MARKETING PRINCIPLES - PRACTICE MAKES PERFECT
William G. Browne, Beverly A. Browne, Dennis O. Kaldenberg, College of Business, Oregon State University, Corvallis, OR 97331-2603, Phone: 541-737-3692, FAX: 541-737-4890

ABSTRACT

There is a continuing concern for the deficiencies in writing skills exhibited by the undergraduate students completing their respective degrees in marketing. This paper describes a technique used by a northwest university's marketing faculty to provide better writing skills that will be required during the career of its marketing graduates.

INTRODUCTION

One of the most frequently listed skills that employers expect from a university graduate is ability to communicate in writing. In surveys of placement officials, employers, and alumni, writing is always mentioned as a basic requirement for employment and advancement (Bennett and Oney 1985; Lauffer and Crosser 1990; Horton 1985; Macmillan 1985). Most college students have had training in basic English skills and composition, both in high school and as a basic lower division university requirement. However, these same students often do not have practice in using or adapting previously acquired skills to a professional environment. One reason for this is that many college courses are taught in large mass sections which make grading writing assignments an onerous task for faculty. The paragraphs that follow describe a term-long writing assignment that effectively communicates the requirements of business writing, allows the student to interact with critical course material, and can be used in large sections.

BACKGROUND

Business writing involves the production of reports, letters, and memos, designed to communicate information (hard copy or electronically) to those who need it. In order for this written communication to be successful, it must be well organized, clearly and concisely presented, and free of distracting grammatical and/or spelling errors. Communications that do not have these characteristics not only fail to fulfill their intent but communicate undesirable messages about the sender. In the worst case, the message may be that the sender cannot think clearly or simply does not care about the communication process (Macmillan 1986).

A variety of different programs have been employed to teach practical writing skills to students. One such program is the "Writing Across Disciplines" movement which encourages faculty in different disciplines to teach writing as part of their courses (Emig 1977; Zinsser 1988). Primarily developed by frustrated English professors who believed that writing skills could not be taught in isolation, the tenets of the movement have been successfully applied by professors in a variety of subjects. For example, Kirkpatrick (1995) has described a method for using marketing research paper assignments that involves breaking the assignment into parts and using peer reviews of drafts to help students revise their work. The approach has the advantages of allowing students to analyze important topics in marketing and experience the process of revising work done by themselves and others.

Some universities view writing as sufficiently important that they have developed university-wide programs to encourage the development of writing skills among students. Corbin and Glynn (1992) have described such a program at University of Iowa that involved three endeavors: requiring all students to take an English composition course, creating and funding a Writing Center, and implementing of the Writing-Across-the-Curriculum program. In marketing specifically, marketing strategy students were given a proficiency course to improve their writing skills and to allow the college to assess student preparedness. This program, according to the most current review, has successfully helped students in need of remedial help.

Not all universities fund efforts to improve student writing skills that are as extensive as the one described above. Nevertheless, individual departments and instructors can develop assignments that help students form connections between English writing courses and business writing requirements. To the extent that these assignments help students develop better skills, they can improve the image of marketing programs and the subsequent market-ability of students in those programs.
THE WRITING ASSIGNMENT

Our marketing faculty made a decision to require a series of writing assignments in the marketing principles course. The college's administration supported this writing requirement by providing faculty with a graduate student to help grade the papers. We guaranteed that all junior level students successfully completing this course would have ample opportunity to redirect and exercise their basic writing skills.

The intent of these writing assignments is four-fold:

- First, they provide an opportunity to prepare five business memos responding to different marketing situations.
- Second, the memo assignments provide practice in developing reasonable habits for preparing business correspondence. All assignments are written in a business memo format (see Exhibit 1). The memos provide students with an opportunity to improve and continually use their writing skills. The memo writing also encourages the students to digest and apply the material assigned before class discussions begin.
- Third, the assignments provide an experience with computer and library information searches needed for developing meaningful information on select marketing problems.
- Fourth, assignments provide meaningful marketing experiences with a World Wide Web capability both as shoppers and as users of marketing information available on the WEB.

MEMO REQUIREMENTS

The memos guidelines are strict. Every assignment must be typed on white paper (8½ x 11 inches). Students are encouraged to develop a personal business letterhead for use with all memos. While only one page of text will be read, a second page, in the form of an exhibit (picture, graphs, chart, advertisement, etc.), may accompany the text. Papers are not accepted before or after class unless there is a prior agreement. If the paper is satisfactory, the student receives five points (of 280 course points). A memo loses one point for every error in style, spelling, grammar, fact or logic. If a student fails to turn in a paper or fails to type the paper, they received no points. Students are advised during the first class and in the course syllabus that the memo scores can make a difference in the final grade. A loss equivalent to a letter grade is possible for non-participation or unsatisfactory participation in the writing assignments.

Because our primary intent is improvement of writing skills, papers may be revised if the student does not receive all of the available points on the paper. A re-written paper must be submitted at the beginning of the class following its return and must have the original paper attached. This practice has been successful in encouraging continuous improvement. The number of revisions drops drastically through the term as most students recognize the efficiencies in submitting acceptable originals. Another technique for ensuring better memos is to read memos aloud to the class or to have students report on their memos to the class.

The memos are used for classroom discussion. Material covered in the memo are integrated into the lecture and the students make contributions to the lecture based on material explored in developing their individual memos. Example topics along with a brief description for one term's assignments are listed below. These can be modified depending on the instructor's interests or goals for the course.

SAMPLE MEMO TOPICS

The following describes five topics which have been used for memo assignments. Memo topics are changed each term to discourage cheating.

Memo 1 (due second week) - Market and Marketing Changes.
The intent of this assignment was to efficiently explore library materials available on and to identify trends taking place in one industry or market. A recent assignment was to read the text book insert on Levi Strauss ( Kotler and Armstrong, Principles of Marketing, Seventh Edition, pages 33-34) and answer the questions from memo instruction sheet (Exhibit 1).

Memo 2 (due fourth week) - Consumer Markets.
First students read about lifestyles and the VALS system for classifying consumers by their uses of time and money. Students used Netscape or Mosaic to access a VALS questionnaire. They answered the VALS questions and obtained an assessment of their individual personal life style. Their memo described their primary and secondary self-orientations proposed by VALS (principle oriented, status oriented, or action oriented) and identified the product preferences predicted by VALS. Then
they listed examples supporting the preference prediction and/or examples suggesting the preference prediction was incorrect. In conclusion they were asked to assess the accuracy of the VALS personal assessment.

Memo 3 (due sixth week) - Pricing Products.

This assignment required students to compare the prices of a product in two different retail outlet categories, a convenience store (e.g., 7/11 or Circle K) and a supermarket (e.g., Safeway or Albertsons). Students looked for a national brand of beer or soft drink and a store brand or generic brand (the assigned product changes each term). The written assignment was to compare and describe the price differences between a national and store/generic brand by container size (price per ounce). Students also described the price differences for the same brands in the two different store categories. Part of the assignment was to explain the price differences by container size within and between brands for one store as well as between stores. The students are encouraged to provide an exhibit organizing and presenting the data.

Memo 4 (due eighth week) - Advertising.

For this memo the students located a recent magazine or newspaper advertisement. In this memo the students evaluated the advertisement based on its: 1) objective(s) and 2) type of appeal. Students evaluate the ad’s effectiveness in meeting its objective(s). They also evaluated the media choice for reaching identified target markets. They attached a single page photocopy of the advertisement to the memo, citing the source and the date. Every term dates for the example advertisement can be changed, thus eliminating (reducing) the chances of using memos from an earlier term.

Memo 5 (due tenth week) - Marketing Organizations.

Data for this memo was generated with an in-class assignment requiring students to complete a modified SERVQUAL (Parasuraman, Zeithaml, and Berry 1994) questionnaire during the seventh week. The survey results were summarized and given to the students during the eighth week of the term. They were to assume that they have been hired as marketing director at the university and were looking for ways to improve the educational services offered by the college and university. Students received copies of their survey results depicting student expectations and perceptions regarding the current services. They selected one area, (gap) between expectations and perceptions, and briefly described a potential factor for the gap’s existence. They then made recommendations for reducing undesirable gap sizes. They discussed who in the college and university should be responsible for implementing their recommendations for improving services.

GRADING AND ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIVITIES

Typically, the grading has been handled by a graduate student, usually with an undergraduate degree in English, journalism, technical writing, or reasonable work experience in writing. The intent of the five assignments is to improve each student’s writing skills; thus, the memos are graded primarily for correctness in presentation and secondarily for content. The memo style gives the grader a standard view of every presentation and the papers are relatively easy to grade in regard to content.

RESULTS

The results of these efforts have been excellent. At the end of each term we survey the students in regard to the usefulness of the course and the value of each course ingredient. Two of the sixteen questions in the course evaluation relate to the memo assignments. The students respond to one statement that “memo writing should be discontinued” on a five point scale. Every term the students strongly disagree (4 on a 5 point scale with 5 being strongly disagree) with this statement and their written comments on the evaluation form indicate that this exercise has been very beneficial.

In the comments section of the course evaluation students have regularly stated that they appreciated having a second chance to repair memos. They have indicated that the repetition has increased their appreciation of good writing skills and has instilled self-esteem in submitting quality work. Unfortunately, however, a third of students with less than all possible points do not exercise their option to correct and submit the memo(s).

By the end of the term very little editing is required. The students have developed and gained confidence in their writing skills. The remaining challenge is to continue these writing activities beyond the course in order to maintain and develop the newly acquired skills.

A number of the faculty members of the senior level courses, both in marketing and management, have
adopted the memo writing format (often increasing the memo length to fit the needs of the assignments in these courses). These faculty members have observed that written assignments with this format are much easier to interpret and grade than traditional papers. An advantage of the memo format for students is that the student doesn't spend time second-guessing the instructor's preferences for presentation style and can devote their time to the assignment's content.

The secondary payoffs from the assignments are important, too. With completed assignments, instructors are confident that students have, at a minimum, reviewed the portion of the book related to this assignment and can discuss the material in a meaningful way. These discussions have worked well and provided proof that there are dividends in preparing for class. Students appear to recognize the advantages of the practice as teacher evaluations have been rising.

CONCLUSION

Select writing assignments can achieve a number of interests and provide windfall gains. We, as faculty, are primarily interested that students obtain a good grasp of the intellectual substance of our respective courses. Videos, cases, class visitations of business executives, computer games, etc. can all be used to provide views of the material from a different vantage point than the text or lectures. We can also, with a minimal effort, provide an environment where the student is gaining more than a cursory understanding of the text, and also developing writing skills that will play a role in their career success. In this paper, we have described a method that has been successful in developing, practicing, and retaining a skill that will be used beyond the class. Responses to course evaluations (again not to be confused with instructor evaluations) related to the areas of the writing assignments have always received high scores.

REFERENCES


EXHIBIT 1

Writing a Memo

DATE the memo

RECIPIENT (name of individual(s), title where appropriate)

SENDER (name of individual, title where appropriate)

Include a statement about the SUBJECT of the memo.

The INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT may be a sentence or a short paragraph. Complex topics may require longer introductions. The statement should identify what the memo is about and why it was written. If there are subtopics, identify what they are here.

The BODY OF THE MEMO is where the “meat” of the memo is placed. If you have identified subtopics in the introductory statement, divide the body into sections based on these topics and identify with a heading.

The CONCLUSION is brief and courteous. It may recommend an action, it may request an action to be taken by the recipient, it may provide an offer of further help or instructions on what to do after the memo is read.

Memos should be CONCISE, CLEAR AND READABLE. Avoid unnecessary topics and don’t repeat information. Headings and set-off lists (with bullets) may add clarity and coherence under certain circumstances.

Inform the reader if ATTACHMENT(S) should be reviewed as part of the memo.

Memorandum

Date: September 25, 1995

To: BA 390 Students

From: William Browne, Ph.D.

Subject: Levi Strauss

This memo describes the first of your paper assignments.

The introductory paragraphs of Chapter 2 of Principles of Marketing, discusses the Levi Strauss Corporation. I want to know in what ways macroenvironmental trends (see Chapter 3) have influenced Levi Strauss marketing mix (i.e. styles, prices, outlets, promotion, new products) for its clothing products.

I suggest you go to the library and use ABI Inform (a CD-ROM citation index) to find an article about this topic. You also may find information by using the Wall Street Journal Index. Please remember, I want only one page of information. This is not a term paper - you don’t need to read everything that was written on the topic. The memo is to update information presented in the case. You may assume that I have read the case and understand the background of the issue. In your memo, please tell me the source of your information.

This assignment should take you about one or two hours to complete. It would be wise to get started soon. Do inform me if you have a problem. I will expect your memo of reply by October 2, 1995.

Attachment: [include only if additional pages accompany memo]
JOURNALING IN MARKETING EDUCATION USING KOLB’S EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING PROCESS

Nancy Frontczak
Metropolitan State College of Denver
Campus Box 79, P.O. Box 173362
Denver, CO 80217-3362
(303-556-4951)

ABSTRACT
This paper describes an empirical study which analyzes journaling as an experiential learning technique for marketing education. Although journal writing has been used successfully by marketing educators, this study examines an alternative assignment which uses Kolb’s experiential learning cycle. Students in a consumer behavior course were given a semester-long journaling assignment. Results are presented according to the four stages of learning according to Kolb. Journaling is shown to be an effective learning technique.

INTRODUCTION
The variety and popularity of experiential learning techniques used by marketing educators continue to expand (Gaidis and Andrews 1990). Computer simulations, case analyses, client projects, field trips, video tapes, and guest speakers represent some of the more traditional experiential learning techniques used (Henke, Locander, Mentzer, and Nastas 1988). Numerous creative new learning techniques have been discussed in the marketing literature. For example, in a consumer behavior course, Olsen (1994) asked students to write radio scripts incorporating various consumer behavior concepts into the script.

Many of the experiential learning techniques used in marketing education are group oriented. The effectiveness of such group projects is well documented in the marketing literature (Daly and Worrell 1993; Williams, Beard, and Rymer 1991; Haas and Wolamba 1990; Malhotra, Tashchian and Jain 1989; Ramoki 1987; Dommeyer 1986; de los Santos and Jensen 1985; and Goratsky 1984). Although students favorably evaluate most group assignments, they also frequently request fewer group projects. For marketing majors, often nearly every marketing course involves a major team assignment. Students complain about too many groups. The problems of team projects such as free-riding, are also noted in the literature (Strong and Anderson 1990; Sweeney 1973). Marketing educators see the numerous benefits of group assignments such as: (1) team projects more closely represent real world experience, (2) group dynamics are an important aspect of learning, (3) groups produce a higher quantity and quality of ideas, (4) less time is involved for the professor in terms of both grading and student contact. However, marketing educators may need to add more balance in assigning experiential learning techniques by incorporating more individual projects. The experiential learning technique discussed in this study is individual in nature.

Also, few experiential learning techniques used by marketing educators actually include all stages of learning. David A. Kolb (1984) developed an experiential learning model which includes four aspects to learning. The technique proposed in this study allows marketing students to experience all four phases of learning.

The assignment analyzed in this empirical study also encourages the important skill of writing in marketing education. Marketing educators have discussed this critical communication skill in numerous studies (Hansen and Hansen 1995; Corbin and Glynn 1992; Chonko 1993; November 1993).

The experiential learning technique researched in this study is called journaling. The specific type of journaling used here is based on Kolb’s (1984) experiential learning cycle. Although use of journal writing is not new to marketing education (Fisher 1990; November 1993; Moncrief, Shipp and Lamb 1995), this particular type of journaling is new for marketing educators. This study focuses on a particular format for journal writing which uses Kolb’s learning cycle.

Specifically, this paper presents:
(1) A summary of relevant literature on the effectiveness of journal writing in marketing education.
A discussion of David A. Kolb's experiential learning model which will serve as a basis for the individual student journal assignment.

Methodology of an empirical study on the use of journaling in marketing education.

Results and direction for future research efforts.

**JOURNAL WRITING IN MARKETING EDUCATION**

A journal is a "personal form of communication that entails observation, analysis, and recording" (Moncief, Shipp, and Lamb 1995). Recent studies have found some success in using journal writing as an experiential learning technique in marketing education (Fisher 1990; November 1993; Moncief, Shipp and Lamb 1995). Fisher (1990) suggested that journaling assignments were found to help students integrate classroom concepts with the "real world," provide an increased sensitivity to marketing activities, and benefit student communication skills. November (1993) used journaling in a marketing management course as a method of assessment. In addition, he suggested that journal writing stimulates right-brain development which is often lacking in marketing assignments. The benefits of journal writing for both student and professor are expressed in Hansen and Hansen's (1995) article concerning Writing Across The Curriculum. Moncief, Shipp and Lamb (1995) suggested the success of using journal writing assignments for students studying international business on a foreign study tour. This study suggests an alternative format for journal writing.

**KOLB'S EXPERIENTIAL LEARNING MODEL**

The focus of this study is a model created by David A. Kolb (1984). He developed an experiential learning model which suggests that learning occurs through a process called an Experiential Learning Cycle. This process begins with a "concrete experience," which leads to "reflective observation" or feelings and emotions related to the experience. "Abstract conceptualization" follows where concepts and theories are applied to the experience. "Active experimentation" completes the learning cycle as the concepts are put into practice generating new learning goals. According to Kolb, to be an effective learner, a person needs to be skilled in all four aspects of the process.

To learn from any experience a person must be able to describe an experience, then step back and reflect on the experience, analyze it according to theory, and finally use that knowledge in new situations (Coglan 1993). Most individuals need practice in this process of learning. This study uses the learning process described by Kolb as it applies to consumer behavior experiences. Few academic experiential learning techniques used by marketing educators actually allow students to experience all four stages of learning.

Previous studies in the area of journal writing in marketing education have not encouraged the student to complete all four stages of the experiential learning cycle described by Kolb. For example, in Fisher's (1990) study students were asked to note their observations of consumer behavior (the "concrete experience" stage) and relate these observations to material covered in the class or textbook (the "abstract conceptualization" stage). The other two phases of the learning cycle were not included in the assignment. Moncief, Shipp, and Lamb's (1995) study which asked students to describe observations in a foreign country and then relate those observations to marketing theories learned in class also primarily considered only two stages of learning. The journaling assignment used in this study specifically incorporates all four stages of the learning cycle.

**METHODOLOGY**

Students in an undergraduate consumer behavior course were asked to use the journaling procedure for ten purchases throughout the semester. For each of their ten journal entries, students were asked to respond to the four areas of inquiry corresponding to Kolb's stages of learning. (See Appendix A for specific assignment.) For each journal entry or purchase each student was asked to write about the four areas of learning: (1) Concrete Experience, (2) Reflection, (3) Conceptualization, and (4) Experimentation. Since this is an exploratory study on journaling in marketing education, a convenience sample of 29 undergraduate marketing students was obtained. The sample included 15 men and 14 women with an average age of 26.3 which matched the age demographic of the school (an undergraduate urban campus).

Students were given the choice to write their entries in a notebook used for this specific purpose or enter their journal entries on a computer. The instructor gave the students an example of a journal entry for a purchase which included the four parts according to Kolb. Students were asked to number each entry (1 to 10), include the date of the entry and explain what purchase was being discussed. For each entry, the four stages of Concrete Experience, Reflection,
Conceptualization, and Experimentation were labeled. The instructor reviewed student entries, especially at the beginning of the semester, to make sure all students understood the assignment.

This individual journaling assignment was worth 25 percent of the grade for the consumer behavior course. Other than examinations, there were no other assignments in this particular course. At the end of the semester all students completed a brief questionnaire asking them to evaluate the journal assignment.

RESULTS

A total of 290 journal entries were analyzed by the author for the purpose of this research. Since this empirical study is not quantitative in nature, a content analysis of the findings is presented according to Berelson's (1952) method. Summary results from each of the four stages of Kolb's experiential learning cycle will be discussed.

Concrete Experience: In providing an objective description of a purchase for each journal entry, students selected a broad variety of goods and services. Certainly the purchases were fairly typical for college students attending an urban campus, yet several differences in the types of purchases made by men and women are noted. The number one product discussed by women (18% of all journal entries for women) was clothing or shoes. For men the main product purchased (11% of all entries by men) was an automotive product or gasoline. A close second for the men (10% of entries) was clothing, more purchases which were gifts (13% of the female entries) compared to the men (5%). Also, men included more fast food entries in their journals (9%) than the women did (5%). Entries related to groceries, restaurants, and entertainment were similar for men and women. All students were able to describe their purchase experiences in great detail. Although this first phase of learning provides the main "information" from the experiential learning assignment, it was the least intriguing in terms of analysis since it was simply an objective description of a purchase.

Reflection: In the second part of the assignment for each journal entry students were asked to discuss their feelings, reactions, and emotions related to the purchase experience. Although a commonly held belief is that women are better able to express emotions, results from this study showed that both men and women were able to express an extremely wide range of emotions. A list of the predominant positive and negative emotions discussed by men and women is presented in Table 2. This is the one phase of Kolb's learning cycle which is often omitted from many experiential learning techniques used in marketing education. Often class discussions provide the only opportunity for students to express emotions and feelings, yet this is a critical aspect of learning. The journaling technique used in this study has allowed the student the opportunity to express feelings. Given the detailed responses offered in the Reflection sections, students enjoyed the chance to express their emotions and easily put their feelings into words.

The Reflection section often included personal, touching comments from students which allowed the instructor to learn more about individual students and feel a connection with them. Students' openness and honesty in the journals turned out to be a unexpected and positive surprise. Here are just a few examples:

- Male student writing about a gift he had given to his girlfriend to "make up for making her mad": "I truly know buying the item wouldn't help as much as if we talked things through. I didn't have a sense of joy or excitement when the purchase was made. I realize now in buying the wreath I was trying to make myself happy, not her. I was trying to buy her forgiveness."

- Male student writing about buying a Father's Day card: "These feelings were triggered because I love my father and I wanted to let him know that he has always been a great father . . . I feel that it is very important to show your parents how important they are to you. As children we don't show them this enough."

- Young female Asian student writing about a dinner with her boyfriend: "This was my first dinner with Vinh

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE 1</th>
<th>Concrete Experience: Types of Purchases Selected by Men and Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automotive/gas</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clothing/shoes</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fast Food</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restaurants</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groceries</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gifts</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beer</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD's</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tools</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

similar to women. A list of products purchased by both men and women is summarized in Table 1. One interesting gender difference is that women described
and my first time eating at Red Lobster. I was so excited that I had butterflies flying around my stomach like crazy. I felt so special and romantic at the same time because nobody ever took me out to celebrate my birthday before.

- A female student writing about buying a wedding gift: "I felt happy about the wedding for them and even a little jealous and envy them finding love."

- A female student taking a friend to breakfast: “My friend and I were trying to figure out if we’re friends or more than friends. But it seemed obvious to me that I cannot be anything but friends. I told him my feelings and he was pretty upset.”

- Male student writing about buying a book for he and his wife: “My wife and I have spent time recently in marriage counseling. In this time we have learned many things about each other. We have a hard time communicating some times. Our therapist recommended a book to us.”

- Male student who had purchased a plane ticket to Las Vegas: “I made the decision while I was under the influence of alcohol. I just felt like being wild.”

**TABLE 2**
Reflection: Feelings and Emotions Related to Purchase Behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Feelings Expressed by Men &amp; Women</th>
<th>Feelings Expressed by Men</th>
<th>Feelings Expressed by Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>POSITIVE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Happy</td>
<td>Love</td>
<td>Joy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Excited</td>
<td>Fun</td>
<td>Amazed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glad</td>
<td>Relief</td>
<td>Reassured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pleased</td>
<td>Felt Good</td>
<td>Romantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfied</td>
<td>Rational</td>
<td>Relaxed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Like</td>
<td>Confident</td>
<td>Gratified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Surprised</td>
<td>Proud</td>
<td>Impressed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoy</td>
<td>Content</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| NEGATIVE                          |                          |                             |
| Anger                             | Embarrassed              | Annoyed                     |                            |
| Disappointed                      | Skeptical                | Anxious                     |                            |
| Frustrated                        | Cheated                  | Dislike                     |                            |
| Disgusted                         | Disturbed                | Guilty                      |                            |
| Upset                             | Obsessive                | Frantic                     |                            |
| Scared                            | Irrational               | Bummed                      |                            |
| Impulsive                         | Tense                    | Panned                      |                            |
| Worried                           | Unhappy                  | Detached                    |                            |
| Apprehensive                      | Stupid                   | Hesitant                    |                            |
| Hat                               | Uncontrollable           | Weary                       |                            |
| Regret                            | Overwhelmed              | Sympathy                    |                            |
| Hurried                           | Discomfort               | Nervous                     |                            |
| Shocked                           | Foolish                  | Stressed                    |                            |
|                                 | Desperate                | Concerned                   |                            |
|                                 | Irritated                | Jealous                     |                            |

A female student admitted she had a drinking problem and probably needed help, while an older male student subtly discussed being gay. Men and women alike did not shy away from their feelings in this section.

**Conceptualization:** Students were next asked to relate their purchase to relevant concepts and theories learned in the consumer behavior course which they were enrolled in. A listing of all consumer behavior concepts discussed by students is presented in Table 3. Students were able to apply the concepts studied in class to their own purchases in a thoughtful, insightful manner. Analysis of the Conceptualization section of the journals was the most rewarding to the author since it was clear that students had understood and learned the concepts covered in the course. The students often made unsolicited comments about how much the journal had helped them to learn consumer behavior. One student wrote, "In the first weeks I could not relate my purchases to the theories. But in time I began to realize how theories are linked to everyday purchases." Concepts discussed in the beginning of the semester naturally had a higher rate of occurrence in journals than those concepts covered later in the course. However, even concepts covered later in the semester were incorporated into student journals.

**TABLE 3**
Conceptualization: Consumer Behavior Concepts/Theories Related to Student's Purchase Experiences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>Self-Concept</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values</td>
<td>Stages of Decision Making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reference Groups</td>
<td>Motivation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Class</td>
<td>Cognitive Dissonance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion Leaders</td>
<td>Evoked Set</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Influence</td>
<td>Attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lifestyle</td>
<td>Diffusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involvement</td>
<td>Perception</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>Personality</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The mean number of concepts or theories mentioned by students for the first journal entry was 2.04. The mean number of concepts included for the tenth journal entry was 4.70. Both the quantity of concepts applied to the purchase and complexity of the discussion increased as the semester progressed.

**Experimentation:** In the final phase of Kolb’s experiential learning cycle, students were asked to explain what they had learned from this experience and how they could apply this knowledge to future purchase experiences. Overall, the students learned a great deal from their own analysis of ten purchase
experiences. Many students seemed surprised by how much they had learned. This process helped them understand what they would do for the next similar purchase.

CONCLUSION/DIRECTION FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The main benefit of student journaling using Kolb's experiential learning process is that it allows students to experience all phases of learning. Students were able to apply the concepts and theories learned in the consumer behavior course to their own purchases. Students did not just memorize abstract theories and concepts in order to learn. They were given the opportunity to relate these theories to their own behavior in a stimulating, highly involving assignment. Students also enjoyed the opportunity to work individually, since numerous marketing assignments are team-oriented. Finally, this experiential learning technique gives students a chance to improve their writing skills.

Both students and marketing educators can benefit from this journaling technique. Based on student feedback from the questionnaire at the end of the semester, the journal assignment was successful.

Benefits to students:
- Students learn the subject (consumer behavior in this study) from this experience.
- Students have fun since they are more personally involved with the assignment.
- Since the journal assignment includes all four stages, a more complete learning experience is achieved.
- This assignment helps students overcome their aversion to writing because they write about something of interest to them, their own personal purchases.
- Students do not experience team related problems with this assignment.
- This assignment gives students an opportunity to express emotions and feelings.

Benefits to marketing educators:
- The journaling assignment allows a faculty member to learn more about student's interests, motivations, ability to write, and even deep concerns.
- Reading journals is more enjoyable compared to reading more traditional, often dry, reports and papers.
- This technique provides a rewarding way for faculty to know their students are truly learning the material.
- Student feedback from this assignment is very favorable.

Future research using journaling in marketing education could be expanded to courses other than consumer behavior. For example, use of this particular journal assignment would be appropriate for an advertising course where students could describe an advertisement or campaign, discuss their feelings toward the campaign, relate elements of the campaign to theories and concepts learned in class, and then explain what they learned based on their evaluation of the campaign. Another area of consideration for future study would be the analysis of alternative formats for journaling in addition to the format suggested by Kolb's learning cycle. Effective methods of grading for journal assignments also need to be developed. Research could be conducted to include a control class in order to more effectively measure learning from journal writing. Finally, an analysis of learning styles could be related to preference for journal writing.

In conclusion, journaling is an effective experiential learning technique for marketing education. Kolb's learning cycle provided an appropriate format for a journal assignment in consumer behavior. This learning technique allows students to experience the full cycle of learning.

APPENDIX A

Journal Assignment

Your journal will include a total of 10 entries. For each entry please respond to the following 4 areas with specific, detailed (not general) comments.

1. Concrete Experience: Describe a concrete event in your purchasing behavior (behavior as a consumer).
   - What happened?
   - What you did.
   - What process led up to the event (or purchase).
   - Consequences of what happened.
   (This section should be written like a “news item,” neutral, without evaluation.)

2. Reflection: Describe your feelings, reactions, questions, observations, and judgments with regard to the experience.
   - Explain your behaviors, reactions, emotions.
   - What triggered these feelings.
   - How you view this behavior.

3. Conceptualization: Relate relevant concepts, theories, or information from this class to the above experience.
   - Formulate tentative hypotheses, conclusions, generalizations based on class information or assignments from the text.
4. Experimentation: Suggest action implications for applying
testing or extending what you have reflected on.
- Include behavioral goals for similar future situations.
- Do not include “general resolutions;” but specific learning
  goals resulting from your experience, reflection, and
  conceptualization above.

References


THE IMPACT OF JOURNAL WRITING ON STUDENT EVALUATIONS OF THE PERSONAL SELLING COURSE: AN EXPLORATORY STUDY

Casey L. Donoho, Northern Arizona University, Flagstaff, AZ 86011 (520) 523-7393
Michael J. Swenson, Brigham Young University, Provo, UT 84602 (801) 378-2799

ABSTRACT

We present the educational value of engaging personal selling students in a specific form of writing to learn—the keeping of a journal. Additionally, we propose a process that suggests that journal writing has the potential to contribute to learning in the personal selling course through written reflection and reaction to a wide variety of personal selling events. This process provides the additional advantage of timely feedback with which the teacher can tailor future events to meet particular class learning needs. The pedagogical approach is tested for its effect on student evaluations of the personal selling course.

The journal originated with the writings of individuals who kept systematic records of their thoughts and experiences. Science evolved from the astute observations made by individuals over the entire record of human history. Aristotle, Socrates, Ptolemy, Eratosthenes, Euclid, Archimedes, Pythagoras and his followers, Galileo, Copernicus, William Harvey, Sir Isaac Newton, to mention just a few, were persons of such ability with respect to observation, that whole revolutions in scientific and mathematical thought began due to their written records.

In the personal selling curriculum, a learning journal is a record written by a student which reflects attitudes, feelings, and expansion of his/her cognitive learning throughout the course. Journals become for the student an effective learning tool: they maximize learning and hone writing skills. Ultimately, the student journal serves to connect the student with self, with the faculty, with professional selling, and with business. For many students, the journal represents the building of a personal, conceptual framework of personal selling, a reconciliation of the disparity between the theoretical and the actual.

An experiment was conducted by the authors in two sections of the personal selling class. Journal writing was required in one section (n=24), but not in the other (i.e., control) section (n=33). For the journal writing section, eight journal entries were required which were worth 15 percent of the total grade. The entries included responses to academic, simulated, and field settings. The research findings indicate that there is little difference in teaching evaluations between the class that used journal writing and the class that did not. Only five of the twenty-four items were significantly different between groups.

This research represents efforts to introduce the pedagogy to the personal selling course and to evaluate its effect on student evaluations of the personal selling course. Although journal writing has been used by educators as an effective teaching/learning technique in other disciplines, much work remains to be done in terms of improving its use and empirically testing its effectiveness in the personal selling course.
PROFILE OF A STUDENT EXCHANGE PROGRAM

Gerald O. Bryan
Sid Craig School of Business
California State University, Fresno
Fresno, California 93740
(209) 278-7830

ABSTRACT

An expanding global economy has created a new environment for the American business school graduate prompting business schools to internationalize their curricula. The addition of experiential learning enriches these curricula. To address inherent obstacles in providing such experiential learning, a one-for-one student exchange model was instituted. This paper discusses the features of that model, the issues involved in implementing it, institutional influences affecting these issues, and a way to affect those influences.

THE NEED

An expanding global economy has created a new environment for the American business school graduate. Yesterday's differentiators (e.g., computer literacy, communication skills, work experience, and good grades) have become today's qualifiers. As business becomes increasingly international, the demand for "worldly" skills rises. Although America has made some significant strides in the new world order of international trade, we are still experiencing an annual trade deficit, still supporting some highly protective trade policies, still uncertain about free trade agreements, still encouraging consumers to "Buy American", and still have an ethnocentric population that, for the most part, speaks only one language.

This has prompted business schools to internationalize their curricula by (1) installing new international courses, (2) adding international units to existing courses, (3) making a second language a graduation requirement, and (4) establishing new international options or majors. To support these new efforts, business schools are also updating and developing their faculty by offering them in-service training programs; international seminars, conferences, and workshops; and international travel opportunities.

In addition, today's global business environment demands self-directed people who are culturally sensitive, adaptable, and possess the meta-skills to operate comfortably in a variety of uncertain situations. More language training and more international course work is not enough. While these courses teach new knowledges, skills, and understandings, they often ignore the student's personal development needs. They do not effectively change an ethnocentric orientation nor are they good at developing self-reliance, a tolerance for uncertainty, or an ability to adapt. Although existing courses give students new academic skills, they do not instill in them a true appreciation of global environments or an attitude toward cultural sensitivity. To graduate future business leaders with both the academic abilities and the personal qualities needed for success in a global environment, their education needs to include real-world international experience as well as classroom instruction.

THE OBSTACLES

There are significant obstacles which make it difficult to develop and implement an international experience for students. First among these is the cost of studying in a foreign country. The additional tuition, travel, and living expenses incurred make the costs of foreign study prohibitive to students.

A second obstacle is the fact that foreign study tends to delay the student's graduation. If they enroll in an already packaged foreign study program, the courses may or may not fit their educational interests or needs. Even when students work directly with a foreign institution in selecting a course of study, the course work is frequently incompatible with the courses at their home institution. As a result, such courses are usually counted as free electives and cannot be used to meet the degree requirements in a specific option or major. The student's progress toward graduation, therefore, is essentially on hold while they are out of the country.

Language is still an obstacle for most mainstream Americans. Students must develop additional language skills or eventually find themselves in business situations where they are tied to interpreters or bound to agreements that can be negotiated in English. In addition to improving their international communication skills, the learning of another culture's
language represents a large step toward the student's understanding of that culture.

One of the more significant obstacles blocking a student's international involvement is the fear and inertia which comes from their own ethnocentric orientation. Because of this orientation, many students are either indifferent toward or intimidated by the prospect of living in a foreign environment.

THE MODEL

To overcome these obstacles, a specific, annual, one-for-one, student exchange model was developed between California State University, Fresno and the University of Central Lancashire in Preston, England. The design intends to offer students an international learning experience where the environment is not intimidating, where the cost is affordable, and where the credits are fully transferable. The philosophy of this program is learner centered. It places heavy emphasis on meeting the personal development needs of individual students while enhancing their ability to understand and function within a rapidly changing global environment.

Over one-third of those enrolled at Fresno State are first generation college students. Many others, even though their parents may be college graduates, have spent their lives in the San Joaquin Valley, have limited travel experience, and have a somewhat parochial mindset. England was selected as the location for this student exchange because it offers a sort of "half-way house" introduction to international living for these uninitiated students easily intimidated by foreign cultures. Its subtle differences in language and lifestyle, its membership in the European Union, and its proximity to Continental Europe provide opportunities for an international exposure rich enough to teach yet mild enough for the students to cope. Students who have participated return with an enlightened view of the world, a new perspective on America, and the self-confidence to pursue more exotic international experiences.

Except for the price of their round-trip air fare, the cost for this year of study is the same as a year of study on the Fresno campus. This is a one-for-one exchange. One American student for one English student. When each student pays their home institution costs, they are paying for the slot that will be used by their visiting counterpart. The English student pays the University of Central Lancashire costs and the California student pays the Fresno State costs. In this way, each student can participate as a fully-paid student at their host institution at home institution prices. Included in these prices are all tuition and fees, dormitory accommodations, and meal expenses. The cost of textbooks and personal expenses are not included. Experience has shown that students can participate in this one-year program for prices equal to many of the pre-packaged semester programs.

This program is also unique in that it allows Fresno State students to use the credits they earn in England to satisfy their degree requirements here at home. As a result, these students can enroll in the English courses without delaying their graduation. The program, initiated in the Marketing Department at the Sid Craig School of Business, was originally intended only for business students. It is now open to all Fresno State students and offers a wide range of courses in biology, business, chemistry, computer sciences, electronics, engineering, journalism, languages, mathematics, nursing, physics, psychology, social studies, social work, statistics, and a variety of special interest topics.

It all begins when interested students meet with the Coordinator of the International Business Center in the Sid Craig School of Business. Students are asked to bring with them a list of courses they need for graduation. From this list, courses are selected which can be matched with courses from the University of Central Lancashire catalog and pre-approval signatures are secured from the home campus departments involved. Upon their return from England, the credits earned in those approved courses will count toward the student's degree requirements - the same as if they had taken them at Fresno State. Proof that the process works is the fact that returning students have graduated on time.

THE IMPLEMENTATION ISSUES

A number of issues arise in the process of implementing this cooperative arrangement between these two educational bureaucracies.

Educational Differences

The basic educational delivery system in the United Kingdom is different in many ways from that found in the United States. The English student must complete foundation and general education courses in high school before taking their qualifying, or "A", exams. Therefore, theirs is a three-year degree program with no general education requirements. The student's entire degree curriculum is a specialized course of studies similar to those found in our options or majors.
There are no lower and upper division courses and many of their prerequisites are different. As a result, it is often difficult to identify equivalent courses between the two catalogs.

To further complicate matters, theirs is a system of "credits" while ours is a system of semester hours or "units". Our typical three-unit course assumes a 15 week semester, three hours of class time per week, and two hours of outside work for every hour in class. Their typical five credit course continues for a full academic year. Students may attend class only one, two, or three hours per week and are expected to do most of their studying outside of class. This makes it difficult to determine the units of credit earned.

Teaching methodologies are also different. English students normally attend one large-group lecture session and one small-group seminar per week. The senior course professorconducts the lecture while other faculty, called "tutors" conduct the seminars. Instead of a textbook, students are given a bibliography of books from the library. While our courses include weekly assignments and frequent testing, the English professors typically require large term papers and give only one comprehensive exam at the end of each course. As a result, both the English and the American students are required to develop new learning patterns and new study skills.

Without a formal articulation agreement, the process of matching courses and determining credits can be a bit time consuming. Once each student has identified the courses they need, a possible equivalent must be located in the host institution's catalog. Course descriptions for these possible substitutes must then be reviewed and approved by the chairs of the appropriate departments. In many cases, a catalog description is insufficient and a course syllabus must be obtained before approval can be determined. Since the student candidates may come from any discipline on campus, a large variety of courses and many departments are involved. For general education courses, approval must be obtained from the faculty review committee in the Evaluations Office.

Although the cooperating agreement between the two institutions endorses the principle of "mutual recognition and trust", there is a wide variation in the degree of flexibility exercised in the department approval process. Some departments assume a "good faith" posture and ignore minor differences in course content, prerequisites, and pedagogy. Others insist upon almost "cloned" courses and a review of the student's transcript before granting their approval. Over time, this laborious process will be simplified. A documented inventory of previous approvals can be used as precedents, resulting in a sort of pro-forma articulation agreement.

Even after the students have gained all the necessary approvals and have crossed the Atlantic, problems may arise. Courses they had hoped to take may be full, or cancelled, or offered at a conflicting time. Academic calendars and class schedules are exchanged, pre-registration materials are provided, and long-distance registration is arranged to minimize these problems. However, when they occur, new approvals must be obtained rapidly before late registration periods end. Needless to say, FAX and e-mail circuits between Fresno, California and Preston, England are busy during these periods.

**Administrative Differences**

In addition to the pedagogical differences, there also are differences in administrative policies and procedures. The difficulties created here are not a function of the degree of difference. They are a function of an institution's flexibility and/or willingness to adapt.

Based on the principle of "mutual recognition and trust" each home campus is able to qualify the students who will participate. However, all students must go through an international student application process. Student transcripts are exchanged, passports must be obtained, visa status must be authorized, and health insurance policies must be purchased or verified. In this process, a number of differences exist between the two institutions. For example, the English students are required to obtain student visa status; the American students are not. The English students must purchase a health insurance policy or show proof of adequate coverage. The American student should obtain travel insurance but has access to the English "socialized medicine" once they have been officially admitted and enrolled. The American student must have their absence from campus authorized to avoid losing their catalog status. To address these differences and to negotiate the bureaucracies, a virtual blizzard of forms must be completed, submitted, and filed for each student. Even some new forms had to be approved and filed to exempt these students from provisions documented by established forms.

Dorm accommodations must be arranged because participating students are required to live on-campus during their stay at the host institution. This requirement facilitates the student's integration into
campus life at the host institution. It also makes it easier to implement. Arranging reciprocal, one-for-one agreements with a variety of off-campus landlords in two countries is not very practical.

Once again, differences must be reconciled. Dorm residents on the Fresno campus are required to purchase a meal plan and eat at the Residence Dining facility. There is no meal plan in England because the dorms are equipped with communal kitchens. Therefore, the American student pays the home institution dorm fees before leaving then buys groceries and cooks in England. The English student also pays the home institution dorm fees before leaving but must buy their meal plans when they arrive in Fresno.

Academic calendars and the exchange circumstances create additional differences that must be reconciled. The American school year begins in late August and ends in late May, with a three-week Winter and one-week Spring break. The English school year begins in late September and ends in late June with a shorter Winter break and a longer Spring break. Dorms tend to shut down during these break periods and, since most exchange students cannot afford to go home, special arrangements need to be made and additional fees must be paid to house and feed those who do not have holiday travel plans. In addition, students from both countries must arrive at their host campus one week before the semester begins to participate in international orientation sessions. Dorm and meal accommodations must be made available at these times as well.

Financing is one of the primary areas of concern to the students. The principle of a one-for-one exchange assumes an exchange of equal value. That is why the exchange agreement states that "no monetary consideration will be exchanged between the institutions." And so, even though the basic cost of tuition, fees, and accommodations are different between the two campuses, each student is paying their home institution rates so there is no problem. However, when students are charged additional fees, they begin to see evidence of unfair treatment. For example, all students must pay a security deposit on their dormitory rooms, but the amounts are slightly different. Different fees are charged for the international orientation sessions. The cost of English groceries is not always equivalent to the cost of the American meal plan. It is impossible to reconcile these differences to the penny. That is why it is important to keep these additional charges to a minimum and to provide the students with full disclosures at the outset.

One of the advantages of this educational package is its low student cost. Nevertheless, the "pay-as-you-go" American student still faces some financial problems. The reason is two-fold. First of all, the American students are accustomed to paying their housing costs monthly and their tuition fees each semester. However, the university requires exchange students to pay these costs for the entire year before their departure. One large payment is a lot more difficult than several smaller ones. Secondly, a large percentage of Fresno State students receive some form of financial assistance. Those participating in this program face a "Catch-22." While they must pay all their program fees before departing, they cannot get their assistance until after they arrive in England and send back proof of their enrollment.

Institutional inflexibility is an underlying factor in many of the implementation issues outlined above. Educational bureaucracies tend to lock themselves into a set of procedures and tend to adopt an "if it was not invented here" attitude when asked to change. To address this tendency toward inertia, a series of short-term staff exchanges has been implemented. Key administrative personnel from such areas as Admissions, Accounting, Student Services, Evaluations, etc. are selected. Those selected engage in short-term exchanges to (1) create a greater understanding of and appreciation for the educational delivery system and administrative practices of partner institutions and (2) to explore ways to harmonize and develop greater institutional compatibility.

THE EPILOGUE

The student exchange between California State University, Fresno and the University of Central Lancashire has been a rich educational experience for the students involved. As it gains visibility, its popularity is increasing. Last year, twelve students participated. This year, seventeen are involved and plans are already being made to expand it into Spain. However, success may create a final set of problems. While the program provides a meaningful experience for students, it is staff intensive and it generates no new institutional income. As a result, the funds and staffing needed to promote the program, to recruit and qualify its students, and to manage its implementation may be difficult to get. In an institution oriented to quantity-based education and FTES, the program will merely survive. In an institution committed to quality-based education and the student learner, it will thrive.
PREPARING FOR CAREERS IN GLOBAL MARKETING: STRATEGIES FOR U.S. FEMALE STUDENTS

Nathan D. Kling, Joe F. Alexander, Denny E. McCorkle, and Rutilio Martinez
University of Northern Colorado, Greeley, CO 80639 (970-351-2366)

ABSTRACT

Historically, foreign employment opportunities have disproportionately favored male managers. As marketing educators, one of our tasks is to prepare our students, male and female, for such assignments. This task should not only include traditional instruction on how to do business abroad but should also include some insight into how to succeed in obtaining foreign positions as marketing managers. This latter instruction is especially important for our female students. Part of the purpose of this paper is to offer some strategies that will grant our female students greater opportunities in competing for such assignments. It should be noted that while some of the strategies suggested would also be useful to male students, the focus is on strategies for overcoming barriers that are uniquely faced by females.

In her groundbreaking studies of women expatriates, Nancy Adler (1984a, 1984b, 1984c, 1986, 1987, and Adler and Izraeli, 1987, 1994) examined, among other things, the issue of why women are so vastly underrepresented in the ranks of expatriate managers. Tom Peters (1990) has argued that as businesses become "less hierarchical, more flexible and team-oriented, faster and more fluid... one group of people has an enormous advantage in realizing this necessary new vision—women."

Why are more women not being hired, considering the potential advantages they offer and the legal rights they have to such positions? The answer lies in the fact that male managers are making decisions under a set of false assumptions which are highly prejudicial to women. Adler goes on to empirically demonstrate that females are as interested as men in international assignments and that women have a much higher success rate than males on foreign assignments. It is clear that women are interested, qualified, and legally entitled to seek positions abroad, yet in many cases are being systematically held back.

Preparation, coupled with high levels of improvisation, are the keys for females getting foreign postings. Some women have taken low paying positions in international sales organizations knowing that their skills and drive would lead to better positions, while others have deliberately taken temp positions in international departments of companies so that they could showcase their talent and network with the people who make the foreign staffing decisions (Rossman, 1990). Michele Morris (1992) observes that women who succeed in business, "... are often bold, brash and big risk takers. They're not afraid to bend or even rewrite the rules."

The authors identify and discuss the following strategic recommendations for U.S. female students who may be interested in pursuing a career in global marketing: (1) acquire specialized experiences and skills prior to graduation, (2) target/screen potential positions early in the search process, and (3) prepare a self-marketing plan. Some of Adler's general recommendations are also revisited. She advises women to: (1) assume naivete, not malice from management, (2) strive for excellence in building personal qualifications, and (3) be prepared to address private life issues (e.g., marital status, dual careers, children) directly (Adler, 1993).

While progress has been made in establishing equal opportunities for women in international marketing positions, there remains an unlevel playing field. Women should, however, be somewhat encouraged by recent trends. Statistics indicate that the percentage of women expatriate managers is on the rise. In addition, the overall number of expatriate managers also continues to increase, providing a greater pool of employment opportunities for women.
VALUE CHAIN ANALYSIS: THE STRATEGIC FOCUS OF ASIAN INTERNATIONAL MARKETING
A "Hands-On" International Business Education Program

Shyam J. Kamath, Department of Marketing, California State University, Hayward 94542 510-885-4275
Bruce E. MacNab, Department of Marketing, California State University, Hayward 94542 510-885-3535

ABSTRACT

This paper describes a unique, "hands-on" international marketing program which uses an international consultancy model to train market researchers in the university classroom to conduct world-class market research while gaining international consulting experience and a global outlook. The "value chain" based business education model that underlies the AIM program is also described and its advantages highlighted.

INTRODUCTION

The restructuring of the U.S. economy in the late eighties and early nineties has caused fundamental questions to be raised about the relevance and content of management education at both the undergraduate and graduate levels. Declining or stagnant enrollments in the nation's undergraduate and graduate management education programs (AACSB, 1996) and the dissatisfaction expressed by corporate executives about the preparedness of today's business school graduates have prompted many business schools to re-examine the very basis of their business education programs (Business Week, July 19, 1993). Many of the nation's leading companies complain that university-based business education programs lack relevance for the corporate reality of today's fast-changing business environment and seldom lead directly to results on the job.

In response, certain business schools have created custom-made executive education programs in collaboration with a growing number of companies and have internationalized their course offerings. Long before the current trend toward hands-on business courses and international courses became evident, in order to meet these challenges and criticisms, the School of Business and Economics (SBE) at California State University, Hayward (CSUH) developed a comprehensive strategy for hands-on global experiential business education. This paper discusses a component of the SBE's international experiential learning programs by providing an overview of objectives, content and method of operation of a course called Asian International Marketing (AIM).

OVERVIEW OF THE AIM PROGRAM

The Asian International Marketing (AIM) Program is a unique international business education program that provides "hands-on" learning for participants by having them complete detailed market research studies and marketing plans for firms in other countries for market entry of their products into the U.S. market. The AIM program is offered as an intensive senior-level/M.B.A. course over a regular quarter. Consultant teams of three to four participants complete two major market research studies each during the regular ten-week quarter for client companies in two different countries.

A schematic showing the method of operation of the AIM program is shown in Figure 1. As a first step, the course directors (Kamath and MacNab) fly to the prospective host countries to identify companies and select product candidates for export to the U.S. market. This is typically achieved through local contacts and connections in the host country and by

FIGURE 1
The AIM Schematic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High Quality Research Marketing, 10,000,000 DOLLARS</td>
<td>Academic International Research Experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct Contact to Export/Import</td>
<td>Trade in China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low Actual Cost = $10,000</td>
<td>Company Site Visit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost</td>
<td>Academic Stay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost</td>
<td>Course Seminar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parenting Competency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

41
working with regional/national chambers/federations of commerce and industry and associated exporting and manufacturers associations. A half-day to two-day seminar is organized in each host country to explain the objectives, scope and method of operation of the AIM program to pre-identified target companies. Interested companies are asked to prepare an information package containing detailed company information, product specifications and production rates and cost/price data. Detailed research objectives and information needs are identified in association with the prospective client companies. Wherever possible, factory visits are made to assess the suitability of the product for export to the United States and obtain firsthand information.

Student research teams consisting of seniors and MBAs at Hayward then intensively research the U.S. market to determine the level of competition and the demands for the products assigned to them. Each team researches one company each from the two countries included that year in the AIM program. Every advanced marketing research technique is utilized including secondary research using the Internet and databases (commonly used databases include Lexis/Nexis, Infotrac, the National Trade Data Bank, etc.), and primary research is conducted using detailed questionnaires, personal interviews, videotaped focus groups and expert opinion surveys. Information on competitive products and companies, distribution channels, government regulations, import restrictions and duties, promotion and advertising methods, pricing, total market potential and market structures is obtained in order to make the research as comprehensive as possible. The overseas client is provided with names and contact information on interested customers and distribution channel participants and very often personally introduced to the interested parties. A two or three volume market research report is then prepared and if market entry potentials are found to be favorable, a detailed marketing plan is prepared.

The CSUH teams then travel to the host countries of the client companies to present their reports to the top management of these companies. The reports are formally presented in a half day session in the client companies' board-rooms or conference rooms. The research teams conducting research for other company clients are also present to observe and learn from the presenting research team's report. The research teams also visit the factories of the participating companies in addition to visiting other industrial establishments and sites. Visits to important historical and cultural sites are also arranged.

The AIM program has been implemented four times since it first originated as the Pacific Rim Marketing Program (see MacNab and Kamath, 1990). The first time, it was conceived and implemented by MacNab in China in 1989. The course remains the single most sought after course in the business school. The program was also selected in Fall, 1995 as the National Award Winner for Excellence in Private Enterprise Education by the Freedoms Foundation in Valley Forge, Pennsylvania.

THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF THE AIM PROGRAM: ITS STRATEGIC VALUE CHAIN FOCUS

The concept of the value chain provides a useful basis for understanding the value of the AIM program (see Porter, 1985 for the value chain model). The value chain consists of all those activities performed in an industry or area of human endeavor that contribute to enhancing buyer or user value.

The main focus of the business education model adopted in the AIM program is on developing a differentiation strategy aimed at attracting high quality students looking to differentiate themselves from the average business school graduate. The value chain for the target student population critically depends on how the student can augment and leverage the knowledge capital acquired during the course of studying for the business degree while simultaneously learning real-world skills in the context of an actual contractual relationship with an international client. By completing the AIM program, the student is able to signal the employer that she/he is business ready and has been a consultant to two (or more) international companies overseas by including the AIM experience as a resume item. This also enhances the employer's perception of the value to be received by hiring a CSUH business graduate with AIM experience.

The differentiation focus of the AIM program for business education can be analyzed in terms of the addition to the value chain of the student participants and their ultimate corporate employers. Figure 2 shows the matrix of joint outcomes for both the student participant and the prospective employer. The gains to the student is mainly in terms of an enhancement of her/his human capital attributes and her/his signaling capabilities to prospective
employers.

**FIGURE 2**

Matrix of Joint Outcomes for AIM Student Participant and Prospective Employer

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Human Capital Attributes</th>
<th>Signaling Attributes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Resume</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real-world experience</td>
<td>Completed consultancy reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International experience</td>
<td>Completed international travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cross-cultural training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Value</th>
<th>Readily Measurable</th>
<th>Difficult to Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lower Employer Cost</td>
<td>Minimal to none</td>
<td>Lower costs of greater cross-cultural sensitivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhanced Employer Performance</td>
<td>Better results</td>
<td>Lower international setup costs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>on the job</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Business ready employees</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The benefits to employers are in terms of general value criteria and specific use criteria. In terms of the value criteria of employers and the human capital attributes of the student participants, the gains are in terms of hands-on knowledge, real-world experience, international experience and cross-cultural training. In terms of the value criteria of employers and the signaling attributes of participants, the benefits are in terms of a significant resume item denoting differentiated quality, international travel and completed consultancy reports. In the other dimension of the specific use criteria of prospective employers and the human capital attributes of participants, the gains are in terms of the low cost of differentiation and procurement of strategic market information, raising of employer/employee performance and the development of business-ready employees. The last cell of the matrix provides for more advertising, better positioning and brand differentiation for both the participant and the prospective employer.

The relationship between the use criteria of employers and employer value of the AIM program is presented in Figure 3. The readily measurable elements of lower employer cost include the lower cost of hiring an employee who requires minimal or no in-company training and the lower error cost of a more informed hiring decision with the availability of real-world references and a research report to evaluate. The difficult-to-measure cost advantages include the lower cost of greater cross-cultural sensitivity of employees and possible lower international set-up costs due to having a new hire with some international business experience. The readily measurable benefits in terms of improved employer performance include better on-the-job results from AIM trained employees and the hiring of hands-on, business-ready employees. Less readily measurable benefits include greater employee flexibility and adaptability as well as employees with a broader international outlook.

A parallel relationship between student participant use criteria and measurability of value for the AIM program is shown in Figure 4.

**FIGURE 4**

Relationship Between Participant Use Criteria and Participant Value for the AIM Program

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of Value</th>
<th>Readily Measurable</th>
<th>Difficult to Measure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lower Student Cost</td>
<td>Minimal co-pay</td>
<td>Lower time cost</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regular course credits</td>
<td>with a win company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No break in degree program</td>
<td>training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better Student Performance</td>
<td>Improved job prospects</td>
<td>Cross-cultural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Greater hands on presentation skills</td>
<td>market outlook</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global hands-on</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The major sources of value for the AIM student are lower student cost for real-world, experiential learning and higher future on-the-job performance. The readily measurable elements for the former are minimal or no co-pay for participating in the AIM program due to the costs being covered by the client companies and the obtainment of regular credits (and, in fact, enhanced course credits because students can obtain an extra 2 credits for the travel component of the program) with no break in the degree program. The less readily measurable benefits include the low time cost as students gain real-world, hands-on business
experience. With regard to higher future on-the-job performance, the readily measurable elements include improved job prospects and the advantages of being business ready with hands-on, real world experience. The less readily measurable sources of value for improved future on-the-job performance include a broader international outlook and exposure and cross-cultural presentation and communication skills.

In order for the AIM program to be viable from a budgetary point of view, a specific cost focus strategy for prospective overseas client companies was adopted. Recognizing that prospective client companies could not afford the rates of commercial U.S. market research firms, a conscious decision was made to conduct the studies on a no-profit, no-loss but incremental cost basis. The cost of the program charged to the client has included all report production costs, international and local host country travel costs for the research teams, host country boarding and lodging costs, and host country sight-seeing and cultural entertainment costs. No charge for the time of the researchers or the salaries and opportunity costs of the course directors/instructors is included since the costs of the course to the student and the university are expected to be covered from student fees and the regular university budget as would be the case for any academic course at the university. The identified cost driver is the linkage of the program within the regular value chain of the student participant and the university. This approach provides the AIM program with a unique cost advantage in signing on foreign clients since the cost of a report to the client is as little as one-fifth or one-sixth the cost of that from a comparable U.S. market research firm for reports of the same quality.

**SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS**

This paper has presented the conceptual framework and the method of operation of a unique, hands-on international business education course/program called Asian International Marketing. The program is based on a differentiation strategy of business education aimed at enhancing the value of student learning while meeting the needs of prospective employers’ value criteria for business-ready graduates. On the side of the participating client firms, the AIM program represents a low-cost strategy to win clients in countries which cannot afford expensive market research in the U.S. while covering the costs of conducting the program on an incremental basis.

The major conclusion that emerges is that the AIM program meets a perceived business need of today's corporations for value, making business education relevant and real-world based by producing business graduates who can contribute directly on the job at an early time during their employment. By providing participants with hands-on, real-world consulting experiences with overseas clients, the program is building a cadre of global managers who can meet the demands of today's exacting and fast-changing globalized business environment. It represents a major attempt to make the university business curriculum business friendly and relevant.

**REFERENCES**

American Assembly of Collegiate Schools of Business (AACSB), *Enrollments and Degrees Conferred*. Data supplied by the AACSB, January 30, 1996.


CHARTING INTERNATIONAL LOGISTICS CHANNELS

Paul Murphy, John Carroll University, University Heights, Cleveland, Ohio 44118
(216) 397-4532
Daniel L. Wardlow and Donald F. Wood, San Francisco State University, San Francisco, CA 94132
(415) 338-1427

ABSTRACT

The "channels" concept is useful in explaining the continuing relationships in the supply chain necessary for sales transactions to take place and to continue. This paper looks at an exercise used in an undergraduate international logistics class that forces students to focus on a channel and study relationships within the channel and with other channels. Student teams take the documents associated with an export or import transaction and develop the transaction's documentation channel.

INTRODUCTION

The "channels" concept is useful to marketing instructors since channels illustrate transactions as a continuing series of relationships. As transactions become more complex, the approach is useful to those attempting to understand the entire process. This paper deals with a very specialized channel associated with international marketing, and shows how subjecting the channel to detailed scrutiny can be a teaching tool.

International transactions are more complicated than domestic ones. Nearly every aspect involves more steps, takes more time, and costs more. To examine this complexity, it is useful to study the relationships of primary and facilitating members who participate in the arrangement. This paper will first discuss the various channel flows and their relevance to international transactions. Second, it will describe a teaching method of having students analyze and diagram some of the channel components.

THE MARKETING CHANNELS APPROACH

Stern and El-Ansary's (1996) definition of a marketing channel is a useful starting point; we modify it slightly so that it fits better the complexities involved in international transactions.

Marketing channels can be viewed as sets of interdependent organizations involved in the process of making a product or service available for consumption or use. From the outset, it should be recognized that not only do marketing channels satisfy demand by supplying goods and services at the right place, quantity, quality and price, but they also stimulate demand through promotional activities of the units (e.g. retailers, manufacturers' representatives, sales offices, and wholesalers) constituting them. Therefore, the channel should be viewed as an orchestrated network that creates value for the consumer through the generation of form, possession, time, and place utilities. (pp. 1-2)

All channels carry information shared freely among channel members and between channel flows. One of the functions of the system is to give each member sufficient information for rational decision making.

The primary (traditional) members of the ownership channel are the manufacturer, the wholesaler, and the retailer. Each, in turn, assumes ownership risk of the inventory of goods. The same, or related parties also get together in other channel flows including the negotiations channel, the financing channel, the promotions channel, and the logistics channel. For purposes of discussing international transactions we add two other channels: the documentation channel, and the hazardous materials shipment channel.

Principal parties in international transactions are called exporters and importers. International shipments require that many documents be prepared and assembled. It is not unusual for five or ten to be required; on rare occasions, the number can exceed 100. Usually all of the documents must be presented when the goods move through the importing nation's Customs. Having them all available at that point is a logistics exercise in itself. Little will be said about hazardous materials shipments other than to acknowledge that they have specialized documentation requirements and often follow unique routes.

The ownership channel covers movement of title to the goods. The goods themselves need not be physically present or even exist. For a good in great demand, one might have to buy it before it is produced; as with the Mazda Miata shortly after its U.S. introduction.
The negotiations channel is where buy and sell agreements are reached. This includes any form of communication. One part of the negotiations covers how activities in the other channels are to be handled. For example, each party will specify the point and time of delivery, and the point and time of payment. In international transactions, letters of credit are also prepared and amended as part of negotiations. The transaction cost of negotiations is also of significance to the logistics channel because the transaction costs are a determinant in the size of order.

The financing channel handles the payment for the goods. It also handles the issue of credit. The participants in the channel have different financial strengths and often one must help another to keep the entire channel alive. The logistics channel is often designed so that a payment must be received in order to trigger the release of the order. The freight forwarder often acts as the financial gatekeeper.

The documentation channel is most closely related to both the financing and the logistics channels.

The promotions channel is concerned with marketing communications, and is most closely related to the financing channel because monetary allowances are part of the promotion effort. The promotions channel and the logistics channel are linked in two ways. There may be special advertising materials such as coupon books or point of purchase displays that must be distributed with the promoted product. Second, some of the cartons or consumer packs may have special labeling and their placement at retailers must coincide with other promotional efforts.

The logistics channel covers both the movement and the storage of the product, mainly in the direction toward the consumer.

In addition to the major members, or primary participants in a logistics channel, there are many less well-known members who play minor, but very necessary facilitating roles. They are called middlemen, facilitators, or channel intermediaries. Intermediaries make the entire system function better. They spring up -- and flourish -- in areas where communications and other interactions between major parties are not well-meshed. Intermediaries also function in areas needing orderly routines, such as order processing and searching. They fill niches by providing specialized services which a primary channel member cannot perform in as efficient a manner. They are very well-focused, and often serve as buffers in the channel. They generally do not take an ownership position in the goods being handled. Facilitating intermediaries exist in each of the seven channels mentioned above.

**CHARTING CHANNEL FLOWS:
A STUDENT ASSIGNMENT**

Students in an upper-division undergraduate International Logistics course are given the following assignment:

Describe an export or import movement showing dates, locations, routes, etc. of (a) the order; (b) the payment; (c) the documents; and (d) the goods. In order to considered for a grade of B or higher on the paper, you must use PERT procedures to diagram and relate the flows. The same material will be presented to class with diagrams presented as overhead transparencies.

Students were told to work in teams of two. Two-person teams seem to work best on this assignment. An "ideal" team consisted of one individual who knew PERT techniques, and an individual with contacts in the export/import business. The subject University is located in San Francisco, making it relatively easy for students to find an international trade movement to track.

Students were encouraged to come up with a trade movement that was of personal interest to them, and most groups easily identified a topic. The instructor made suggestions to a few groups which stimulated their topic selection. Considerable class time was spent describing the types of information to be gathered and how it would be analyzed so that it could be fed into PERT software. Most students in the class had already been exposed to the PERT processes in an operations research course. Students were also encouraged to seek out appropriate supporting documents from the transaction to illustrate the channel movement. Research sources were protected by concealing proprietary information.

**THE STUDENTS' PRODUCTS**

Because of the school's West Coast location, most shipments the students selected were to and from Asia. Typical of recent papers were: aluminum sheet scrap from San Jose to China, cargo-handling equipment from Singapore to Bangkok, enzyme inhalation solution from California to Switzerland.
garments from Hong Kong to U.S. via Costa Rica, golf shirts from Malaysia to Long Beach, intrafirm movement of batteries from New York to Santos, Brazil, and musical instruments from Los Angeles to Johannesburg.

DISCUSSION OF METHODS

The seven channels mentioned earlier include: ownership, negotiations, financing, promotions, logistics, documentation, and hazardous goods. How well did the classroom exercise perform in supplying useful information about each channel? Note that the assignment was not intended to shed light equally on all of them. The course dealt with international logistics and some of the other channels' issues (financing, for example) should be covered in more depth in other international business courses.

Little was developed regarding the ownership channel, other than one usually could tell by documents the point at which ownership changed. The students had no idea how clear a title the various parties to the transaction had. (Literal ownership of goods moving internationally is a complex topic.)

As for the negotiations channel, the students saw only the results of successful negotiations. While price is important, from a logistics standpoint the negotiating item of most interest was terms of sale such as F.O.B. plant or F.A.S. ship. This heightened interest in the logistics channel is because the logistics manager's responsibilities start or end at that point. Students did pick up some information as to why certain terms of sale were employed and this was reported in their papers. One group did include a pro-forma invoice as document. The pro-forma invoice is the result of negotiating, once it is agreed upon, all other steps follow.

The financing channel tracking focused on tracing the payment. When letters of credit are used, one can assume that the buyer is borrowing from his or her bank. Flow of payment (which is slightly different from financing) received some attention and was easy to graph, mainly because it follows only one of two courses: buyer to seller, or buyer to buyer's bank to seller's bank to seller (the letter of credit). Letters of credit did include relevant comments that dealt with discounts, banking charges, bank office to be used, fees for documentary discrepancies, etc.

No mention was made by students of the promotions channel. On reflection, this channel was given less attention in the course than others. To balance the emphases, the instructor could draw on a source such as Robert Roth's excellent book (Roth 1984) for a detailed discussion of international communications planning. Using Roth's book as a source, students could more easily envision the promotion channel structure and facilitating intermediaries.

The logistics channel received substantial attention. However, product flow was not always covered completely. Often the only information available from the source being interviewed was the documents covering those segments of transportation for which the source was responsible. The typical movement reported was to airport, to overseas airport, to buyer. One student indicated that the exported goods moved first to a consolidator.

The assignment brings into focus most clearly the documentation channel. Possibly that channel represents the greatest learning challenge. Gray and Davies once used the expression "international logistics" to mean "a system in which documentation flows are as much a part of the main logistical flow as flows of product" (Wood et al 1995). Through this project, students became more familiar with a wide variety of documents than they would have from a classroom lecture or textbook description.

Students were expected to produce a set of documents, which they all did. Sources frequently inked out certain data on the documents; most commonly information on the price.

How many documents did the typical report either diagram or mention? On the average, about seven. Here's listing of the documents found by the student research: application for letter of credit, 1; arrival notice, 3; bank draft, 4; brokers/forwarders invoice, 3; cargo clearance permit (Bangkok), 1; cargo manifest, 3; certificate of origin, 6; commercial invoice, 23; container load plan, 1; Customs bond, 2; Customs entry, 8; Customs invoice, 1; delivery receipt, 1; dock receipts, 4; export declaration, 3; export permit, 1; forwarder's cargo receipt, 1; inspection certificate (s), 7; insurance certificate, 5; letter of credit, 12; letter of credit amendment(s), 6; multiple country certificate of origin, 2; ocean, air, or surface bill of lading, 23; packing list, 23; proforma invoice, 1; purchase order, 3; sales confirmation, 2; shipper's letter of instructions, 3; shipping specifications sheet, 1; and vessel manifest, 1.
In a few instances, students indicated that certain documents were used but that the source would not supply a copy. The students were allowed to present a blank sheet of paper, and include whatever information the source would give.

The frequency of the documents found may be of interest because it suggests how much time the instructor should spend describing various documents and their functions. A few observations about the most frequently cited documents:

1. Bills of lading are documentary evidence of title, owned by whomever is named as consignee. They are of significance to an understanding of the "ownership" channel, as well as the logistics channel.

2. The lowly packing list, which has no legal or trade significance, was required in all but one of the examples. It serves as a form of "security blanket."

3. Commercial invoices in international trade are much more comprehensive than domestic trade invoices. The international commercial invoice provides a summary of the entire transaction, going beyond terms of sale and payment to include shipping marks, dates, and remittance instructions.

Two documents found with lesser frequency, letters of credit and export declarations, are worthy of note for other reasons. The letter of credit often contains all the information needed to determine the logistics channel. That's because the document specifies packaging, labelling, vessel line, ports, sailing dates, etc. It also explained the documentation channel since it lists all the needed documents and the point where they must be presented, (e.g. "All documents must be forwarded directly to the Bank of Seoul, Seoul, by one lot, express courier"). The export declaration is required for nearly all exports. However, today larger freight forwarders transmit this data to the Federal Government electronically, and no hard copy is produced. This is one sign of the general move toward electronic data interchange in international logistics.

FedEx, UPS, and DHL now have available software which customers can use to generate all documentation needed for small shipments to many major nations. As this assignment is used in future years, the instructor will have to indicate that these shipments are not acceptable ones for analysis. As freight forwarders begin to use similar software, it may become more challenging for students to find examples of more traditional hard copy documents.

The student researchers' presentation of the work flows was in the form of PERT charts. Some students constructed separate channels for payment, goods movement, and documentation, and then attempted to integrate the three channels into one.

The PERT techniques were used only for purposes of analysis, rather than of management. Ultimately, for management and control purposes, the processes in the various channels must be combined. For example, certain documents are needed to trigger the flow of product. Most students combined processes from several channels and some designated the critical path.

Once one has determined the critical path, there is an additional step: to explore cutting the time of tasks along the critical path. However, to do this, one would need to know the costs of combining functions, or of speeding them up. Students can also be encouraged to explore the strategic implications on inventory and transportation costs of such reductions in time. For example, as this is being written there are many articles in the trade press concerning the development of "fastships" that would cut ocean transit times in half. How much is this time savings worth?

**SUMMARY**

A channels perspective is useful when attempting to analyze the logistics aspect of international transactions. This paper describes a class assignment that required teams of students to take an export or import shipment, and use PERT diagrams to graph the payment, logistics, and documentation channels.

**REFERENCES**


IT'S TIME TO CHART THE FUTURE OF MARKETING EDUCATION

Craig A. Kelley, California State University, 6000 J St., Sacramento, Sacramento, CA 95819-6088, (916) 278-7199

ABSTRACT

Marketing education is facing increasing criticism from a variety of constituency groups. Practitioners question the relevance of the marketing curriculum and academic research. Public policy-makers are concerned about issues such as the cost of operating a university and productivity of faculty. Students are deciding to major in other fields where there is a better chance of getting a job. Environmental trends are having an impact on the structure of marketing education. The purpose of this paper is to explore the impact that criticism and environmental trends will have for the future of marketing education.

INTRODUCTION

Business education, and marketing education specifically, is under assault from a variety of interested groups (Cannon and Sheth 1994). Business practitioners are seriously questioning the relevance of the marketing curriculum. As an example, Wolter (1992) suggested the marketing curriculum emphasizes the development of analytical skills over people skills - speaking, manners, business dress and self-esteem and individual improvement. The marketing curriculum also has been criticized as not focusing enough on job training as is the focus of other professional programs (e.g., nursing) (Scribner 1993).

Public policy-makers are concerned about cost of operating public colleges and universities and the productivity of faculty. Since 1990 the tuition at public institutions has risen at a rate of three times the Consumer Price Index (CPI). Conversely, tuition at private institutions rose only twice as fast as the CPI (Miller 1994). Furthermore, there is a growing public perception that faculty do not teach enough classes and the emphasis on research over teaching needs to be re-examined. In an attempt to address the public's concerns several colleges and universities have implemented new performance standards. Total Quality Management (TQM) is becoming used to assess performance by focusing on the academic process of teaching, research and learning (Dorris and Teeter 1994). TQM is now being implemented by a number of universities including Michigan, Oregon State, Penn State, Colorado State and Kansas.

Students are selecting majors other than marketing where the prospects of getting a job after graduation are much brighter. Rotfeld (1995; 1993) argued the drop in the number of students majoring in marketing is due to the fact that a very low percentage of marketing graduates actually land marketing jobs. In addition, many marketing jobs do not require a marketing degree. Stera et al. (1994) found that marketing positions were at best, near the middle of a distribution of prestige ratings for various occupations. Conclusion—if marketing positions are not prestigious, students will not be attracted to the marketing major.

Through this criticism, marketing educators have begun to search for ways to adapt their programs to what constituency groups will demand in the future. At stake is the long-term structure and role of marketing education. The purpose of this paper is to explore the effect that this criticism, coupled with current environmental trends, will have on the future of marketing education.

CRITICISMS OF MARKETING EDUCATION

There seems to be an endless list of problems faced by marketing education. Berry (1993) identified four broad categories of criticism that require the attention of marketing educators: relevancy, versatility, accountability and globalism. Although these are presented as criticisms, they could be viewed as opportunities as well. Relevancy cuts across much of what marketing educators do. It encompasses the marketing curriculum, academic research, marketing faculty and the service educators provide to business and society.

There exists a real question of whether marketing curricula have remained current with the fast pace of business change. In a world of business accustomed to a quick response to a changing environment, the time it takes to change an academic curriculum may equate to the passage of geologic time. Part of the delay in responding to new trends in marketing is the course approval process instituted by many colleges and universities. Other reasons include the time it takes for a faculty member to develop expertise in an area and the fact that few teaching materials exist in new areas of marketing which serves as a reason not to innovate.
A second issue related to the relevance of marketing education is academic research. Whether the research done in marketing academia is relevant to real world marketing practitioners is a question that many critics ask. To address this concern, Stanton (1988) recommended that academic research needs to emphasize the generation of new concepts and ideas in addition to empirical studies designed to disprove hypotheses. Furthermore, Berry (1993) suggested academic research needs to be directed toward business managers rather than other marketing professors.

The relevance of the preparation of marketing faculty also is questioned. Rudolph (1995) argued most marketing professors lack practical experience in business, do not serve as marketing consultants and are not involved in actual marketing activities. If true, a basic question must be asked, "How can a faculty member teach inexperienced students how to be effective marketers when the faculty member has not stepped outside the classroom him/herself?"

The second category of criticism is versatility. The demographics of most colleges and universities have changed dramatically over the past decade. While the student population becomes more diverse in terms of gender, age and ethnicity, marketing faculty have remained relatively homogeneous (mostly male and caucasian). This has created a challenge for faculty to teach students with potentially different learning styles. Versatility also relates to the use of emerging teaching technologies. Ten years ago, color acetates were the extent of marketing textbook supplements. Today, not only are videotapes available, but multimedia software for class presentations supplement many marketing textbooks.

Accountability is the third category of criticism and it is fast becoming a household word on college campuses. Traditional methods of evaluating faculty performance are argued to be archaic. Productivity, a word borrowed from industry, is being applied as a measure of teaching, research and service (Gilmore and To 1992). Value analysis also is being used by government entities to determine if federally funded educational programs are adding value to society.

The final category of criticism is globalization. Berry (1993) related globalization to the need for the marketing curriculum and academic research to incorporate global perspectives. The global emphasis will continue in the future. However, Stanton (1988) suggested the curriculum needs to guard against becoming too broad and needs to return to courses such as personal selling, sales management and retailing.

**TRENDS**

In addition to the criticism mentioned in the previous section, several environmental trends are helping to shape marketing education as well. First, university enrollments are projected to expand between 1995 and 2004 as the baby echo generation enters their college years (The Wall Street Journal 1992). The surge in enrollment will be quite different from what was experienced in the 1970s and 1980s. The student population will be more ethnically diverse and have come through a public education system (K-12) that has been severely criticized in its own right. What marketing educators are likely to find is a student population who are less prepared academically and socially for college than those who have come before.

The second major trend is the continual development of technology to facilitate classroom instruction and distance learning. Colleges and universities are now offering courses, and in some cases entire programs, on computer via the internet. Improvements in video technology, together with decreasing costs of the technology, are allowing more institutions to offer user-friendly classes to remote locations or to locations that are traditionally in the service area of another institution. The result of such technological change is that marketing programs will have to compete for students against, not only programs within the university (e.g., communications studies), but with marketing programs at other schools.

Declining education budgets is the third major trend that will impact marketing education. Public institutions are being forced to attract more private funds. For example, an objective of the California State University system (CSU) is that 10% of the operating funds of a school must be raised from outside funding sources. The specter of a future of declining budgets will put pressure on maximizing the use of a finite number of faculty by increasing class size and moving faculty to teach in other areas within the university (e.g., psychology, statistics, etc).

Declining budgets also mean fewer faculty will be hired in the future. The lack of hiring, coupled with the fact that a fairly large proportion of marketing faculty will retire in the very near future, has important consequences for the future of marketing education.
Claxton et al., (1993) reported that almost half of the respondents they surveyed planned to retire no later than 1995. Twenty-one percent planned to retire from academia at or before age 50, roughly the same proportion that planned to retire at age 66 (23%). These results suggest the work environment and working relationships of marketing faculty will significantly change in the future.

Lastly, major curricula changes are on the horizon. Many colleges and universities are questioning the reasoning behind specialized education and beginning to emphasize an interdisciplinary curriculum. Cunningham (1995) suggests business schools can be more interdisciplinary by adopting a model to train business students as used by medical schools. The concept of a "teaching hospital" where business students actually work in various management positions and are held accountable for the consequences of their decisions would have a profound impact on how educators prepare their students for business careers.

THE FUTURE OF MARKETING EDUCATION

Given the criticism and environmental trends taking place, what will marketing education in the year 2005 look like? First, a diverse student population will mean that marketing educators will have to infuse cultural differences to a greater extent than what is being done now into marketing programs and course materials. It is possible that different segments of student learn in varying ways. Issues such as right- and left-brain learning (November 1993) and learning style (Frontczak and Rivale 1991) will be of great concern to marketing educators because students will require varying teaching methodologies, both within and between marketing classes.

Innovations in teaching pedagogy will occur as technology continues to change. A classroom of students who meet at the same time and day during the semester may become a thing of the past. In the future it is possible that students will telecommute to a professor's office and other students' homes via two-way interactive video. Successful marketing educators of the future will adapt to new teaching technologies and the challenges they present.

The future also holds that fewer business schools will be needed. The question being asked by public policymakers is whether every campus in a multi-campus public university system needs to offer the same programs. Can costs be reduced by eliminating the duplication of programs and schools? Perhaps this issue is most clearly illustrated when one looks at the CSU. The CSU has 22 campuses, almost all have a business school or business program. Part of the reason why CSU was established was to allow students to get a baccalaureate degree close to their home. However, the historic reason for having so many campuses may no longer valid. Given emerging technologies to deliver programs over long distances and concerns over productivity and efficiency, it is quite possible that schools will be consolidated into only a few campuses.

Fewer schools of business will translate into a reduced need for marketing faculty. Fewer faculty will have an impact on classroom innovation and academic research. Faculty will have to exert greater effort to collaborate with existing faculty across schools of business at different universities rather than collaborate within a specific school of business. In addition, marketing faculty more likely will become business generalists rather than marketing specialists as classes will be taught to a much larger group of students via new technology. Marketing faculty of the future will have to be capable of teaching a wider range of business classes (e.g., finance, human resource management), in addition to a wider range of marketing subjects.

A continued focus on assessment and productivity by university administrators will significantly affect what marketing educators do in the future. Assessment will likely result in the development of new measures of student learning other than a professor's grade distribution. For example, a measure of the value added by the faculty five years after a student graduates may be required. Drives toward increased productivity will likely lead to greater utilization of a campus by implementing classes year-round in the remaining schools of business. This concept has already been adopted by K-12 as an alternative to building more schools. Year-round school has an added benefit of allowing students to complete their degree in a shorter period of time.

Lastly, the end of the tenure system is very possible as further cost controls are implemented. The result of the end of tenure will mean that faculty must continue to sharpen their skills or risk becoming obsolete (and unemployed). However, a consequence of the end of tenure will be a loss of academic freedom and risk-taking.
CONCLUSION

The future of marketing education will be very different from what we know it to be today. Marketing educators must try to predict what the changes will be so that the marketing curriculum will be relevant to students of the future. In terms of forecasting the future, a delphi technique could be used to determine what expert marketing educators see as the shape, form and function of marketing education. It was the intent of this paper to suggest what the future might hold for marketing education and to stimulate marketing educators to begin thinking about how they are going to adapt to the changes and challenges that lay ahead.

REFERENCES


Gilmore, Jeffrey L. and Duc-Le To (1992), "Evaluating Academic Productivity and Quality," New Directions for Institutional Research, Fall, 35-47.

Miller, Margaret A. (1994), "Pressures to Measure Faculty Work," New Directions for Institutional Research, Fall, 5-14.


ABSTRACT
The remainder of the 1990's pose a challenge for business schools, and specifically marketing departments, in terms of attracting both the number and quality of undergraduate students necessary to produce competitive graduates. Indeed, the percentage of college freshmen indicating business as their planned major dropped from a high of nearly 27% in 1986 to 14% in 1993 (Green 1993). After several decades of slow but steady increases in the quality of students (measured by SAT scores and high school GPA's) entering business school programs, the 1990's has witnessed a reversal of this trend.

Marketing the Major
It is time to apply what is known about marketing to recruiting more and stronger marketing majors. These applications include an emphasis on gaining early access to the student applicant pool, impacting applicant and student awareness and interest in marketing as a career, reducing barriers to matriculation and graduation from the major, and building predictable links to the job market and professional career ladder for students in various stages of selecting marketing as a career.

Strategic Educational Alliances
Building strategic alliances both across campus and with partners outside the university, including other educational providers and industry, is seen as a key tactic in accomplishing the above. Strategic partners in this regard might include the science and engineering disciplines, as well as the arts and humanities ("Learning ..." 1994). Initiatives could be developed with the objective of creating minors and joint majors.

Strategic alliances with other campus units such as student advisement, student recruitment, and placement could also contribute to raising the awareness of and interest in marketing as a major and career. Marketing departments need to take a proactive approach in developing materials for use by such campus units and in establishing strong relationships with professionals engaged in these campus outreach and service units.

Strategic alliances beyond the campus are also called for. These might include jointly developed transfer and advising programs with community colleges and high schools, as well as partnerships with area businesses associations and corporations. The basic message that "marketing is where the action is" needs to be spread throughout all these potential communication channels.

REFERENCES

MARKETING ENTERPRISE

David Bagley, Enterprise Unit, University of Central Lancashire, Preston, United Kingdom PR1 2HE
Tel 011 - 44 - 1772 0 893864 Fax 011 - 44 - 1772 - 892918.

This paper covers the background and impact of the Enterprise in Higher Education program at a teaching university in the UK (University of Central Lancashire). Government funding of $1,500,000 was obtained for a 5 year project intended to improve the long term employability of graduates by developing "enterprising graduates with a knowledge of the world of work". The project funding is from September 1991 to August 1996.

By the end of the funding period students should:
- have a positive attitude towards Enterprise activity
- have developed personal transferable Enterprise skills
- be better informed about employment opportunities, aims and challenges and make better career choices
- be better prepared to contribute to, and take responsibility in their professional and working lives.

Four strands of activity were defined comprising:
- student involvement
- employer involvement
- curriculum development
- staff development.

Each year, members of the University were invited to bid for funding for innovative projects. This produced over 200 bids of which about 70 have been funded at a cost of $400,000.

Some examples of Enterprise funded projects are:

1) Students in the Lancashire Business School have produced a materials pack which is distributed to all students on business programs. The pack, which is accompanied by a promotional video, is designed to help students to develop their Personal, Academic Vocational and Enterprise skills and was developed as part of their assessed program.

2) A group including marketing and computer science students have formed a business with Enterprise support. They have had considerable success marketing educational software.

3) Management Faculty have developed a simulation exercise based upon the management of a hospital which is used as a key assessment for graduating majors in management.

4) Opportunities have been created for students to gain credit for learning undertaken in their place of work as well as on campus.

By the end of the funding period in September 1996, students on all courses at University of Central Lancashire will have been affected by the Enterprise project. A large number of students will undertake live projects to an agreed brief for a client organisation, work based learning will be much more in evidence and available to students, portfolio methods of assessment will be used widely across the University. Employers will be engaged much more closely in the work of the University and in kind contributions from employers will have amounted to over £1 million. Teaching, learning and assessment methods have changed dramatically with a much stronger emphasis upon student centered learning and more practical assignments incorporating the assessment of personal transferable skills.

Reaction to the project from students has been extremely favourable. Undergraduates are well aware of the difficulties they will face in the labour market of the future and they are grateful for any assistance in developing an edge over competitors for jobs. Employers too recognise the success of the project as do many of the teaching faculty.

Furthermore, the proportion of University of Central Lancashire graduates remaining unemployed six months after graduation has been falling, counter to the national trend. It is difficult to impute causality but it is strongly suspected that our focus upon employability has been a factor in this trend.

Nevertheless, as in USA some employers continue to complain about lack of relevance. The author suggests that some reasons for this are conflicting needs of employers in different industrial segments and a lack of sophistication among some employers together with a continuing lack of relevance in some areas of higher education.
INTEGRATING THE INTRODUCTORY MBA COURSES: THE ROLE OF MARKETING

Seth R. Ellis
Diane D. Pattison
University of San Diego
San Diego, CA 92110 (619) 260-4600

ABSTRACT
The professional business community has called for change in the educational process. To meet the call we designed and implemented a course titled Integrated Business Concepts and Techniques. This fifteen unit course is intended to be the first course taken in our MBA program. The purpose of this paper is to present the role of marketing in this context. We discuss our basic design, the role of marketing, and some of the marketing and pedagogical issues we encountered.

INTEGRATING FUNCTIONAL CURRICULUM
The professional business community has called for change in the educational process (Brownell and Jameson 1985) (Chief Executive 1993) (Foggin 1992) (Sheridan 1993) (Watkins 1993). Managers are operating in environments where economic pressures are strong and resources are scarce. Industry leaders recognize that a traditional functional orientation is not nimble enough in environments where time to market can be a critical priority. Furthermore, cross-functional teams may be key to an organization's success or failure (Kaeter 1993).

The American Assembly of Collegiate Schools of Business (AACSB) has called for change. The preamble to the AACSB Guide to Achieving Accreditation "challenges schools to pursue continuous improvement...one of accreditation's guiding principles is the tolerance and even encouragement, of diverse paths to achieving high quality in management education... The curriculum should integrate the core area and apply cross-functional approaches to organizational issues (American Assembly of Collegiate Schools of Business 1993)."

To meet this call for change, six faculty members, representing six functional areas, designed and implemented a course titled Integrated Business Concepts and Techniques (IBCT). This course is the introductory course in our MBA program for those students with non-business undergraduate degrees.

There were three primary motivations for developing the IBCT course. Students are unprepared for the realities of the modern business world (Skousen and Bertelsen 1994). Further, several universities have seen success with similar courses [see (Ehrhardt 1992) (Foggin 1992) (Massingale and Dewhurst 1992) (Reeve 1992) (Russell 1992) for a good example of the efforts of another university]. We believed an integrated course would address many of the professional world's concerns, finally, we desired to be innovative and make a good program even better.

INTEGRATED BUSINESS CONCEPTS AND TECHNIQUES COURSE DESIGN
Our university has maintained a traditional MBA program for more than twenty years, with a current enrollment of about 500 students. Six functional courses are required of the non-business undergraduate prior to beginning the formal MBA course work. These core courses cover accounting information and managerial decisions, managerial economics, operations management, managerial marketing, managerial finance, and the social and legal environment of business.

Course Construction
We believe the course should provide: (1) an integrated conceptual foundation on which to build each student's graduate program, (2) an understanding of how modern organizations develop their strategies in a world of uncertainty, (3) an understanding of the role of structure in achieving the organization's goals and objectives, (4) an opportunity to gain competence in the use of common business tools and procedures, (5) an opportunity to gain experience in the development and operation of cross-functional teams, and (6) an opportunity to improve oral and written communication skills.

Our first objective was to make sure we had topics from each functional area integrated throughout the course. However, providing a line of continuity throughout the entire course presented a daunting challenge. Our solution was to develop a single integrated case.

Honda of America permitted us access to corporate data and management practices. The faculty created a fictional consulting firm, the Alcala Consulting Group (ACG), to permit the interface between a supplier
company and Honda. Students in the class entered the employ of this consulting organization, and the faculty played the role of senior partners. In the scenario presented to the students, ACG had been hired by a fictional semiconductor firm called Kettering Systems to analyze a potential opportunity with Honda. Kettering Systems believed Honda was about to extend an offer for Kettering to provide a computer chip that would increase the gasoline efficiency in sport utility vehicles. This context was used as an integrating framework for the functional subject matter.

Primarily, the course would be organized around assessments and decisions that managers in organizations must make. We designed four one-month long sections, each of which built upon the material and experiences from the one previous to it.

The first section is named Strategy I. The objective is to conduct a high level assessment of markets, competitors, corporate strengths and weaknesses, value chains, opportunities and threats. The required output is to perform a corporate level SWOT, recommend what markets and products the firm should be concerned with, and define the critical success factors in those selected product markets. The faculty team provides an overview of corporate history, ethics, values and corporate culture, long range strategic forecasting methods, and various international aspects. In addition, the teams receive instruction to develop their written and oral presentation skills.

The objective of the second section, Strategy II, is to examine the strategies and capabilities of the various business functions (marketing, finance, accounting, operations, procurement and human resources) within the organization in order to determine whether the firm would be able to succeed in the future. The required output is a detailed, functional level SWOT and recommendations for changes to functional level strategies required to improve the odds for success in the selected product market. Information provided by the faculty includes marketing theory, economic optimization, risk analysis, cost analysis and estimation, promotion techniques, and pricing strategies.

The objective of the third section, Structure, is to assess the existing organizational structure and infrastructure and recommend changes likely to improve chances for achieving the functional and corporate strategies defined in previous sections. The structures examined include the accounting system, financial structure, employee compensation, incentive and evaluation systems, management information systems, and operations systems. The output required is a recommendation of structural changes that will allow the firm successfully to implement its strategies. The faculty presents information on organizational structures, managerial accounting systems, capital budgeting methodologies, supply systems, managerial information systems, and operations management.

The final section's objective, Implementation, completes the transition from the strategic to the tactical. By now, corporate and functional strategies are well-defined, structural weaknesses or barriers revealed, and plans made for correcting the weaknesses. Outputs required of the students are tactical decisions that will allow the firm to successfully develop its business. The faculty team provides information on product selection criteria, product design, incremental capital structure decisions, make or buy assessments, and performance assessment.

THE ROLE OF MARKETING

The marketing concept provided the thread that tied together most facets of the integration. Students were indoctrinated in the idea of a customer orientation from the first day of the course. The marketing system context was variously described in terms of networks of customers and suppliers, in terms of value chains, and in terms of keiretsus. The goal of each firm in the system was described as a total company effort aimed at achieving customer satisfaction at a profit. Thus, the marketing concept served as a benchmark against which to measure the specific firms involved in the context of the course. Are all of the functional areas at these firms seemingly engaged in a customer orientation, and are all of the systems at these firms likewise engaged? The extent to which the students find congruence between the firm's systems and structures and the marketing concept allowed them to develop a foundation from which to assess potentially damaging issues.

The Product Market Context

There were two contextual product markets that the students investigated: the automotive semiconductor market, and the sport utility vehicle (SUV) market. The hypothetical situation given to the students was to assess whether it would be in Kettering Systems' best business interests to begin a relationship as a component supplier to Honda of America. To understand whether this relationship might make sense depended on a grasp of both product markets. Thus, the second major section was built around an in-depth analysis of the SUV market, a review of the automotive semiconductor market, and a study of the relationships between the two.
This analysis provided the pull for topics in all of the traditional marketing mix variables. The students had to develop an understanding of the current SUV market: its size, its growth rate, where the product class might be in terms of the product life cycle, the segments involved, the basis of segmentation criteria, and so on. Having just completed an econometric analysis of the entire automobile market as a requirement for the micro-economics portion of the curriculum, they were able to use some of those tools to build market forecasts for the SUV market.

Secondary research into the sport utility vehicle market provided the students with a host of demographic materials. Using this material as a basis, the students also developed a portfolio of promotion materials about SUV’s in order to construct some thick descriptions of the psychographic profiles of various market segments. The demographic information, combined with study of SUV promotion materials, allowed inferences about the nature of the segments. By attempting to map these profiles to the psychographic clusters available from Equifax MicroVision™ materials, the students could estimate the size of potential markets. With other secondary research, the students could begin to understand the level of penetration achieved so far. From that they could begin to infer where the SUV market was positioned with respect to the product life cycle. Perhaps they might even estimate when maturity might occur.

With sources obtained by exploring Internet WWW sites, the students were able to accumulate pricing information regarding 128 different SUV models! Coupled with the concurrent information being delivered to them about the nature of demand and elasticity from the micro-economics curriculum, they were able to construct an analysis of the kinds of pricing models utilized in this product market. Typically, students take the foundation course in micro-economics and then seem to promptly forget most of its content. However, some of the pricing strategies in the marketing curriculum (such as profit maximizing strategies) are, of course, inextricably linked to micro-economic concepts like marginal analysis. Integrated in this fashion, the students were able to use the theoretical economic underpinnings in a marketing context to help them understand what was happening in the SUV market. They were also able to gain an appreciation of some of the limitations of the economists’ ceteris paribus assumptions. Of course, marketers understand that much of what they do is subsumed within the ceteris paribus assumptions.

These market analyses gave the students a context from which to construct marketing strategies for the fictitious Kettering Systems. It quickly became apparent that there was not a simple fit between the relatively low volume production required for Honda vehicles in the SUV market vis-à-vis the expense of an R&D effort to develop a new semiconductor. This forced the students to construct some strategic options for the firm beyond the obvious. In turn, this lead to issues in product development, product management, and marketing strategy. An amazing aspect of this approach to learning is that these students were grappling with a complex marketing situation after only six weeks of MBA school.

The charm of this particular context for marketing pedagogy is that the students had to develop an understanding of consumer behavior models as they related to the SUV market as well as develop an understanding of the business to business marketing concepts at play between Honda and Kettering Systems.

Distribution and logistics considerations also came into play both strategically and tactically. The students contemplated the implementation of various strategic options such as deciding how to best produce, inventory, and ship chips to the Honda assembly plant where the permissible just-in-time windows are only fifteen minutes wide for incoming parts.

ISSUES ENCOUNTERED

Overall, we were pleased with the results but a series of issues surfaced that warranted our attention. Although there were issues in a number of categories, we focus here on those most directly related to marketing pedagogy.

Workload

A phenomenon that occurred to some extent for each of the faculty was the desire to ensure that all of the traditional core functional material was included in this course. In part, this resulted from a desire to maintain the same level of rigor as in the functionally oriented approach, and to provide a comprehensive view of each functional discipline.

It became quickly apparent that there was too much material to place in a one semester offering. In addition, the particular case context we chose was not conducive to the incorporation of every aspect of the functional material. For example, the distribution variable in the marketing mix was not as easily addressed as product and pricing variables were. Also, to some extent, the context did not lend itself to a comprehensive investigation of promotion. On a positive note, we
had to think hard about what material was really critical for the student. The number of marketing topics addressed in the textbooks continues to proliferate, but the length of a semester remains constant. Thus, all marketing instructors face this same issue, and it becomes an issue of depth vs. breadth. With respect to the marketing aspects in this course, we attempted to strive for depth in the critical and basic marketing areas vs. a survey of a large variety of topics. Also, the context of the case also was a driver towards depth instead of breadth.

**Information Overload & Expectations**

The students quickly amassed a tremendous amount of information about the SUV market through online database searches from both traditional library sources and Internet sources. Their problem was one of winnowing through this huge amount of information in order to find appropriate material. This led us to glimpses of several interesting phenomena. This kind of research was new for these students, and as a result, they didn't have a good grasp of what it was they should be looking for. They also didn't have much ability to perform sophisticated online searches, thus they tended to accumulate far too much material. This massive quantity of information rapidly became overwhelming and lead almost to paralysis on the part of some students. Although this project had a six week time horizon, the students tended to procrastinate because they didn't understand the enormity of the task. As a result the teams had to push very hard to finish their report on time.

As a result, the reports tended to be overly large and replete with many obvious mechanical, typographical, and grammar errors. One of the teams presented a report in excess of 160 pages. The reports tended to be descriptive instead of analytic and synthetic. We found that the students had little experience in effective project management and rather rudimentary analytic skills. In addition, their skills for synthesis were almost non-existent. Of course, these skills are some of the primary objectives for most MBA programs: to foster the abilities of analysis, synthesis and critical thinking.

If the students were provided with a limited set of information they may have been able to spend more time thinking about the it rather than sifting through it. On the other hand, that approach would not have given them the valuable opportunity of performing an in-depth piece of secondary research. We have not yet decided on an optimum way to resolve this issue.

Another interesting phenomenon relevant to marketing was a marked tendency for the students to resist making inferences about the future. One of the section requirements was to estimate the date of maturity and the commensurate unit volume at maturity in the SUV market. Students had learned to make linear forecasts with the help of unsophisticated econometric models, and they understood that this linearity was only appropriate for some specific relevant range. However, they were very uncomfortable with inferring where and when the slope of the product life cycle would decay. We don't know if this was a particular phenomenon of our group or if this is a larger difficulty with beginning MBA students. Perhaps it is related to their lack of analytic skills, let alone their synthetic skills. They also never thought to investigate other similar automobile product classes that might have served as surrogate models for the basic structure of the SUV market.

Although the concurrent integration of the micro-economic underpinnings with the marketing applications of the theory was useful for demonstrating the value of the economics, it was sometimes problematic for effectively demonstrating its use in marketing. The students generally seem to need more time to digest big new concepts like demand and elasticity. By quickly moving to how these concepts were useful in pricing and promotion activities, we tended to overwhelm the students. They understood the value of the material, but had not had enough time to digest it, contemplate it, and then implement it in a marketing context.

**Push Versus Pull Learning**

We attempted to shift from a push system to a pull system for student learning. We originally defined four integrated projects in such a way that they would intrinsically create demand on the part of the students for the necessary knowledge. However, the students didn't have any idea what to ask for. This may be a fundamental flaw in our course design. We believed that by assigning a set of requirements for a section, the students would ask to learn about the skills and tools necessary for the successful completion of a project. The problem, clear enough in hindsight, is that the students do not have enough business acumen at this point in their MBA program to have any idea of what it is they should be demanding from the faculty. Thus, we reverted to pushing what we believed was the necessary information. Oftentimes, the students could not even relate a particular tool, skill or presentation to its implications for the section! One solution for this issue is a much more detailed brief outlining the requirements for the section project.
Course Perceptions

Although the participating students were enrolled in the equivalent of a heavy, full-time course load (eighteen credit hours), they still perceived the entire experience as just one course. Their frame of reference, based on undergraduate experience, is mostly in terms of three- unit courses. In addition, this is their first experience with graduate school, and their workload is appropriately greater at this level than at the undergraduate level. As a result, the students perceived an intense state of work overload incongruent with their perception of the workload associated with just one course. This was further aggravated by the fact that many of their peers were finding much more time to spend at the beach. In our zeal to integrate the entire functional core over one semester, we created a workload that, in reality, probably was too much work for all but the most dedicated and gifted students.

CONCLUSION

Hundreds of hours were spent designing and teaching the Integrated Business Concepts and Techniques course. We believe an integrated approach is necessary for the fulfillment of modern graduate business education requirements. Clearly, this trial course offering was not without its problems but we regard this type of integrated course structure as a path to the future. The marketing component was much more easily woven into the structure of the course than was some of the other functional material. It was heartening to watch students quickly adopt the marketing concept as the only paradigm that makes sense. The marketing concept was, in a sense, the organizing principle for the entire integration. Although the transition to an integrated curriculum is proving more difficult than we expected, we remain confident that the students will depart with a higher level of sophistication about the realities of modern business than they would have if they completed a series of traditional functional courses.

REFERENCES


THE FOURTH GENERATION MARKETING CURRICULUM: MEETING AACSB's 50-50 RULE

Steven Pharr, University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho, 83844-3178, (208-885-5750)
Linda Morris, University of Idaho, Moscow, Idaho, 83844-3178, (208-885-7159)

ABSTRACT

The decade of the 90's poses some tough challenges for Business schools. In 1992 AACSB noted that "a crisis is at hand and ...survival is a key issue." (AACSB, 1992). Business schools will face constrained budgets, pressures for increased productivity, lower enrollments, and increased regulation and oversight. As the traditional college student market decreases, adopting the marketing concept will become more important. One reason may be that non-business majors do as well as, or better than, business majors in the job market. Employers want students who have problem solving, communication, and 'learning to learn' skills acquired through a broad and deep curriculum (Kearns, 1989). Business schools have been criticized for teaching in functional "silos," failing to recognize that disciplinary boundaries in organizations are fuzzy and career paths often cross these boundaries (Alden et al., 1991). AACSB has responded by mandating the 50-50 Rule (Mason, 1995). While these guidelines pose additional challenges for business schools, they also provide new opportunities for re-engineering business curriculums.

Historically, marketing education has evolved through three generations. First-generation marketing (1950-1965) presented management practices and provided practical materials (Gordon & Howell, 1959). The second generation (1960-1975) focused on conceptual depth, incorporating fundamental disciplines such as social psychology and statistics (Hancock and Bell, 1970). Third-generation marketing curricula (1970 to present) integrated the first and second generations. In response to recommendations like those of Alden et al. (1994), Porter and McKibbin (1988) and the 50-50 Rule, the fourth-generation is now evolving. It involves an interdisciplinary and cross-functional approach to preparing students for "imaginative and responsible citizenship and leadership roles in business and society--domestic and worldwide" (AACSB, 1988). Conceptually, there are two approaches to meeting the AACSB 50-50 rule: reduce the required accounting, business and economics courses, or increase the required outside courses. The first allows greater flexibility in course selection, enabling a minor or double major within a reasonable time frame. Reducing required business-related courses could be achieved by reducing requirements for the common business core, or the specific majors. Reducing the business core would leave the major requirements intact but weaken the general business background. If requirements for the major are reduced, the opposite would occur. Both would result in a "watering down" of the degree. It would also ignore concerns of the business community. Increasing outside requirements has its benefits. It maintains the core and major requirements and strengthens the major through a judicious selection of nonbusiness courses.

To bring the University of Idaho marketing program into compliance with the 50-50 rule and practitioner demands, a hybrid approach was developed that increased both required business and nonbusiness courses. It involved the college-wide adoption of an integrated business core program, and additional marketing major requirements in accounting, communications, and nonbusiness marketing electives. The new major addresses practitioner concerns regarding depth of understanding, integration of business functions, and communication skills. The non-business electives and communications course also allow the marketing major to meet the 50-50 rule. For students, the new major provides greater flexibility in creating a marketing major to match their own interests. However, it reduces the number of free electives available, thus completing a minor becomes more difficult.

As marketing programs are restructured to facilitate learning, faculty must also learn new content and pedagogical approaches. Faculty will likely work in teams might to deal with complex, multi-faceted cases and concepts. The emerging "metasciences" arising from interdisciplinary and cross-functional integration are the future of marketing education.

References and figures available upon request.
THE NEED TO INCLUDE WRITING A SALES PROPOSAL IN THE MARKETING CURRICULUM: AN EXPLORATION

Regina P. Schlee, School of Business and Economics, Seattle Pacific University, Seattle, WA 98119 (206-281-3638)
Gary L. Karns, School of Business and Economics, Seattle Pacific University, Seattle, WA 98119 (206-281-2948)
James Korner, Director of University Services, Seattle Pacific University, Seattle, WA 98119 (206-281-2752)

ABSTRACT

This article explores how business to business selling, especially in the service sector, has changed over time to include a formal proposal as an important selling tool. An exploratory study was conducted through a series of in-depth interviews with managers in a broad range of service organizations and a small sample of marketing faculty teaching courses in Sales Management. Most of the business professionals interviewed reported that submitting a comprehensive proposal or a written capabilities presentation was the primary means used to obtain new clients. A proposal allows service businesses to differentiate themselves from competitors both in terms of their understanding of industry conditions and their ability to provide effective solutions to their client's needs. But, while there are strong indicators that those selling services to businesses are increasingly using proposals, this trend is not reflected in most sales, sales management and marketing management texts or in Sales Management courses. Thus, there is a need to incorporate proposal writing in the curriculum to help prepare students to be effective as marketing professionals.

INTRODUCTION

This paper focuses on current marketing practices in business to business selling. We conducted ten in-depth interviews with managers employed in a broad range of service industries and found that many of their business transactions necessitate the submission of a comprehensive document outlining all the elements of service they will receive. The document submitted can have a different name depending on the industry. In most cases it is referred to as a proposal. In advertising and public relations, however, it is also referred to as a capabilities presentation or communications plan.

While the submission of a proposal in business to business selling is a common occurrence, we believe that marketing students are not receiving adequate training in the preparation of proposals. Proposals are usually discussed very briefly, if at all, in most Selling or Sales Management texts (Chonko, Ennis, and Tanner, Jr. 1992; Churchill, Ford, and Walker 1993; Dalrymple and Cron 1995; Furtrell 1993, 1994; Johnson, Kurtz and Scheuing 1994; Manning and Reese 1995). Similarly, most Marketing Management texts include one to three paragraphs on the topic of proposals at most (Cohen 1991; Kotter 1994). Kotler (1994, p. 217) states, however, that "business marketers must be skilled in researching, writing, and presenting proposals. Their proposals must be marketing documents, not just technical documents." Even Marketing Research texts do not generally address the issue of proposals at any length (Aaker, Kumar and Day 1995; McDaniel and Gates 1993; Tull and Hawkins 1993). The textbooks which include a discussion of proposals generally mention that proposals are used in business to business selling and list some typical issues addressed in proposals. There is generally no instruction given on preparing proposals. Similarly, we found no mention of the preparation of proposals in any articles in the Journal of Marketing Education or the WMEA Proceedings in the past few years.

Instead, all Sales, Sales Management and Marketing Management texts discuss the selling process. All stages of the selling process are presented from prospecting and qualifying, to planning the sales presentation, building rapport, delivering the sales presentation, closing the sale, and servicing the account. Most textbooks, however, assume that most of the selling process will be done orally. Discussions of sales support materials submitted before or during the presentation generally focus on brochures about the company and its products as well as some technical product information. Textbooks also indicate that in business-to-business selling, companies often enhance sales presentations by providing various sales aids (displays with graphs, pictures, signs, etc.) After the presentation a contract or bid including itemized costs for the company's products or services is submitted.
Among Sales Management texts only Weitz, Castleberry and Tanner's *Selling: Building Partnerships* (1992) includes a more detailed discussion of proposals. These authors take about three pages to discuss the writing of proposals as an important part of the selling process in today's business climate. Weitz, Castleberry and Tanner examine the process of receiving a letter of Request for Proposal (RFP) and present the typical contents of a sales proposal. Among Marketing Research texts, Mulhotra (1993) provides the most extensive treatment of proposals. He devotes about a page to proposals and includes a list of elements found in most marketing research proposals.

An exploratory survey among five professors who teach Sales Management courses also revealed that the topic of sales proposals is not extensively covered in the Sales Management curriculum. The professors interviewed indicated that they do not spend much time on the topic of sales proposals. Similarly, none of the professors surveyed required students to complete any assignments on the topic of sales proposals. Instead, most Sales Management course assignments focus on the planning of sales calls and developing sales presentations.

In contrast to academic textbooks and curriculum in Sales Management courses, the topic of proposals is discussed in several trade books available in the business section of large book stores. Most of these trade books provide practical step-by-step instructions on how to develop sales proposals (Holtz 1990; Freed, Freed and Romano 1995). Thus, most marketing professionals probably learn how to prepare sales proposals either from trade books they purchase after graduation or from on-the-job training. This unsystematic approach to learning how to prepare proposals may be responsible for the perception among faculty teaching Sales Management that proposals tend to be "idiosyncratic" and specific to various industries. If the preparation of sales proposals was taught in the marketing curriculum as is the preparation of marketing plans, the format of sales proposals may become more systematized as is the format of marketing plans. Our research, in fact, indicates that there are more similarities among the sales proposals submitted than many marketing faculty assume. Furthermore, since there are enough indicators that proposals are often necessary in business to business selling, marketing students should be taught some of the fundamentals of proposal writing in Marketing Management as well as Sales Management courses. It may even be appropriate to include a short assignment in proposal writing in Principles of Marketing courses.

**DISCUSSION**

Our exploratory study on the usage and format of sales proposals is based on a series of depth interviews with ten mid and upper level managers employed in university administration, advertising, public relations, public accounting, investment services, architectural services, and marketing research in the Puget Sound area. All of these managers had a broad range of experiences in their industries, and had worked in managerial capacities for two or more employers. Seven of those interviewed worked for mid or large size businesses, while three worked for smaller businesses. While our sample size is small, the responses we obtained reflect a great deal of homogeneity within each grouping of businesses in the practice of submitting proposals in service industries selling business to business. To perform an analysis of content and format of proposals, we examined ten proposals submitted within the past two years. Additional information on the content and format of proposals was obtained through the depth interviews.

Most of the managers we interviewed who were employed in mid-sized or larger businesses indicated that both the use and scope of proposals had increased in the past ten years. In many industries, proposals are the cornerstone of the selling process. Sales presentations are typically built around a previously submitted written proposal. The proposal serves as a permanent document that can be reviewed at a later date and is used as the basis for creating a specific contract. In spite of the time and effort spent in preparing proposals, many companies do not consider them as the final document submitted to a prospective client, but the beginning of a process of refinement of proposed goals and the negotiation of prices and a timeline for service delivery. Thus, proposals serve as a focal point for negotiations in terms of desired services, prices, and timelines.

Managers working for smaller service firms provided us with a different description of the selling process. Those managers tended to submit fewer and shorter proposals. Two indicated that if someone asks them for a proposal, they expect that the likelihood of getting that business is very low. As the manager of a small public relations firm told us: "why submit a proposal for a piece of business you know you are not
going to get?" Instead, smaller business managers try to develop closer relationships with their clients so that their business relationship is built on trust rather than on the parameters outlined in a proposal.

**Characteristics of Proposals**

A significant part of our interviews focused on the specific characteristics of proposals, more specifically on the content of the proposal, the length, the selling strategy, the appearance of the document, and the requirements for confidentiality. While there was variability among our respondents, there were some common themes that emerged with regard to all these features.

**Content.** Although the sample of proposals we examined was not large enough to do a quantitative analysis of the ordering and frequency of different sections, there was a certain core of areas which tended to be discussed in many of the proposals regardless of the industry of the seller. These core sections are also discussed in trade books on proposal writing (Holtz 1990; Freed, Freed, and Romano 1995).

A. Unique qualifications of the company submitting the proposals.
B. Gratitude for being asked to submit a proposal, eagerness to work with the potential client.
C. Overview of industry conditions.
D. More detailed history of the selling firm.
E. Specific experience in the industry.
F. Identification of the client’s needs.
G. Proposed solution to the client’s needs.
H. Proposed methodologies to serve the client’s needs.
I. Additional needs that could be met by the seller’s proposal.
J. Technological advances that enable the seller to serve their clients’ needs better, quicker, or cheaper.
K. Quality control.
L. Operational standards and procedures.
M. Qualifications of members of the seller’s service team.
N. Scheduling and timeline of project.
O. Proposed budget and terms of payment.

**Size:** The size of the proposal varies with the size of the business submitting the document, the size of the account sought, and the complexity of the needs. The largest proposals submitted by the individuals we interviewed were up to 100 pages. Some of the proposals submitted by large companies include enormous amounts of "boiler plated" material. The proposal is then customized by including the prospective client’s name, logo, and may even include photographs of the prospective client’s facility or product. Smaller companies tended to submit shorter proposals, often as brief as 4 to 10 pages.

**Selling Strategy:** The proposals we examined varied depending on the area of service industry targeted as well as the selling approach used by each firm. Generally, when a company was responding to an RFP, if it felt it had a unique solution to the client’s problem, it would place a great deal of emphasis on the proposed solution. If, however, the proposal submitted did not include a unique solution, emphasis would be placed on the characteristics of the company submitting the proposal. Such proposals often included many pages which lauded the distinctive competencies and characteristics of the seller.

**Confidentiality:** Our respondents indicated that most of the proposals submitted by their companies, or submitted to them by others were confidential. Companies differed in the extent to which they stressed the confidential nature of the information included in the proposal. Some companies include specific references to specific legal statutes protecting the confidentiality of the information submitted in the proposal. Others have a section where the prospective client is asked to sign a confidentiality agreement. The subject of confidentiality of proposals is also discussed in Holtz (1990).

**Appearance:** The packaging of the proposal varies according to the size of the firm submitting the proposal as well as the expected size of the contract. Some of the larger company proposals we examined appeared to spare no expense in trying to impress a potential client. These proposals often include color graphics and photographs. Some sellers even include expensive binders decorated with colorful graphic designs and the seller’s logo. Proposals submitted by smaller companies tended to be plainer and included primarily text and numerical tables.

Most of the people we interviewed admitted that proposals had become increasingly more polished in recent years. A respondent who had worked as a manager in public accounting and was now a manager in an investment firm noted that a few years ago if you had a graphics package and a laser printer, you impressed potential clients. Now color graphics, color photos, and color copies were necessary to generate the same effect.
Advantages and Disadvantages of Proposals

Our respondents discussed at length what they felt were the advantages and disadvantages of submitting a proposal over submitting a simple itemized bid when trying to get a new piece of business. Respondents working for larger companies tended to believe that the advantages of proposals were so overwhelming, the disadvantages seemed insignificant. Respondents working for smaller companies felt that some times the disadvantages of submitting a proposal overwhelmed the advantages.

Advantages of proposals

1. Proposals allow companies to expand at length on their distinctiveness. In a proposal, companies can showcase not only their products, but their mission, history, and experience. Proposals can also include detailed information that sellers may not want to include in an oral presentation because it is tedious, or because time limits have been placed on their presentation.

2. In situations where many companies competing for a piece of business, individuals making up the “buying center” may forget or confuse some of the claims made by each presenter. Proposals represent a tangible element that can be examined in greater detail later.

3. The amount of effort spent in producing a proposal shows a prospective client the seller’s willingness to work with them.

Disadvantages of Proposals

Submitting a proposal also has some disadvantages. The managers we interviewed were concerned about the following:

1. Proposals are costly. Preparing a proposal takes up precious employee time and company resources. Costs can be minimized by standardizing substantial portions of the proposal. Nevertheless, for some small businesses the cost of preparing a proposal prevents them from going after some accounts.

2. Proposals sometimes contain a lot of sensitive financial or competitive positioning information which may eventually fall in the hands of a competitor. Similarly, a proposal contains a company’s unique ideas for solving a specific business problem. If the company is not hired, its unique solution may be given to a competitor. Companies try to minimize the possibility that the information from a proposal will find its way into a competitor’s hands by stating that the information is confidential.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Although this exploratory study is based on a small sample of respondents, there is enough information to conclude that the use of proposals is common place in many business to business transactions. In fact, over the past ten years both the frequency of submitting proposals and the complexity of the proposals have increased. There are many advantages to submitting a proposal to accompany a bid. A proposal provides a more lasting and extensive presentation of the company’s positioning statement than an oral presentation accompanied by a bid. An extensive proposal can also be viewed as a company’s indication that it is willing to work hard to develop a lasting professional relationship between the two companies.

Sales Management, Selling, and Marketing Management textbooks should devote more emphasis to proposals as a selling tool. Similarly, marketing classes should devote more attention to the writing of proposals. Students should be taught how to organize proposals and how to sell their company in writing. Emphasis should be placed on presenting their company as having “added value” as a service provider for their clients. Student assignments could focus on the list of topics usually found in proposals that were outlined earlier. Students may formulate proposals based on an analysis of the positioning of different firms in an industry. Another possible assignment may involve the professor providing background information on a hypothetical client’s industry as well as the some general characteristics of service providers in that industry. Groups of students may then submit competing proposals aimed at selling their services to the hypothetical client.

We also believe that additional research should be conducted in the topic of proposal writing. The primary hindrance to conducting an extensive quantitative study on sales proposals will be the confidential nature of most proposals. Given the sensitive nature of much of the information included in a proposal it may be very difficult to obtain a larger sample of proposals for quantitative analysis.

REFERENCES AVAILABLE UPON REQUEST
DEVELOPING A BUSINESS-BASED ADVERTISING MANAGEMENT PROGRAM
IN UNDERGRADUATE SCHOOLS

Leonardo R. Garcia Jr.
De La Salle University
2401 Taft Ave., Manila, Philippines
Fax: (632) 521-90-94

ABSTRACT

This study solicits feedback among advertising practitioners on the BSC-Advertising Management Program of De La Salle University. The objectives were to determine their various reactions and to evaluate whether DSLU made the right move in offering a business-based advertising program.

A descriptive method was employed through a survey questionnaire purposely mailed to top executives of the industry. Based on the results, the major conclusion showed that the University, by offering a business-based advertising program, was responsive to the needs of the advertising practitioners. The curriculum offered subjects that were relevant and up-to-date. They made clear, however, that for the program to succeed, the skills that should be enhanced are the students’ creative thinking, oral communication, and planning skills; and that the program needs a creative teacher who is a practitioner himself.

INTRODUCTION

Nearly everyone in the modern world is influenced to some degree by advertising and other forms of promotion. Organizations in both the private and public sectors have learned that the ability to communicate effectively and efficiently with target audiences is critical to their success. Most of the people involved in advertising and promotion will tell you that this marketing communications field is such a very dynamic and fascinating field to either practice or study. However, they will also tell you that the field is undergoing dramatic changes that threaten to change advertising and promotion forms. The threats come on all sides — clients demanding better results from their advertising and promotional budgets; lean but highly creative smaller ad agencies; sales promotion and direct marketing firms which want a larger share of the money companies spend each year promoting their products and services; consumers who no longer respond to traditional forms of advertising; and new technologies that may reinvent the very process of advertising (Belch and Belch 1995).

This is where the threat of stagnation comes along the way. Is the advertising industry prepared to handle all the dramatic changes happening worldwide today? Is there adequate manpower that can cope with these changes? Is the academic community that provides this manpower be able to produce qualified graduates who can learn the ABCs of advertising quickly and wizzardly?

In other words, do the schools and universities have the right and ideal courses to offer so that when students graduate, they are qualified to assume frontline management positions in the field of advertising?

THE PROBLEM

Developing a program leading to the Degree Bachelor of Science in Commerce (BSC) Major in Advertising Management.

Is there a market for BSC-Advertising Management Program? This has been a perennial question among academic institutions in the Philippines today. While it is tedious and expensive to offer such a program, the most critical issue is the question on whether a considerable number of students are willing to pursue this course. The next critical issue is whether the school is prepared to provide a competent faculty that can handle highly specialized subjects like account management, copywriting, art direction, media planning and production courses. The third issue is the adequacy of audio-visual facilities that are essential in offering such a course. There are of course other concerns.
With this scenario, the Marketing Department of the College of Business and Economics of De La Salle University (DLSU) Manila, has bravely faced the challenge and offered a BSC-Advertising Management Program in collaboration with Communication Arts Department of the College of Liberal Arts. The Program is business-based, but due to its similar liberal arts orientation, some production courses are taken in the latter college.

While the official implementation of the program was a result of feedback from previous students who clamored for such a course and a growing observation that practitioners look for better trained business or communication arts graduates, no formal study was conducted to interview practitioners on what kind of course they really need. Hence, a study was conducted to solicit feedback from the advertising and related marketing communications practitioners on their reactions to the new program.

METHODOLOGY

The study employed the descriptive method to gather feedback among industry practitioners on the BSC-Advertising Management Program. The approach was through a survey questionnaire to probe the reactions of key advertising executives or marketing communications experts on DLSU's new course offering (Kotler & Armstrong, 1989).

The practitioners purposively selected were company representatives of client, advertising agency, media, and supplier industry associations taken from the membership directories of these associations. They were mailed a structured questionnaire and their responses were collated, tabulated, and evaluated. Out of 400 mailed questionnaires, the total rate of response was 36% or 144 actual respondents. The respondents selected were CEOs, VPs, and Directors; hence, their responses provided very valid comments.

SUMMARY OF FINDINGS

- The schools that supplied the best manpower included De La Salle University in the first cluster of schools. However, the cluster was dominated by the University of the Philippines, the country's premier state university.

- In the area of specialization, the courses the advertising manpower pursued while in college were mass communication and marketing. Other programs that were pursued by a significant number of respondents were advertising, fine arts, and business management.

- Almost one-half of the respondents strongly agreed that a 4-year advertising management degree should be offered in college. They believe that there is a market for this course since their manpower is not academically prepared and needs to be trained further upon hiring.

- Close to 50% of the respondents claimed that an advertising management program should be offered by the College of Business Administration, in general; and the Department of Marketing and Advertising, in particular. They believe that advertising students should have a strong business background if they wish to become future advertising executives. This issue was raised by the client and the media/supplier sectors. However, the agency sector's opinion was split between the College of Business Administration and the College of Liberal Arts/Department of Communication as the college which should offer the program. While they recognize the business skills the students should possess, the student should likewise have a strong liberal arts background for them to succeed in a highly creative, artistic industry.

- Over 40% of the respondents recommended BSC or Bachelor of Science in Business Administration (BSBA) for an advertising management program. This was the recommendation from most respondents from the client and media/supplier sectors. However, the agency sector was equally recommending BSC/BSBA or Bachelor of Arts (AB).

- The major subjects to be offered were prioritized as follows: Advertising Principles, Marketing Principles, Media Planning, Consumer Behavior, Account Planning/Strategic Planning, Marketing Research, Creative Writing/Copywriting, Advertising Campaign Presentation, and Account Management.
- The skills that should be further enhanced rated Creative Thinking as Number 1, Oral Communication as Number 2, Planning as Number 3, Creative Writing as Number 4, and Business Writing as Number 5.

- Teaching methodologies that were significantly preferred were Hands-on/Practicum, Lectures and Discussions, and Case Studies. Other methods identified by more than one-half of the respondents were seminars and workshops as well as individual/group projects.

- With regard to teachers’ profile, all sectors of the sample were unanimous in their choice of practitioners as the best teachers who can more capably teach advertising management subjects. For them, a competent faculty presupposes that they have gained a reasonable amount of advertising experience.

- For successful implementation of the program, the respondents recommended primarily the development of practicum/related linkages with the advertising industry and the hiring of practitioners as lecturers and teachers. Other noteworthy recommendations were the enhancement of audio-visual and computer facilities, and periodic review of subjects offerings to bring them up-to-date.

CONCLUSIONS

Based on the results, the following conclusions were arrived at:

- De La Salle University which has offered a BSC-Advertising Management Program is responsive to the needs of the advertising industry.

The feedback survey showed that a degree in advertising that is primarily business-based is most needed. The marketing communications industry is in urgent need of qualified manpower which can immediately be harnessed. Training is an expensive process; hence, if the advertising graduate is equipped with the necessary skills, the industry can cope with the demands of a constantly evolving industry. A communication arts graduate may not have adequate skills since he lacks marketing and business knowhow. Similarly, a business management graduate lacks advertising and production orientation that is given to most communication arts and fine arts graduate. Hence, an advertising management program that recognizes all these skills can produce graduates who can be readily employed. In addition, since De La Salle University offers a unique Liberal Arts-Commerce degree, the student who pursues an AB course with advertising management as his specialization in commerce may have an added competitive advantage over other graduates.

- The subjects that the practitioners identified which should be given priority in the BSC-Advertising Management Program are all offered in the program of the University.

It is interesting to note that all the priority subjects raised by the practitioners are all offered in the new program. Subjects in account management, creative, media, and research are all required to be taken to complete the degree. Even a new field like strategic planning or account planning is included in the program and is in fact considered a foundation course. These results showed that the DLSU’s program can meet the demands of the industry and is very up-to-date.

- The skills that should be enhanced in an advertising student are his creative thinking, oral communication, and planning ability.

The advertising industry is a creative industry. Hence, the people that will succeed in this industry should have a lot of creative thinking skills. Similarly, the people must be very articulate for them to be able to communicate persuasively to a lot of other people and executives their creative ideas. They should also maximize their planning skills since advertising executives are engaged in a lot of strategic planning for their campaigns to successfully carry impact on the target consumers.

- An advertising management program needs a creative teacher who is a practitioner himself or has had an advertising or related experience.

Unlike other fields of specialization, advertising is best taught by a creative practitioner who can vary his teaching methods through the adoption of hands-on experience or practicum, lectures and
discussions, case studies, seminars and workshops, and individual/group projects. Advanced degrees are acceptable, but what is more critical is the ability of the teacher to relate actual experience to the students so that the latter can be exposed to the real world of advertising. In this manner, they do not get disoriented or misdirected when they work for a marketing communications company. Additionally, these teachers can establish linkages with various advertising agencies of which they have been connected with thus making advertising education relevant, progressive, and up-to-date.

RECOMMENDATIONS

To the students. An advertising student is expected to be creative. Hence, to tap his hidden talents, he should excel not only in his academic or curricular activities but also in his extra-curricular activities where he can join associations like the student marketing association, the camera club, the debate society and the like that can draw out his creative potentials and hone his oral and planning skills. Most importantly, he is encouraged to read, read and read and expose himself through the various media of mass communication so that he can cope adequately with the information explosion.

To the faculty. Since the faculty members are encouraged to become practitioners themselves, full-timers should undergo a "faculty practicum" themselves so that their ideas do not become obsolete. They can engage in research activities relevant to advertising and mass communication, write a textbook on advertising management or become honorary members or associate members of any of the advertising industry associations. They can also attend national and international conferences. In this manner, they become teachers who "practice what they preach" and gain the respect of the students.

To the Administrators. A successful program needs an all-out support from the school administration. This can be concretized through approval of more contemporary audio-visual and computer facilities, linkages with universities abroad, consortium with other schools, and finally linkages with the advertising industry practitioners. Practicum should be formalized so that students would readily avail themselves of these tie-ups. Professorial chairs should be established to assure the university of a commitment from these advertising companies. The administrators should support the faculty when they attend advertising conferences and trips abroad to gain wider perspective. Similarly, they should upgrade the library facilities to provide students and faculty with the latest books, journals and research materials on advertising.

To the Advertising Industry. De La Salle University is providing the industry a service for initiating an Advertising Management Program. Hence, it is strongly recommended that clients, advertising agencies, media, and suppliers support the program in whatever way they can. They can accept practicumers, conduct student workshops like that of J. Walter Thompson's University Reach Out Program, or train students like that of AdSchool of Basic Advertising, Inc. The industry association can provide scholarships to deserving students, and their member-companies can give grants to support professorial chairs. During an advertising congress, the industry can sponsor students and faculty to attend so that the latter can interact with practitioners and be informed of the latest developments and technology in advertising.

To the Readers of this Paper. It is recommended that the readers of this paper conduct follow-up research studies that will probe further the implementability of an advertising management program under a business-based curriculum. Since the advertising agencies studied were equally recommending a Commerce or a Liberal Arts degree in Advertising, more research is needed in this regard so that the graduates of DLSU or other universities which may want to offer an Advertising Management Program will become immediately hirable and superiorly qualified to take on an advertising job.

REFERENCES


A SKILLS DEVELOPMENT MODEL FOR MARKETING AND ADVERTISING PROGRAMMES

Angela Burge, Manukau Institute of Technology, Private Bag 94006, Manukau, Auckland, New Zealand. Telephone: 64-9-274-6009. Email: aburge@manukau.ac.nz

ABSTRACT

Programmes designed for students aiming for the marketing and advertising fields are well grounded in content needs and pedagogy. There are constant calls from employers that graduates need other skills; that they are unprepared for their careers. As well as looking at the learning hierarchies that education accepts, this paper suggests that a focus can be placed on developing professional identity and work and personal skills to ensure that graduates are prepared for their places in the “outside world”.

INTRODUCTION

There are times when we are given the opportunity to revisit the structure and requirements of our academic programmes. Often, as educators we concentrate on what should be taught and at that stages within our programmes and courses. In marketing and advertising programmes we are often preparing students who have recently graduated from school or college for their chosen careers. Often these students are adolescents in the process of transition into an adult world.

We are also confronted by the needs of the industries where our graduates hope to find employment. In New Zealand, discussions with industry resulted in the comment that graduates are not prepared in interpersonal skills (e.g. listening, presentation and communication skills, time management and other personal skills) that are necessary to function in career positions.

This paper proposes that programmes should be designed which are based not only on content and learning hierarchies, but which also take into account that young students are developing roles in their personal and professional lives. One important area of role development, which we are all inherently involved in, is the development of professional identity or the development of a career role.

SKILLS DEVELOPMENT

McMorland’s professional identity development

McMorland (1990) has suggested six stages of development through which new professional roles are acquired. These are:

1. aspirant
2. student
3. novice
4. licensed professional
5. mature practitioner
6. retired person

The role tasks of the aspirant include preparing the self through identification. For the aspiring marketing or advertising graduate this would entail making the initial approach to a training institution, being selected on grounds of suitability and educational qualifications, and finally, joining the programme.

Emphasis for the student is on cognitive and theoretical development within a chosen field of study. The student has a content orientation, and may not yet have developed a commitment to practice. Students are initiated into the language/thinking domain, but feeling and action domains develop later. They seldom question the legitimacy of specialist knowledge and it is only in smaller group situations that students can be encouraged to be more participative and active learners.

Part of the preparation for practising in an adult world is to know that unlike textbooks, the world is not a perfect place and that things can go wrong. The student must also recognise that there are ethical challenges in practice. Students are rewarded for their demonstration of expertise and cognition skills, seldom for their humility and capacity to say they do not know. At the formal level, we reinforce the value of what they know, at the expense of helping students identify the boundaries and limitations of their own knowledge. Yet this quality is crucial for the next stage of
professional development - and is a primary task of the novice as it is an essential step in becoming a self-directing learner.

As the graduate moves into practice and becomes the *novice*, there is a further shift from idealism to realism: theory has to be translated into practice. They have to learn to discriminate between 'useful' and 'redundant' knowledge, and to sustain faith in the value of theory when its relevance is not easily recognised.

The characteristics of the *professional* include the capacity to master theoretical knowledge, to solve problems, to use practical knowledge, and a willingness to develop the self.

The final two stages of McMorland's model, the *mature professional* and the *retired professional* are not discussed as part of the current paper.

The first three stages constitute the phase of *career formation*, the last three that of *career fulfilment*. One question here may be: at what point in this continuum does formal education relinquish, and industry take up, these responsibilities?

Our experience in New Zealand is, and this is also evident in the US (Ducoffe and Ducoffe, 1990), that employers are loathe to provide formal training programmes for new recruits. On the other hand "industry preparedness" gives graduates an edge in the employment market.

So what is "industry preparedness"? The CNAA (1990) has put forward a definition of competence, "the individual's demonstrated capacity to perform i.e. the possession of knowledge, skills, and personal characteristics needed to satisfy the special demands or requirement of a particular situation." The mention of personal characteristics suggests preparedness is more than merely content knowledge.

Smith, Wolstencroft and Southern's "work related" skills.

In an endeavour to develop assessment procedures for work-based placements, Smith et al (1989) focused on two areas of "work related" skills. The first of these, *general skills* incorporates such facets as problem solving, communication, and working with people. The second area, *vocational skills* encompasses managing activities, dealing with people at work, the business environment, and information technology.

These two areas could valuably be incorporated into any skills development model. However Smith et al have omitted the issue of *professional identity*. McMorland (1990) suggests that "learning professionally appropriate behaviour is a long process of formal and informal socialisation distinct from the acquisition of knowledge and technical expertise. Professional development requires the individual also to learn how to work within a matrix of social relationships, both with clients and with colleagues". There is thus a third area of learning which can be incorporated into a skills development model.

King, Wood and Mines' Learning Hierarchy
A learning hierarchy (King, Wood and Mines, 1990) has been used which correlates well with the other skill development domains so far identified. The hierarchy has three stages.

**Stage 1**
Reflects the assumption that knowledge is either gained by direct personal observation or transmitted from an authority figure. Such knowledge is assumed to be absolutely correct and certain.

**Stage 2**
Reflects the assumption that knowledge is gained through evaluating the available evidence and that, although judgements may involve some personal and often idiosyncratic evaluation of data, certain concepts aid the decision makers in their evaluations.

**Stage 3**
This stage reflects the assumption that in facing ill structured problems interpretations must be grounded in data and, more importantly, that the interpretations themselves must be evaluated to determine the truth-value of a knowledge claim, using such criteria as conceptual soundness, degree of fit with the data, and parsimony.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage/Year Three</th>
<th>Business meetings, briefings, presentations written and oral. Analysing client needs, organisational politics and representing an organisation</th>
<th>Creativity Putting ideas into practice Knowing what you don't know Self evaluation Critical thinking Prioritising projects Tying theory to real world problems Discovery by self Written and oral presentations to clients and industry Learning to listen to verbal briefs Leadership Negotiation Resolution of conflict Motivation of others</th>
<th>Shift from idealism to realism Questioning of other's expertise Discriminate between 'useful' and 'redundant' knowledge Belief in theory base even when value is not easily recognised in the real life context</th>
<th>Knowledge gained through assessment of conceptual soundness of claims</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stage/Year Two</td>
<td>Managing project activities, under supervision Cooperating with group members in a project and presenting to peers Use of specific industry software and databases</td>
<td>Prioritising tasks Peer evaluation Learning from experience Directed discovery Written and oral communication Teamwork Cooperation Allocation of tasks</td>
<td>Non questioning of specialists Understanding that things can go wrong Initial superficial evaluation of members of industry</td>
<td>Knowledge gained from evaluating evidence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage/Year One</td>
<td>Personal time management Communication competency Computer competency</td>
<td>Self organisation Learning to learn Basics of report writing and business communication</td>
<td>Decision on career path</td>
<td>Knowledge gained through observation and through authority figure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocational Skills</td>
<td>General Skills</td>
<td>Professional Identity</td>
<td>Learning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A SKILLS DEVELOPMENT MODEL

The following model has been devised to structure student experiences in an effort to enhance their development towards entry into their chosen industry.

Table 1 illustrates a progression of development throughout an undergraduate degree programme using the terminology and concepts developed by Smith et al, King et al, and McMorland. It starts with the new entrant, the school leaver and culminates in the "outcome" of the programme, the graduate.

The diagram should be read from the base up. Skills developed in lower stages are assumed to be retained in higher levels.

Stage/Year One is a transition year for students. Often students are straight from college and thus must make alterations to their working and study methods. However, other, more mature students who enrol for retraining purposes approach many of the same challenges.

This stage essentially allows the students time to familiarise themselves with their chosen vocational field and identify where this field fits within the greater business arena. It is here also that they begin to accumulate competencies such as time management, communication, and computer literacy. At this stage the student will probably interact with the lecturer as an authority figure and is unlikely to question the lecturer’s expertise to any large degree.

Stage/Year Two is a stage of greater vocational specialisation. Students should be certain of their career path at this stage. Generally the majority of courses studied will be in their chosen specialist area.

At this stage, students will begin to spend more time working with peers or colleagues on project work, thus experiencing the need for cooperation, the need for planning and prioritisation in conjunction with others, and clearly the need for interpersonal communication. Instead of being taught, an emphasis is now placed on learning from experience.

It is at this stage that students can be introduced to industry practitioners, and can begin to identify with role models, for their future vocation. They will begin to evaluate these role models.

Stage/Year Three should emphasise working to client and/or organisational needs. This stage requires the student to develop a confidence in their own ability, but also to know what they don’t know, and the confidence to ask for help.

A distinct change in faculty/student relationship is required at this stage, in that faculty must work with the student.

Perhaps two of the most important skills to be attained at this stage are presenting confidently and appropriately and listening and interpretation. The student will learn to listen to instructions or briefings, and be able to interpret the speaker’s needs, accepting that the speaker might have difficulty articulating those needs.

The student at this stage must develop self evaluatory and motivation skills that reflect the environment around them, and their future working environment.

CONCLUSION

None of this would be possible without a committed, energetic and hardworking faculty, and student body. However, we are certain that developing skills outside the normal classroom mode can only enhance our students’ opportunities in the highly competitive fields of marketing and advertising.

Our first graduates are only now entering the industry. Their achievements will be a reflection of the degree of success our programme attains.

REFERENCES


PERCEIVED OBJECTIVITY OF STUDENT EVALUATION
OF FACULTY

Robert C. Sitz
Frank Thayer
New Mexico State University
P.O. Box 30001 Dept. 3J
Las Cruces, New Mexico 88003
Telephone: 505-646-1539

INTRODUCTION

Systematic faculty evaluation by students has become an important part of the administrative equation in determining yearly faculty performance incentives as well as potential for promotion and tenure. A recent survey of faculty who teach journalism and mass communication courses throughout the United States indicates that over 90% of faculty is evaluated by their students each semester. Most programs appear to use student feedback that has been obtained by the use of some type of rating instrument (Sitz and Thayer, 1965). These evaluation procedures have often engendered controversy and questions among faculty and administrators concerning not only the participation of students in determining the fate of professors, but the very objectivity of the rating instruments and the students themselves.

If the intent of the student feedback is formative, that is to assist faculty in improving their day-to-day teaching skills, what special insight do students have about teaching methodology? Not all student comments are constructive, or motivated by desire to help improve teaching techniques (Bodie, 1994). Student ratings of professors are more often likely to be implemented as summative judgements to be used by administrators to justify hiring, retention and promotion. Although there is some evidence to show that ratings by students may be reliable as "summative judgements" (Armstrong, 1987; Ellig, 1986; Magnuson, 1987), because of the critical nature of decisions about faculty, it would seem essential to make the systematic evaluation process as scientific as possible. This would include elimination of casual observation, informal influences on the evaluation process, heresay evidence about the faculty member, and gossip. Although some informal appraisal of teacher effectiveness by passing impressions and feelings on to the other students through social channels will probably always be part of the academic environment, formal systems of evaluation that include the use of instruments that measure student impressions of faculty and courses should strive for some semblance of scientific objectivity (Goldberg & Callahan, 1991).

A serious concern is that in the eager pursuit to improve administrative decisions, many institutions and department chairs may have moved too quickly to embrace "unscientific" rating procedures, measurement instruments and data-gathering procedures. It is possible that the numerical results of the evaluation procedure may not be used with consideration of their validity and reliability for the intended purpose. And despite a growing body of evidence that empirical data about the quality of teaching is obtainable, controversy and questions persist as to the objectivity of the process.

THE EVALUATION INSTRUMENT ISSUE

Most everyone recognizes that the design of scientific instruments to measure human performance in a laboratory setting is a highly specialized skill. Similarly, the typical instrument used to measure human performance outside of the laboratory lies within the domain of but a few highly trained specialists who have succeeded in providing instruments that have withstood the test of time. The most well-known of these instruments are the standardized tests that many faculty and students have participated in at one time or another. Yet, in a comparatively short period of time, administrators have rushed to embrace a wide variety of new faculty evaluation instruments frequently custom designed by themselves. Other instruments are borrowed and copied, modified and passed on from department to department and institution to institution, and none appears to have a foundation in terms of scientific realities.

Four years ago, a study at New Mexico State University revealed at least twenty-one different evaluation questionnaires being used at the same time. The College of Arts and Sciences allowed each
department to use a different teaching evaluation form, but still apportioned salary increase monies in accord with a ranking based on research, teaching and service. To compare a department using a form of six questions, all on a four-point scale, with a department using a twelve-question instrument employing a seven point scale is just not a very good science, yet such unequal faculty evaluation comparisons are still commonly used among university departments whose survey standards in other types of academic research projects are rigorously controlled to minimize error (Sitz & Thayer, 1995).

**POTENTIALS FOR BIAS**

Compounding the problems inherent in instrument design and institutional procedures in application of the evaluation systems are many issues surrounding the students' ability to provide useful information. Not only is the quality of the student feedback dependent on the capability of the instrument to elicit appropriate responses, but just as central is the question of student "capability" and motivation.

It has been demonstrated in a number of research studies that the response sought by typical faculty evaluation methods such as rating instruments are biased by a number of factors such as age and attractiveness (Cashen, 1985; Levin, 1979; Armstrong, 1987); gender (Fechers & Chow, 1988; Cashen, 1985; Basow & Silberg, 1987); and student grades (Aleamoni, 1981; Goldberg & Callahan, 1991; Levin, 1979). Hudson (1969) found a direct correlation between teaching evaluation scores and expected grades in general education courses. An interesting conclusion of this study was that students who expect grades of "Pass," "A" or "B" consistently rated instructors higher than students who expected lower grades of "C," "D" or "F". Other research, however, has failed to find a significant relationship between grades and ratings of faculty (O'Sonde, 1984). A recent study found an interaction between gender of the instructor and gender of the student, with female evaluators tending to give higher evaluations to instructors of the same gender, and males being less likely to evaluate males more favorably (Lueck, Endres & Caplan, 1993). In a discussion of evaluation fairness, one author catalogued the cruel anonymous comments that beset every instructor, no matter how talented or competent, suggesting that some evaluations may be neither fair nor accurate (Bodie, 1994). There are a number of potential sources of bias in the evaluation process that are beyond the scope of this paper -- the issue is apparent without them.

Given the complex context of the evaluation situation, with all of the potentials for bias, is objective consideration of the facts surrounding teaching achievable? In an attempt to shed light on the question, Sitz and Thayer (1994) conducted two background studies described as follows:

**Student Perception of Objectivity**

In the spring of 1994, a thirty-nine question survey was given to a convenience sample of 89 students in attendance in four different journalism courses at New Mexico State University. On a 1-7 Likert scale, students were asked to address such issues as the importance of being able to evaluate faculty, and the objectivity of their ability to accomplish the task.

Students were asked specifically how important it was for them to be able to evaluate their instructors, how seriously they approached the task, and how objective they perceived themselves as being in the evaluation procedure.

In this survey of student opinions about faculty evaluation, it was found that students reported on a 1-7 scale, with 1 being strongly disagree, to 7 being strongly agree, a high rating for importance of evaluating, the seriousness of the evaluating task, and their objectivity in evaluating faculty.

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std Dev</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It is important for me to be able to evaluate my instructors.</td>
<td>6.03</td>
<td>1.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When asked to evaluate an instructor, I approach the task very seriously.</td>
<td>5.83</td>
<td>1.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe I am as objective as possible about instructor evaluation</td>
<td>5.86</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Faculty Perceptions of Student Objectivity**

In the second study (Stiz & Thayer, 1994), a
A nationwide survey of faculty members belonging to the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communications sought answers as to evaluation practices in use at colleges and universities throughout North America. Of 60 questions asked of each respondent, seven questions were directly related to the fairness and objectivity of evaluation instruments and how the faculty perceived the fairness and objectivity of the students filling out those instruments.

Using dichotomous questions, the survey writers asked several questions bearing upon the evaluation process: the first two questions asked whether the respondents' departmental evaluation instrument was fair and objective; the second pair of questions asked whether faculty felt that students were the best source of feedback on classroom performance and if the information was of good quality. Finally, three questions addressed whether faculty believed students took the task seriously, were objective in their evaluations, and whether students were thoughtful and fair in their evaluations.

In this second survey of faculty opinions concerning evaluation, evaluation instruments were regarded as fair and objective by the majority of the 960 faculty who returned the survey. Student feedback was seen as the best source of information for faculty performance evaluation by slightly less than half of the respondents, but a majority of respondents saw the feedback as generally of good quality. On the subject of whether students take their role in the evaluation process seriously, a plurality of respondents agreed that students were serious about the task, but less than half said that they believed students to be objective in evaluating faculty. A majority of the faculty members surveyed said that students were thoughtful and fair in their evaluation of faculty.

These independent studies, one focusing on student perception concerning faculty evaluation, and the other about faculty perceptions of student evaluation, yield an interesting dichotomy between what students believe and what faculty believe. Students appear to believe that they are very objective. Professors, on the other hand, appear to equivocate in terms of their views about student "objectivity."

**PURPOSE OF THE STUDY**

Since most instruments that are used to evaluate faculty purport to have characteristics that embrace the concepts of empiricism, thus scientific methodology, objectivity by implication is an important concept to understand. At issue in this study is whether students "understand" the term "objective" to the extent that is necessary to be able to respond to a direct question in a survey that uses the term "objectivity." This study sought to determine what students perceive to be the idea of objectivity.

**STUDENT INTERPRETATION: THE MEANING OF OBJECTIVITY**

A convenience sample of 81 journalism and mass communications student respondents at New Mexico State University were given an instrument that asked each to define "objectivity" in their own words. The sample, taken in Spring 1994, would be used to determine if there were terms in common among students and would suggest whether a congruent pool of meaning might exist. The question asked of each student follows:

"Please respond briefly (not more than 75 words) to the following questions: What does the word objective (as applied to 'thinker' not 'goals') mean to you? For example, do you consider yourself to be an 'objective' thinker? If you were asked to evaluate a teacher's performance, could you be 'objective' in your opinion about the teacher's performance?"
Define the word *objective* using the preceding examples as context (please answer in no more than 75 words).*

Because students were not limited to one-word definitions, most respondents offered sentences or paragraphs as definitions of the term, and researchers planned to extrapolate word factors that would give full dimensions to student capability of defining the criterion word.

**RESULTS**

**Student Definitions of Objectivity**

Of the 81 students who completed the questionnaire asking for a definition of the word "*objective*, 77 submitted usable answers. The answers submitted produced a mean response length of 20 words. When the extraneous articles and verbs were subtracted, 390 descriptor words were identified within the 257 submitted sentences. Thesaurus synonyms for "*objective*" include such words as impartial, fair, detached, impersonal, unbiased, and unprejudiced. Most of these words were used by students to describe the criterion term "*objective*".

**TABLE 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptor Terms</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Considering all sides (views, angles, facts)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>13.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Both sides</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unbiased (or phrasing indicating without bias)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>21.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impartial</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open-minded</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detachment</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without prejudice (or discrimination)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pro and con</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honest</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Without emotion (not influenced by feelings, emotion)</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rational (relying on facts, facts only)</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(without relying on, using) personal opinions</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical (analyzing)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>160</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Other phrases used as part of the definitions written by the respondents included such terms as "free speech, independently, right or wrong, point of view, preconceived ideas, one-sided, not favoring, not influenced, subjective, wholeness, accurate, clear mind, beliefs, broad, whole view, evaluate, different aspects, different ways, educated judgement, negative feelings, right or wrong, opposite of subjective, democracy.*

**DISCUSSION**

While the cognitive structure of objectivity may be difficult to capture, its architecture is expressed in the way people define the term itself. Partisan evaluators may indeed delude themselves that they are being objective when such impartiality may be impossible; however, such imprecise human measurement is true of all members of the academy, not just students.

Perhaps the process of evaluation is too often viewed as an objective scientific endeavor -- with absolute truth as its goal -- when in reality we would be better served considering it as a form of argument, or a point of discussion. But if the ideal of our evaluative methodology is valid, it must be somewhat comforting to see that students appear to have the gist of the idea of objectivity well in-hand.

Analysis of the student responses to the survey yielded terms and phrases like "bias-unbiased," "opinions," "all sides," and "open-minded" that lend a great deal of credence to the students’ grasp of the idea of objectivity. Whether students (and faculty for that matter) are able to make the conceptual leap from understanding objectivity to practicing it, is a perennial issue for consideration.

**REFERENCES**


THE IMPACT OF GENDER AND ATTRACTIVENESS ON STUDENT EVALUATIONS OF BUSINESS FACULTY

Kathleen Kelly, Colorado State University, Department of Marketing, Fort Collins, CO 80523 (970) 491-5063
Linda R. Stanley, Colorado State University, Department of Marketing, Fort Collins, CO 80523 (970) 491-7297

ABSTRACT

In this paper, we examine whether students’ perceptions of a faculty member’s competence and qualifications are impacted by their gender. We surveyed students to measure student perceptions of the performance and credentials of a professor based on physical appearance only. Overall, male professors were rated higher on 79% of the measures, with the likelihood of having a Ph.D. and being clear and well organized in class presentations being significantly higher. Conversely, female faculty scored strongest for their expected enthusiasm in presenting material.

INTRODUCTION

As women enter the realm of academia in greater numbers, a number of issues arise concerning the experiences of male faculty versus female faculty in the academic environment. A significant body of research exists on whether female faculty are treated differently than male faculty on such issues as tenure and promotion and annual performance evaluations. At the same time, much research has been conducted on whether professor gender influences student teaching evaluations of faculty. Less studied is the “climate” in the classroom for women professors versus male professors. There is a growing body of research that shows that men and women faculty who teach the same subject to a similar class have very different experiences from one another (Sandler 1991). For example, Bennett (1982) finds that students expect female faculty to be more nurturing, more available outside of the classroom and more willing to grant concessions (such as extending a deadline). However, even when female faculty are more available to students, the students do not rate the women faculty any higher on their teaching evaluation.

In this paper, we set out to study whether students’ perceptions of a faculty member’s competence and qualifications are impacted by the gender (and/or the physical attractiveness) of that faculty member.

There has been a significant amount of research examining the effect of faculty gender on student teaching evaluations. However, we are not so interested in student teaching evaluations, but rather in overall student perceptions of the competence and performance of faculty members based upon gender. When a professor walks into class on that first day, students form some impressions and expectations of that professor based upon observable attributes that may provide little information about teacher competence. Students may not even be conscious of these perceptions; rather impressions and perceptions may arise from deep-seated, subconscious feelings. If these first impressions are not positive, it may be difficult for the professor to overcome them. In addition, perceptions and expectations can also affect the climate in and out of the classroom. If a professor feels that their competence or qualifications are questioned by some students, the professor may find it more difficult to teach, may be less motivated in the classroom, or may suffer in numerous other ways, such as lack of self-confidence or compromising their standards to please the students.

LITERATURE REVIEW

There is a rich body of research and diabolical debate about whether males have an advantage over females in the workplace. It was the original work of social psychologist Philip Goldberg (1968) that drew much attention to the subject of gender bias. In Goldberg’s often cited study, female subjects were given identical booklets containing six different articles. For each article, however, half the subjects were told that the author was Joan T. McKay, a woman. The other half were told the author was John T. McKay, a man. On 44 of 54 measures, John McKay received higher ratings than Joan McKay. Research has since extended from general studies of biases in the workplace to the academic environment.

Gender variables have frequently been found to affect students’ evaluations of professors.
Depending on the methodology, the sex-typing of the field discussed, the sex-typed characteristics of the instructors, and the types of questions asked, female professors sometimes receive lower ratings than male professors, especially from male students (Basow and Howe 1987). There is now a substantial amount of research showing how men and women are treated differently, and a growing body of research that describes how both male and female students treat women faculty differently than male faculty (Ryan 1989). Bennett (1992) found that female faculty received high ratings from their students due to their perceived warmth and potency; however, the study also found that students reported greater interpersonal support from female faculty and females were judged more closely than male instructors in providing this support. The author concluded that while gender bias may not be observed in formal student evaluations of their instructors, “female faculty members are nonetheless subject to culturally conditioned gender stereotypes” (Bennett 1992, p. 170). (For a review of research on different ways in which male and female students communicate with women and men faculty, see Sandler (1991).)

Feldman conducted an extensive review of the literature focusing on college students’ views of male and female college teachers (1992, 1993). The first review focused on research findings from the social laboratory and experiments (1992) and the second came directly from student evaluations of their classroom teachers (1993). In the majority of experimental studies reported, students’ overall evaluations of male and female college teachers as professionals were not different. However, when a difference was found, male teachers received higher overall ratings than did female teachers. In no study did female teachers receive a higher overall evaluation than did male teachers. Studies utilizing classroom evaluations also found that male and female college teachers do not differ in their overall evaluations; however, students did tend to rate same-gendered teachers slightly higher than opposite-gendered teachers, with males demonstrating a stronger preference for male teachers than females demonstrate for female teachers. Of the 39 studies summarized in Feldman’s review (1993), only one included a sample of undergraduate business students (Goldberg and Callahan 1991). Based on a 13-item evaluation questionnaire, business instructors were ranked “high” (if in the top quarter of the course scores), “mid” (if in the mid-half of the course scores), and “low” (if in the bottom quarter of the course scores). The difference between male and female teachers was reported as statistically significant; however, neither the direction of the association nor the correlation could be determined from the information provided in the article.

Early research studies show the physical attractiveness stereotype has more strongly affected judgments about females than about males (e.g., Kehle, Bramble, & Mason 1974). For example, male college students judged both an essay and the essay writer as more competent when the writer was an attractive female than when the writer was an unattractive female (Landy & Sigall 1974). A similar study was conducted which included female subjects’ impressions of the competence of attractive vs. unattractive female essay writers (Holahan & Stephan 1981). Female subjects’ impressions were affected by the competence of the stimulus person and by their sex-role attitudes, but were not influenced by the physical attractiveness of the writer. Lombardi and Tocci (1979) report an interaction between the teacher’s gender and physical attractiveness that affected the teacher’s rating of masculinity/femininity (the attractive female teacher was considered to be more feminine than the unattractive female teacher). Goebel and Cashen (1979) found neither the teacher’s age nor the teacher’s physical attractiveness by itself interacted with the teacher’s gender to affect overall evaluation, but that the teacher’s age and physical attractiveness did interact with the teacher’s gender to affect evaluations (the middle-aged, attractive male teacher was rated particularly low). An interesting gender difference was found: Ratings for the young, unattractive female teacher followed the pattern for those of older, less attractive teachers in contrast to ratings of the young unattractive male teacher, which followed the pattern for those of young, more attractive teachers.

**METHODOLOGY**

Most previous research has given students a description of a professor and then had them rate that professor on such things as effectiveness in the classroom. In this study, we are more interested in measuring students’ perceptions of the competence and qualifications of their professors based on initial expectations and impressions that may arise when the professor walks into the classroom on that first
day of class.

To study this, we developed a survey to measure student perceptions of a professor where those perceptions are based on physical appearance only. Students were first given information designed to disguise the purpose of the survey. They were then presented with a photograph of an individual identified as a prospective professor who if hired would teach junior and senior level classes in the College of Business. Photos varied by gender and attractiveness. A number of statements followed the photo; students were asked to rate the likelihood that each of these statements were true for this prospective professor. These (abbreviated) statements can be found in Table 1. The statements were designed to measure overall effectiveness in the classroom, organization and preparedness, dependability, accessibility, fairness and expertise. Students rated the likelihood that the statements were true on a 7 point scale, where 1 was very unlikely and 7 was very likely.

Because other studies have found that characteristics of the students can influence their evaluations, the end of the survey asked for student major, year in school, age and gender. Surveys were administered to three Principles of Marketing sections for a total of 188 responses.

**RESULTS**

Mean ratings are given for each statement in Table 1. The sample is then divided into male versus female professors; these means are presented in columns (1) and (2). Then the sample is divided by professor gender and attractiveness; the means for each of these four groups are presented in columns (3) - (6).

Comparing columns (1) and (2), the two female professors score worse than the two male professors on 15 out of the 19 statements. Of these, one of the differences in means is significant at the .10 level, the likelihood of "having a Ph.D." Of the four measures where the female professors are rated higher than the male professors, one of these differences is significant at the .10 level, the likelihood that the professor "is enthusiastic in presenting material" in class.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>WM</th>
<th>AM</th>
<th>UF</th>
<th>AF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 a well prepared</td>
<td>5.44</td>
<td>5.23</td>
<td>5.69</td>
<td>5.18</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 a successful researcher</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>4.63</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>4.52</td>
<td>4.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 is effective in the classroom</td>
<td>5.09</td>
<td>4.94</td>
<td>5.21</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>4.84</td>
<td>4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 would want to take class from</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>4.39</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>4.76</td>
<td>4.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 has a Ph.D.</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>4.72*</td>
<td>5.31</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>4.60</td>
<td>4.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 has relevant business experience</td>
<td>4.68</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>5.34</td>
<td>5.01</td>
<td>5.04</td>
<td>5.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 is willing to help students plan</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>5.48</td>
<td>5.50</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>5.84</td>
<td>5.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 an expert in subjects taught</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>4.85</td>
<td>5.17</td>
<td>4.74</td>
<td>5.03</td>
<td>4.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 is enthusiastic in presenting material</td>
<td>4.88</td>
<td>5.36*</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>5.24</td>
<td>5.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 presentations are clear and well organized</td>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>4.96</td>
<td>5.14</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>4.92</td>
<td>4.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 would vote for Prof. of the Year</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>3.90</td>
<td>3.68</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>4.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 is a hard grader</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.76</td>
<td>4.63</td>
<td>4.40</td>
<td>4.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13 is qualified to teach in COB</td>
<td>5.33</td>
<td>5.29</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>5.26</td>
<td>5.12</td>
<td>5.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 comes in class on time and available</td>
<td>5.47</td>
<td>5.26</td>
<td>5.33</td>
<td>5.19</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>5.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15 responds well to questions</td>
<td>5.25</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>5.36</td>
<td>5.06</td>
<td>5.31</td>
<td>5.15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 teaches all students fairly</td>
<td>5.38</td>
<td>5.07</td>
<td>5.48</td>
<td>5.21</td>
<td>5.23</td>
<td>5.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17 is intelligent</td>
<td>5.48</td>
<td>5.39</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>5.51</td>
<td>5.41</td>
<td>5.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 would recommend this professor</td>
<td>4.95</td>
<td>4.87</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>4.82</td>
<td>4.83</td>
<td>4.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average on all items</td>
<td>5.01</td>
<td>4.93</td>
<td>5.10</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>4.91</td>
<td>4.96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Number in sample group: 91 107 42 33 67 40

LM = attractive male AM = attractive average UF = unattractive female AF = attractive female

* significantly different from male means at .10 level

The results were subjected to three-way analysis of variance to explore the main effects of attractiveness, professor gender and student gender and any interactions among these variables. Males scored significantly better on "having a Ph.D." and "class presentations are clear and well organized" and females scored significantly better on "is enthusiastic".

There was a main effect for attractiveness for several statements. The attractive subjects scored significantly better on "has relevant business experience" and "would vote for Professor of the Year". The unattractive professors scored significantly better on "well prepared and organized" and "is an expert in subjects taught". Significant interaction effects between professor gender and attractiveness were found for "is a successful researcher" and "has a Ph.D". The male unattractive professor did significantly better on "has a Ph.D." than the other professors while the unattractive female scored significantly worse on "is a successful researcher".

A main effect of student gender was found for "would vote for Professor of the Year" with female
students rating that likelihood for any professor significantly higher than male students. Several significant interactions between professor gender and student gender were found. Male students rated the male professors significantly higher for "is an expert in subjects taught" while female students rated the female professor significantly higher on "responds willingly to questions" and "treats students fairly".

The items in Table 1 were factor analyzed using principal components analysis and varimax rotation for factor extraction. A four-factor solution was determined to best fit the data because of the factors' interpretability and the summary statistics. The Eigenvalues ranged from 8.6 to 1.1 and 67.6% percent of the variance in the data was explained by the four factors.

The largest factor, PERFORM, consists of measures of performance in the classroom (items 1, 3, 7, 10, 13-17). These include both preparation and organization measures and interpersonal measures of teaching. The second factor, RECOMMEND, are measures describing whether a student would recommend a professor to other students (items 4, 9, 11, 18). Apparently, enthusiasm is important in this recommendation. The third factor, EXPERT, measures expertise in the professor's field in terms of external credentials (items 2, 5, 6, 8). Finally, the fourth factor, GRADES, consists only of "is a hard grader" (item 12). A measure for each multi-item factor was calculated as the mean response for the items within that factor.

We performed three-way analyses of variance with each of the three multi-item factors. We found no significant main effects for professor gender, attractiveness and student gender at the .10 level. Part of the reason probably lies with the very small number of subjects in each group. Several main effects at the .20 level of significance were found, however. Unattractive professors scored better on PERFORM than attractive professors. Male professors were rated higher on EXPERT than female professors. In addition, a two-way interaction effect of attractiveness and professor gender on EXPERT and a three way interaction effect of attractiveness, professor gender and student gender on EXPERT were found. The unattractive, male professor scored significantly better on EXPERT while female students rated the female, unattractive professor significantly lower on EXPERT.

Finally, student major was grouped according to business majors and nonbusiness majors. A three-way analyses of variance on each of the 3 multi-item factors was performed using professor gender, attractiveness and student major as independent variables. A main effect of student major on RECOMMEND was found with nonbusiness majors scoring the professors significantly higher than business majors. Interaction effects between student major and professor gender were found for all 3 factors. Non business majors rated the male professors significantly higher than business majors.

**DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS**

The majority of differences found in this study were small; therefore, implications must be drawn cautiously. The lack of many significant differences may be a function of 1) the small sample sizes for the subgroups, 2) there actually is very little difference between how male and female professors are perceived, or 3) our instrument has not measured the subtle stereotypical behaviors and expectations that may occur in the classroom. In addition, responses were clustered in the middle range of the scale. This may be because the task of rating was relatively difficult with so little information, leading the students to choose the middle points of the scale.

Overall, males in the study were rated higher on 79% of the measures evaluated. Though most of these differences were not significant, the direction of the measures is meaningful. Males were perceived as being more likely to have a Ph.D. and more likely to be clear and well organized in their class presentations. Conversely, female faculty scored strongest for their expected enthusiasm in presenting material. Interestingly, these results are consistent with stereotypic gender qualities.

To make the strongest impression on the first day of class, it appears best to be an unattractive male professor. The unattractive male scored highest in half of the individual items and all of the multi-item factors. The largest difference in any of the scores was on the likelihood that the professor has a Ph.D. - the unattractive male professor scored 5.31 and the unattractive female professor scored 4.60. Unattractive professors scored highest on a performance summary measure and males were rated higher on being experts than females.
More research is needed before conclusions can be drawn. It would be useful to replicate this study to contribute to the sample size. Though the total number sampled in this study was 188, sample sizes for subgroups were low (i.e., only 20 male students rated the attractive female and only 15 female students rated the attractive male).

Future research is also needed to determine if females can compensate for first impressions which may be weaker than their male counterparts. Do students’ perceptions change over the duration of a course? Can women make up for an initial disadvantage if one exists? Additionally, surveying faculty would likely provide a wealth of information. Even if female faculty receive equal ratings to male faculty in their evaluations, they may have very different experiences in the classroom. Trying to better understand those experiences may reveal some effective techniques or methods for enhancing classroom experiences for both the students’ and the faculty members.

REFERENCES


CHOOSING A MARKETING SIMULATION: SOME EVALUATIVE CRITERIA

John Mager, Eastern Washington University, Cheney, WA 99004, (509) 359-6049
Peter Raven, Eastern Washington University, Cheney, WA 99004, (509) 359-6642
William Wynd, Eastern Washington University, Cheney, WA 99004, (509) 359-2802

ABSTRACT

Choosing a simulation for use in a marketing class can be confusing and time-consuming. In this article, commercial marketing simulations were evaluated on criteria important for teachers and students using a content analysis approach. Considerable variance was found between simulations. Teachers have a number of choices in selecting a simulation, depending on their teaching objectives.

INTRODUCTION

Management games have proliferated during the last twenty years and are likely to continue to do so because of the availability and increasing power of personal computers. A recent review cited 271 references on simulation games (Keys and Wolfe 1990). The literature is replete with anecdotal evidence that students like participating in simulations (e.g., Carvalho 1991; Hsu 1989; Keys and Wolfe 1990).

While simulations are enjoyable for most students, they also help teach them about marketing and the use of the computer (Klein and Fleck 1990). Indeed, Hsu (1989) suggests that gaming simulations should be regarded more as experiential learning tools than as knowledge delivery vehicles and as environments in which learners and teachers work together. With the popularity of simulations, the number of different types and programs has also increased. An instructor wishing to utilize a simulation for the first time, or wishing to examine other simulations for evaluation, is faced with a complex array of programs that may or may not meet class needs.

How does an instructor choose a simulation without actually investing substantial time in absorbing the details of a number of offerings? The primary purpose of this paper is to suggest and then test a decision framework using a limited set of simulations that are currently available. The goal will be to expand and refine the framework after this initial exploration. A brief overview of the relevant literature sets the stage for the study.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Computer simulations are used to understand and evaluate marketing variables and have applications in business, research, and education. The selection criteria for each application will depend on the specific objectives of the simulation and the instructor. A brief discussion of each application follows.

Business Applications

In business forecasting, marketing research is often outdated as soon as it becomes available and may not be adaptable to unexpected events in the marketplace. To counteract this drawback, computer simulations may be used in conjunction with research to make decisions, but to be effective, computer marketing simulations may need to be adapted to specific industries (Wood 1989).

Computer simulations have also been used in marketing applications to simulate new product development, market entry and penetration, distribution decisions, and other important marketing decisions (Winokur and Venkitaraman 1991).

Still another area in which computers are used in business applications is in the training of managers, technicians, and other operators. As a training tool, computer simulations have some unique features, such as compressing time and creating realistic, but low-risk environments for learners (Jubelirer 1992).

Research Applications

The use of computer simulations in basic research applications has also been explored. Gatignon (1987) examined the use of one commercial simulation, Markstrat, as a research mechanism for evaluating a number of marketing decisions.

Bainbridge (1991) suggests that the influence of relationships is greater in consumer behavior than perhaps traditionally realized, and that understanding the complex sociological interrelationships influencing consumers can be aided by computerized sociology.
Educational Applications

The question of educational validity of simulations and games has been addressed by Petranek, Sorey, and Black (1992), who suggest that during a simulation students process a variety of types of information, including facts, emotions, strategies, outcomes, relationships, and others. Some techniques can improve and enhance the learning process, such as a debriefing discussion which attempts to order the diverse happenings and experiences, and journal writing to record, assimilate, and integrate the learning process.

Evaluative Criteria

A number of criteria for evaluating simulations have been discussed in the literature. While some criteria for selecting simulations may be specific to particular applications, others may be universally applicable. Carvalho (1991), for example, suggests simulations must satisfy four criteria: 1) output variables must be functionally related to input variables, which are under the control of students; 2) changes in output variables must react to normal changes in decision variables beyond the normal random built-in effects; 3) simulations must allow for several equally feasible ways of achieving goals; and 4) the decision variable performance criteria relationships must be hidden from the participating students.

Hsu (1989) suggests that simulations should be sufficiently complex to challenge students, be relevant, display realism, and have transparency. The rules should be simple, clearly stated, and be available on-line. In addition, the game should be timely and easily available to those wishing to play.

An evaluation of American business simulations from an Australian perspective was examined in a study which included a survey of both students and instructors. McKenna (1991) asked participants to evaluate four simulations on the basis of their perceptions of the strengths and weaknesses of several evaluative variables: forecasting, marketing, production scheduling, quality control, inventory, finance, and personnel.

Although the literature review did not reveal a taxonomy for evaluating computerized marketing simulations per se, a number of articles did contribute to an understanding of important criteria. In addition to these, the experience of the current authors in using computerized marketing simulations in the classroom contributed to the suggested set of criteria upon which to evaluate computer marketing simulations.

METHODOLOGY

Our approach was to evaluate each simulation based on both the instructor’s and the student’s manual. We took this approach, rather than actually booting up each program and running a test run, for three reasons. First, a content analysis of the manuals provides the instructor’s first look at a program. If the manuals are poorly written, it is doubtful that the simulation will be purchased. Second, the manuals should clearly indicate the purpose for the simulation, the lessons taught, and something about how the simulation is conducted. Third, a content analysis is a more rigorous and systematic method of examining a simulation than is actually running the program. This is so because too many variables are included in running the simulation to have any meaning across simulations. Also, each simulation has different input variables, different controls, and different outcomes.

Eleven simulations were evaluated. They were chosen based on a combined criteria of: 1) our familiarity with the simulation; 2) our perception of how frequently the simulation was used; and 3) the availability of the simulation manual from the publisher. While it is recognized that this is not an exhaustive list of marketing simulations, it was judged as a fairly representative sample of commercially available marketing simulations for educators.

Two requirements for valid content analysis procedures are objectivity and systematization (Kassarjian 1977). Koobe and Burnett (1991) recommend four procedures to aid objectivity: 1) describing the rules and procedures used; 2) training judges; 3) pretesting categories and definitions; 4) the independence of judges. This project adhered to all of these recommendations. We selected criteria for evaluation based on our own experience of important aspects of a simulation, as well as criteria suggested in previous simulation reviews, such as realism (Hsu 1989) and the relationship between input and output variables (Carvalho 1991).

We reviewed the categories and definitions with the two student coders before they were given a sample manual to code. One of the coders was a first year MBA student who had used a marketing simulation
before, and the other coder was a senior in business administration who had previously worked as the student administrator for a marketing simulation. Both coders, therefore, were somewhat familiar with computer simulations and marketing terminology. Two coders are very frequently used for content analysis research.

The manual used for training was a complex manual that was not part of the study sample. After each coder had coded this manual independently, the investigators and coders met for discussion about coding discrepancies. Based on this discussion, the code form and definitions were revised as necessary. A previous version of one of the sample manuals was used to test for initial reliability. Kassarjian (1977) recommends that the ratio of all coding agreements to the total number of coding decisions made by all judges should not be less than 80%. The initial test agreement was 20/21, so we proceeded with the coding of the sample set of student manuals.

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Percent agreement is not a recommended reliability measure because it does not adequately account for chance agreement (Krippendorff 1980). However, in a review of content analysis in advertising research, Kang, et. al (1993), found that 65% of the articles examined used percent agreement, and 78% of the Journal of Advertising articles used percent agreement. Ranges and individual reliabilities are superior reporting methods relative to reporting overall reliability (Kolbe and Burnett 1991). In this research we looked at percent agreements and individual reliabilities.

There was 100% agreement for the straight-forward items, such as number of pages in the manuals, and less agreement over other, more difficult to interpret items, such as decision inputs. Comparing student manuals, there is considerable agreement for some manuals such as Fancy Footwork and Strategy Analysis (15/17 or 88%), and less agreement for other manuals such as Channel Power (10/17 or 59%). Counting the agreement for all of the decisions, the overall reliability was 76%, which is slightly less than the 80% recommended by Kassarjian (1977), but above the 70% reliability requirement stipulated by Nunnally (1978).

The table shows a summary of the student coder responses for some of the categories.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Simulation</th>
<th>Objective Description</th>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>Outputs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Market conditions and decisions</td>
<td>Televisions</td>
<td>4 Ps, sales force, R&amp;D, etc.</td>
<td>Financial, research, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fancy Footwork</td>
<td>Product life cycle</td>
<td>Footwear</td>
<td>Design, finance, media, etc.</td>
<td>4 reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Marketplace</td>
<td>Marketing concepts and principles</td>
<td>Industrial/consumer</td>
<td>4 Ps, etc.</td>
<td>Financial, research, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy Analysis</td>
<td>Strategic decision making</td>
<td>Any Industry</td>
<td>Many</td>
<td>Various</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandmaps</td>
<td>Marketing strategy</td>
<td>Vapornare</td>
<td>Four Ps; R &amp; D, etc.</td>
<td>40 market studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Markstrat II</td>
<td>Marketing functions</td>
<td>Electronics</td>
<td>4 Ps, sales force, etc.</td>
<td>Research reports, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paintco IV</td>
<td>Marketing decision making</td>
<td>Paint, coatings</td>
<td>4 Ps, sales force, etc.</td>
<td>Financial, research reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Channel Power</td>
<td>Strategic market planning</td>
<td>Computer industry</td>
<td>4 Ps, R&amp;D, etc.</td>
<td>Quarterly report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compete</td>
<td>Increase growth and profitability</td>
<td>Electronics</td>
<td>4 Ps; sales share, etc.</td>
<td>10 reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Marketing</td>
<td>Compete on Apparel</td>
<td>Channels; target market</td>
<td>Company, Sales, targets, products, volume, etc.</td>
<td>Trade reports, Sales, Share, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategy Game</td>
<td>Differentiation</td>
<td>Computer strategies</td>
<td>4 Ps, etc.</td>
<td>5-11 reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing Game II</td>
<td>Marketing strategies</td>
<td>Software</td>
<td>4 Ps, etc.</td>
<td>5-11 reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Other criteria evaluated, but not reported in the table due to space limitations, include: number of players/teams, number of pages in manual, whether or not worksheets were provided, number of segments permitted, time periods for play, whether or not instructor input was permitted, and whether or not a "what if" analysis was included. Many of the student manuals were unclear as to instructor input. A more serious category of disagreement was in the decision inputs. This may appear more serious than it really is, because in order for there to be an agreement, all factors had to be agreed upon by both coders. Most of the simulations have a large number
of decision inputs, and the coders found it difficult to 
agree on all of them, but did generally agree on most 
of the input decisions. Another area for disagreement 
was decision outputs. Here our evaluators disagreed 
on six of the eleven manuals. Students should not be 
confused on either the decision inputs or outputs. 
This makes for lost time in running the simulation 
when questions must be answered that could have 
been answered in the student manual. On the basis 
of the level of disagreement for some of the important 
categories, it would appear that the student manuals 
could be written more precisely.

After choosing several potential adoption, an 
instructor may wish to refer to the table for a brief 
overview of the details in the student manual. This 
table represents an overview of the manuals we 
reviewed and can be an important input in a decision 
to select a simulation for review. An instructor has a 
number of choices available to tailor the simulation for 
a particular class. For example, the number of 
players, the duration of play, the specific objectives of 
the simulation, the marketing segments targeted, and 
the decision inputs and outputs are widely variable 
between the simulations reviewed and represent a 
number of possibilities. Therefore, knowing the size 
of a class, their level of sophistication, and the 
objectives to be accomplished, an instructor should 
be able to narrow the alternatives.

The final choice of a simulation may rest on yet 
another variable. The instructor's manual is often an 
excellent overview of the simulation and frequently 
provides information which makes administration of 
the simulation less difficult. A good instructor's 
manual details the purpose of the simulation, contains 
suggestions for classroom use, has some test 
questions, a few transparency masters, is well 
written, and has adequate documentation.

An analysis of the instructor's manuals was 
conducted by one of the authors. Not all simulations 
included instructor’s manuals. The instructor’s 
manual for Channel Power does not have many 
teaching aids and is confusing. The Market Place, on 
the other hand, has an excellent instructor’s manual. 
It details the class level most appropriate, includes 
several syllabi, has test questions, comprehensive 
transparency masters, and is well-written. Between 
these two extremes lay a number of choices.

Selecting a simulation that will accomplish specific 
objectives in the classroom is a difficult task due 
largely to the time involved in learning enough about 
the simulation to make a reasoned choice. Not only 
must the simulation program run well, but the student 
and instructor's manuals must also be well-written 
and sufficiently explanatory to help assure the 
success of the simulation. We hope the foregoing 
analysis will make the task of selecting an appropriate 
marketing simulation somewhat easier and more 
 systematic.

LIMITATIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

This review is incomplete, but is presented as a 
starting point to evaluate the notion that a 
comprehensive evaluative framework can be 
developed that will be useful in choosing a marketing 
simulation for instructional purposes. In extending 
this work, a more exhaustive set of the currently 
available simulations should be evaluated. The 
criteria where low reliability between coders exists 
should be investigated. Perhaps the reliability can be 
improved through redefinition of the criteria. After 
developing the framework with improved reliability, 
the validity of the decision criteria should be tested. A 
variety of validity issues should be addressed. For 
example, does the framework improve the simulation 
selection process, are there criteria lacking in the 
framework, and are instructional objectives more 
frequently achieved when using the selection 
framework?

REFERENCES

(furnished on request)
ABSTRACT

For the past 30 years, business courses at California State University, Northridge have been taught in rooms that could hold no more than 40 students. In 1995 a new School of Business building was erected with a lecture hall that could comfortably hold 150 students. During the spring semester of 1995, two marketing faculty were scheduled to teach introductory marketing in the lecture hall as well as in smaller classrooms. This teaching schedule presented an opportunity to study how class size affects students' attitudes and performance in an introductory marketing course.

To minimize the effects of teaching methodology, each instructor attempted to maintain identical requirements and teaching styles between the large and small classes. Each professor taught his large and small classes using the same syllabus, text, lecture material, and exams. Moreover, all of the classes were taught during the day, thereby minimizing any "time-of-day" and "student" effects. Other than number of students, the only significant area in which the large and small classes differed was in the physical make-up of the classroom. That is, the lecture hall had cushioned seats arranged in tiered, semi-circular rows that approached a raised stage area. Because of the size of the lecture hall, a microphone was used to deliver the lecture. The lecture hall's video and sound system was state-of-the-art. When viewing a videotape in the lecture hall, students experienced an environment similar to that of a commercial movie theater: the lights were dimmed and an image was projected onto a huge screen while sound was emitted from speakers throughout the auditorium. The small classroom, in contrast, simply had a color TV monitor attached to the ceiling in the front corner of the room.

To measure the students' impressions of the various dimensions of teaching, an instrument was developed that contained the SEEQ (Students' Evaluations of Educational Quality) scale. This scale has been shown to be a reliable and valid measure of multiple teaching dimensions, namely student learning, instructor enthusiasm, instructor organization, group interaction, instructor rapport with students, breadth of coverage, examinations, assignments, and an overall evaluation (see Marsh 1982; Marsh and Bailey 1993). Other questions asked students to indicate their reasons for selecting the class, their attitudes toward class size, their evaluations of the course's difficulty, workload, and pace, their current grade point average, their expected grade in the course, their absentee rate, their "pre-class" interest in marketing, and their demographic characteristics. The questionnaire was administered to the students near the end of the semester.

All of the examinations of class size effects were conducted on a within-instructor basis. The large classes received course and professor evaluations that were comparable to the small ones, and, with minor exceptions, the large classes did not hinder the students' performance on the graded components of the course. The results of this study, for the most part, support the use of large classrooms for teaching introductory marketing.

REFERENCES


BASIC MARKETING OUTCOMES ASSESSMENT:
HOW MUCH DO STUDENTS REMEMBER?

Stephen P. Hutchens
Creighton University
Omaha, NE 68178-0130
(402-280-2091) (hutchens@creighton.edu)

ABSTRACT

Among the objectives for the first marketing course is acquainting students with basic marketing concepts. This abstract presents the initial findings of a four year study of students in upper-level marketing courses to assess student recall of these basic concepts.

Without recall, let alone understanding, students are poorly prepared to move on to upper-level marketing courses or to understand the implications of marketing for other areas of business; they are unlikely to be successful without the basics. Several studies have identified and ranked ordered the major concepts of marketing. Three core concepts are consistently ranked highly: the marketing concept, the marketing mix, and market segmentation.

To assess recall, students in upper-level marketing courses were asked short questions about basic marketing concepts on the first day of class. All students had completed a marketing principles course. Their responses were evaluated for indications that they had some idea what the concepts dealt with.

As responses accumulated, it became possible to place students into three groups: marketing majors, business students with majors in other business disciplines, and non-business students (mostly journalism).

Responses were evaluated only for recall of the concepts. Three evaluations evolved: “A” = Substantial recall; “C” = Partial recall; “F” = Lacking recall.

The marketing concept question dealt with attaining organizational objectives through customer satisfaction.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marketing</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mix</td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Column %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>58.8%</td>
<td>19.4%</td>
<td>21.8%</td>
<td>55.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>41.2%</td>
<td>21.1%</td>
<td>37.7%</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
<td>41.2%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>51.7%</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“A” recall demanded naming all four parts of the marketing mix; “C” level demanded only two or three.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Market Segmentation</th>
<th>A</th>
<th>C</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Row %</td>
<td>Column %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>38.8%</td>
<td>33.1%</td>
<td>28.1%</td>
<td>62.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Business</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>19.4%</td>
<td>51.6%</td>
<td>29.0%</td>
<td>32.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Business</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>17.6%</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
<td>74.2%</td>
<td>5.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30.9%</td>
<td>40.7%</td>
<td>28.4%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The market segmentation question required saying something about putting customers into groups.

The findings were disappointing. All groups evidenced low-to-modest levels of recall; non-marketing students performed worse by much worse than marketing majors who were none too high. Marketing students probably do no better in other business disciplines. Questions of interest: Do we cover so much material that basic concepts get lost? Do we promote short-term memory by using multiple choice tests? Can we do better? As an astute reviewer stated: “Only when principles courses are designed to promote critical thinking will we hope to produce better students.” We would appear to have a challenge ahead if this study is representative!
PROBLEM ORIENTED CASE ANALYSIS

Thomas E. Boyt, University of Nevada, Las Vegas, 4505 Maryland Parkway, Las Vegas, Nevada 89154-6010. (702-895-3989)

ABSTRACT

This paper examines a new method for analyzing case studies. Case studies have been used as a pedagogical tool in marketing classes for many years and many professors feel that case studies are the best way for students to learn basic marketing principles. The problem oriented case analysis method is borrowed from veterinary medicine which has used this approach in teaching students and as veterinary clinicians for diagnosing medical problems in animals. The paper examines how the problem oriented case analysis method can be employed by students in marketing for case studies. The problem oriented case analysis offers the student a very thorough, organized, and accurate method for approaching a case.

The method presented in this paper has the advantage of a customized, structured format that the student can use that is problem-driven. The case analysis method is structured to guide the student through the case in a manner that forces them to examine marketing factors that may not be clearly evident in the case.

There are many case analysis procedures offered in the literature (Cravens & Lamb 1990; Dalrymple & Parsons 1995; Bernhardt & Kinnear 1994; Kevin & Peterson 1990). The Problem Oriented Case Analysis (POCA) builds on these methods by incorporating a framework that can be utilized by the student to guide them through the analysis. The framework can be customized by the instructor to suite the needs of their class. This is similar to the veterinarian who adjusts the framework to the species of animal to be examined. The framework can be services oriented, product oriented, or generic.

The framework consists of a series of forms that are designed to force the student to analyze the case in a structured, systematic approach. The forms have specific marketing topics that must be addressed by the student for each case analyzed. If the specific topic is not important to the case it is merely checked off as having been considered but not relevant. If a topic is relevant then the student must discuss the relevance one the form. As more issues become relevant, problems emerge and are then refined. The student then must discuss possible causes for each problem and then make recommendations, give solutions, and present alternatives. Once the case is analyzed, the student must then write the case up in an instructor approved format. It is recommended that the instructor collect the POCA forms as well as the final case analysis work up to analyze the student's decision making process.
THE BENEFITS AND SUBSTANTIATION OF UTILIZING A CLIENT BASED, MARKETING PLAN PROJECT APPROACH FOR THE INTRODUCTION TO NON-PROFIT MARKETING COURSE

Les Harman, Biola University, 13800 Biola Ave., La Mirada, CA, 90639 (310-903-4770)

ABSTRACT

The position of this paper is to examine the optimal delivery system in the teaching of the introductory course in non-profit marketing. It is proposed that an individual, client based project approach enabling the complete development of a customized one year marketing plan for an existing local Non-Profit Organization (NPO), be utilized. The development of the marketing plan is the primary driving force of the class structure. Lectures and specific project related assignments on non-profit marketing theory and strategy are utilized in explaining and substantiating each of the various sections of the non-profit marketing plan process.

THE NEED(S) OF THE NON-PROFIT INDUSTRY

A common dilemma of marketing professors, regardless of the course taught, is determining the optimum way of maximizing the course. As teaching objectives for the marketing course are developed, it is suggested that decisions on course content and optimal delivery system be in adherence to the marketing concept. Therefore, in regard to teaching the introductory course in non-profit marketing, these teaching objectives would be based on the "needs" that exist for the business student and in the non-profit industry.

The non-profit industry is unique in regard to their expectations of entry level marketing graduates. Due to radical changes and downsizing in the industry as well as increased competition for limited funds, non-profit administrators have been in the position to hire marketers with a wide span of responsibility. However, graduates are often unprepared for the unstructured management culture and decision making protocol that exists in a majority of small to medium size non-profit organizations.

The suggested project approach meets many of the identified needs in the non-profit industry. First is the need to provide experience in "real world" non-profit situations prior to graduation. One may read all the books in the world about bicycle riding, but only when one actually gets up on a bicycle (Cunningham 1995) can they fully understand the challenge. In order to increase the probability of developing competent 'non-profit' managers, graduating business students need real experience and confidence in making marketing decisions in the 'non-profit' sector. Graduates are often not adequately ready for the wide range of marketing responsibility they are assigned in small to medium sized NPO's. The unconventional management structure is not typical of the 'for-profit' organizations that they have usually studied in their business education. In this very competitive and ever-changing non-profit environment, NPO's are no longer in need of inexperienced graduates with 'good intentions,' but marketers with experience in the non-profit industry and the ability to make sound decisions in typically unstructured non-profit organizations.

Since most business students are in need of practical experience during the traditional college marketing education, where better to implement it than by the introduction to NPO marketing course? Although some form of project(s) may be standard in the average introductory non-profit course, it is usually not to the degree, nor the benefit derived, that the author is suggesting. Many non-profit texts and suggested course delivery are primarily centered around non-profit cases. Although the study of NPO's through case studies is valuable for strategic thinking, the case approach often deals with larger, more structured organizations that students may not be hired as marketing managers until they have had many years of experience. Furthermore, the case approach does not include the vital experience of actually communicating and developing interpersonal relationships in the business atmosphere that exists in the project approach.

The second major need suggested by non-profit administrators is for competent business graduates that have a desire to make an impact in their communities. Students educated in the discipline of marketing have the potential to make more substantive contributions to business and society than do many of today's students who are versed in little else besides applying the Four P's in a consumer package goods context (Smith 1991). It is an additional responsibility of the business faculty teaching the non-profit course to guarantee the unique experience of community service using their marketing knowledge and training. Even if business students are have been involved in other marketing projects and/or internships, this comprehensive project approach allows students to have a thorough experience in the non-profit sector.
The majority of graduating business students are not attracted to the non-profit industry for a variety of reasons. Not-for-Profit careers maintained one of the lowest ratings in regard to marketing careers for likelihood of pursuit, prestige and information, indicating that career education may be needed (Anderson 1992). This is often due to their own misconceptions of NPO’s as well as perhaps their own desire for material growth that they believe only exists in the ‘for-profit’ sector. Regardless of the reason, unless graduating students have already experienced first hand the development of, for example, their marketing plan, they may never fully understand the non-profit industry for what it has to uniquely offer. Therefore, the project approach can become (and has been) an excellent avenue for promoting careers in the non-profit sector.

THE OBJECTIVES OF UTILIZING THE NON-PROFIT MARKETING PLAN APPROACH

A. One of the primary benefits and objectives of preparing a non-profit marketing plan is precisely its assistance in producing legitimate experience for future business managers. Students gain their real-world marketing experience in identifying many different “needs” of the organization through internal and external research. Based on this information, they apply non-profit marketing principles in the development of their various recommendations. The fact that the student must address all areas of the comprehensive non-profit marketing plan allows the student to experience the non-profit organization from the top to bottom.

B. A second objective is to stress both to the student and to the NPO the value of planning, e.g., better communication throughout the organization, identification of expected developments and a seasonal action plan. This also includes focusing of effort, identifying strengths and weaknesses, and developing marketing strategies with consideration for actual opportunities and threats (Lovelock & Weinberg 1989).

C. The third objective is the experience of learning the skill of creating options prior to making business decisions. There is a minimum of 35 different business strategic marketing decisions that must be made in order to complete the non-profit plan. Business schools are frequently criticized for focusing too much attention on theories and concepts and not enough attention on communication, decision making, and other skills that are at least as important to career success as content knowledge (Lamb Jr., 1995). Business graduates working their first job are often reluctant to recommend changes at their respective place of employment primarily due to a lack of confidence and experience. Although this hesitation may have merit, the process of decision making can be taught. For example, it is advised that students not take their first idea for a strategy and automatically establish it as one of their recommendations. Instead, the students are instructed to take the time to create options for each major strategy from which they and/or their client can choose the best direction. From this approach of creating additional options, students are taught the value of developing choices and seeking guidance for everything they do.

D. An additional goal is to teach the integration of the many facets of NPO into a simultaneous coordination of marketing activities. The process of developing the non-profit marketing plan clearly shows the inter-relationships between marketing and fund raising strategies, the power of the board of directors, the chosen positioning strategy, etc.

E. Also, students will learn and experience the dilemma of dealing with the constraints of real budgets and the compromises that follow. This is designed to avoid ridiculous and somewhat embarrassing recommendations that are not based on the reality of an organization’s legitimate budget.

F. To teach creativity in the non-profit sector is an objective for the non-profit marketing plan approach. Creativity is not only reserved for the promotion section of the marketing plan. It is critical that they (students) understand the relationship between creativity and organizational environments (Ranocki 1994). Furthermore, the reality of extremely limited budgets forces students to design creative strategies that will benefit the organization.

G. The last objective mentioned is to create a “user-friendly” document that can be implemented with a reasonable amount of work. This means that the action plan is clear, conveys the various steps that must be taken, and is designed uniquely for the client’s organization. This also implies that the document has been thoroughly explained to the client so that he or she can feel confident that they have a good understanding of the recommendations.

TEACHING SUGGESTIONS AND RESPECTIVE ASSIGNMENTS

Step 1. Decide on Non-Profit Industry. On the first day of class, assignment #1 is given for finding a client to work with for the project.

• The first step is to have students consider what
The majority of graduating business students are not attracted to the non-profit industry for a variety of reasons. Not-for-Profit careers maintained one of the lowest ratings in regard to marketing careers for likelihood of pursuit, prestige and information, indicating that career education may be needed (Anderson 1992). This is often due to their own misconceptions of NPO’s as well as perhaps their own desire for material growth that they believe only exists in the ‘for-profit’ sector. Regardless of the reason, unless graduating students have already experienced first hand the development of, for example, their marketing plan, they may never fully understand the non-profit industry for what it has to uniquely offer. Therefore, the project approach can become (and has been) an excellent avenue for promoting careers in the non-profit sector.

THE OBJECTIVES OF UTILIZING THE NON-PROFIT MARKETING PLAN APPROACH

A. One of the primary benefits and objectives of preparing a non-profit marketing plan is precisely its assistance in producing legitimate experience for future business managers. Students gain their real-world marketing experience in identifying many different “needs” of the organization through internal and external research. Based on this information, they apply non-profit marketing principles in the development of their various recommendations. The fact that the student must address all areas of the comprehensive non-profit marketing plan allows the student to experience the non-profit organization from the top to bottom.

B. A second objective is to stress to both the student and the NPO the value of planning, e.g., better communication throughout the organization, identification of expected developments and a seasonal action plan. This also includes focusing of effort, identifying strengths and weaknesses, and developing marketing strategies with consideration for actual opportunities and threats (Lovelock & Weinberg 1989).

C. The third objective is the experience of learning the skill of creating options prior to making business decisions. There is a minimum of 35 different business strategic marketing decisions that must be made in order to complete the non-profit plan. Business schools are frequently criticized for focusing too much attention on theories and concepts and not enough attention on communication, decision making, and other skills that are at least as important to career success as content knowledge (Lamb Jr., 1995). Business graduates working their first job are often reluctant to recommend changes at their respective place of employment primarily due to a lack of confidence and experience. Although this hesitance may have merit, the process of decision making can be taught. For example, it is advised that students not take their first idea for a strategy and automatically establish it as one of their recommendations. Instead, the students are instructed to take the time to create options for each major strategy from which they and/or their client can choose the best direction. From this approach of creating additional options, students are taught the value of developing choices and seeking guidance for everything they do.

D. An additional goal is to teach the integration of the many facets of NPO into a simultaneous coordination of marketing activities. The process of developing the non-profit marketing plan clearly shows the inter-relationships between marketing and fund raising strategies, the power of the board of directors, the chosen positioning strategy, etc.

E. Also, students will learn and experience the dilemma of dealing with the constraints of real budgets and the compromises that follow. This is designed to avoid ridiculous and somewhat embarrassing recommendations that are not based on the reality of an organization’s legitimate budget.

F. To teach creativity in the non-profit sector is an objective for the non-profit marketing plan approach. Creativity is not only reserved for the promotion section of the marketing plan. It is critical that they (students) understand the relationship between creativity and organizational environments (Ramocki 1994). Furthermore, the reality of extremely limited budgets forces students to design creative strategies that will benefit the organization.

G. The last objective mentioned is to create a “user-friendly” document that can be implemented with a reasonable amount of work. This means that the action plan is clear, conveys the various steps that must be taken, and is designed uniquely for the client’s organization. This also implies that the document has been thoroughly explained to the client so that he or she can feel confident that they have a good understanding of the recommendations.

TEACHING SUGGESTIONS AND RESPECTIVE ASSIGNMENTS

Step 1. Decide on Non-Profit Industry. On the first day of class, assignment #1 is given for finding a client to work with for the project.

• The first step is to have students consider what
non-profit "industry," charity organization(s) and/or social issues they already have personal interest in and/or perhaps empathize strongly with. It is a fact that students will do a far better job if they feel personally involved with its success. It is the intent of the instructor that the student will "takes ownership" of the project as they will want to see their organization flourish, as opposed to the completion of "just another paper."

• In regard to project leads for finding appropriate clients, the teacher may want to keep an updated notebook of "Project Leads" which contains names of NPO's that have expressed interest in marketing assistance, projects and internships used in the past, articles about local NPO's, library listings of NPO's and charities, etc. This notebook can be used to stimulate ideas and provide options for the students to consider. Other sources for project may be the local volunteer center and university community service office which are often aware of a wide range of local organizations. If there is still some difficulty in finding willing and appropriate NPO clients in the local area, students may work to form group teams. However, the author strongly encourages individual and off-campus projects so students can have the experience of working with new situations and be removed from the safety net that school can provide.

Step 2 Contact prospective clients. Students are encouraged to call at least five potential clients for an initial interview. It is recommended to avoid utilizing a standard questionnaire at this point as clients may not be comfortable disclosing structured information over the phone. Two things are emphasized to students in regard to contacting prospective clients. One, that a contact person established, who has marketing authority and is willing to meet with them and speak with them on several occasions on the phone over the semester. The second item is to work with organizations that want 'help.' If potential clients are defensive initially and feel threatened, then it is usually recommended to look elsewhere. The real success of the project will come from full disclosure from the client in identifying weaknesses and needs, so that the plan will be of real value.

Step 3 Select and meet with client - project assignment #1. Students need to take a copy of their non-profit marketing plan with them when interviewing with potential clients. The primary purpose of this initial meeting is to set reasonable, mutual expectations for the remaining period. It should be stressed at this time that although all sections of the marketing plan must be considered, there will be sections that are of a more pressing need to the client in which emphasis can be directed. This should definitely be conveyed to the client by the student at this initial meeting.

Step 4 Get instructor approval. The instructor is looking for such items as: Is the project too broad or not substantial enough? Most importantly, confirm that it is indeed a non-profit organization.

Step 5 Secondary research - project assignment #2. The purpose of this assignment is to familiarize and update the student on the non-profit industry in which their client organization is categorized. The assignment calls for the student to photocopied and turn in a minimum of ten relevant articles/industry data surrounding the marketing environment.

Step 6 Conduct non-profit marketing audit - project assignment #3. The student needs to make a face to face appointment with the client to complete the initial marketing audit. The purpose of this assignment is to further understand the organization with emphasis on the internal marketing environment of the organization. An excellent example of a complete non-profit marketing audit can be found in the text, Public & Nonprofit Marketing (Lovelock 1989). Due to the amount of potential questions that may or may not be applicable for scope of the project, students are assigned to select the ten most relevant questions from the marketing audit in the suggested text. Next to each of the ten questions, the student should explain "why" that particular question was asked and briefly write the client's response. The purpose of this assignment is to ensure that all questions are relevant to the needs of the organization, and questions can be customized for the individual project meeting. This assignment is an exercise in preparedness and professionalism that should be learned and practiced in college and used consistently in the business world. By completion of the last two assignments, the student should have sufficient information in which to complete the situation analysis and S.W.O.T. sections of the marketing plan.

Step 7 Develop marketing objectives for client organization. As a result of the research, marketing audit, meetings with the client and various lectures, the student can begin creating/developing the annual marketing objectives for the period covering the annual marketing plan.

Step 8 Develop ten point plan objectives for your term project - project assignment #4. At this point in the class, the student needs to set goals and establish a "game-plan" for what he/she can feasibly complete in the remaining part of the term. This is not for the client organization, but simply ten items that are unique to their project that must be accomplished in order to complete the project.

Step 9 Develop internal and external marketing strategies. Class time during the term has been split between unique features of NPO's and the various sections of the non-profit marketing plan. As these sec-
tions are discussed in class and read in the text, students should begin writing the marketing strategies in their non-profit marketing plan. Greater emphasis is on the internal marketing strategies as these activities are less expensive, can be implemented quickly and can have immediate impact.

Step 10 Write public service announcement (PSA) — project assignment #5. The assignment is to write up an actual PSA in the correct format for the best available newspaper that matches the target market for the services provided. The newspaper must be contacted and all PSA request(s) must be in exactly the correct form and deadlines considered. Furthermore, the PSA should be coordinated with other promotion and/or fund raising strategies and must be approved by the client. The PSA assignment is then graded, returned, edited and put in the proper section of the marketing plan.

Step 11 Meet with client — discuss marketing and fund raising strategies. In addition to telephone conversations, another meeting with the client must take place at this time to discuss marketing strategies as well as conduct the fund raising audit. Students are requested to ask for a copy of the NPO’s most recent grant letter requests in which to build upon for their proposed grant letter.

Step 12 Develop internal and external fund raising strategies. As a result of the fund raising audit meeting and related lectures, the students should begin the development of the internal and external fund raising strategies. Again, greater emphasis is put on developing internal strategies, such as personal letter campaigns that utilize the existing contacts within the client NPO. In regard to external fund raising strategies, the non-profit plan calls for listing 25 “new” potential donors that match the organizations’ giving requirements with their client’s service organization.

Step 13 Write new grant letter request — project assignment #6. Students should attach a copy of the client organization’s most recent grant letter request with the students’ proposed grant letter request. It is a good idea to have each student bring in enough copies of their proposed grant request to distribute to the other students in order to discuss and to identify strengths and weaknesses. The grant letter is then again graded, returned, edited and put in the proper section of the marketing plan.

Step 14 Prepare non-profit marketing plan. In regard to this step, the student prepares the management summary, has the plan edited, revised and then should make every effort to ‘professionalize’ the final copy. Since it is the author’s objective that each final marketing plan be the best it possibly can, the students are informed from the beginning of the term that they can turn in their plan before the due date in which they will receive suggested changes. This is beneficial in avoiding any negative surprises, and therefore has worked well in identifying major weaknesses that would have lowered both the students grade and the overall value of the plan. Furthermore, it has often been proved that if students had completed just one more additional edit of the plan, the final result would be greatly improved.

Step 15 Oral presentation to class and client. The last days of class are devoted to a relatively short student oral presentation which summarizes their internal, external and fund raising recommendations. Students are encouraged to make a face to face appointment with their client in order to review recommendations and answer any questions regarding the plan.

Further Teaching Recommendations

It is strongly recommended that students be constantly reminded by the faculty that the ‘needs’ of the client are more important than additional unnecessary “text” to impress the instructor.

It is essential to set goals and deadlines for each major step and sub-step. In addition to the above mentioned assignments, there are “weekly objectives” and “weekly accomplishments” handouts which are listed out by the students and discussed during class time when appropriate. The purpose of this is learning to plan the necessary small steps as well as the large ones. This serves as an opportunity for students and faculty to provide encouragement and take the time to help and learn from one another. It allows students to view the other client organizations as “five” marketing cases that unfold during the semester. This discussion time also allows students to realize that they are all facing similar hurdles and frustrations.

In regard to the grading criteria, each single part of the plan is graded and given an appropriate score based on the maximum number of points per section. The recommendations sections based on new information are given more weight then situations analysis sections that are based primarily on answers already known by the client.

It is also important that the student follow through with his or her own recommendations. For example, if he or she recommended an advertisement in the local newspaper for an upcoming event, then it is the responsibility of the student to call the newspaper, check the rates and convey this information in the plan and specifically the marketing budget.
ADVANTAGES OF THE MARKETING PLAN PROJECT APPROACH

The marketing plan process provides direct interaction with NPO administrators/managers as well as their respective personalities and management styles. Students are able to see first hand the various responsibilities, dilemmas, successes and failures that non profit decision makers must deal with on a daily basis. In addition, the completed marketing plan serves as an opportunity to promote each respective university in their community. From this service, the university, the community, the students and the business faculty will benefit. Another advantage is the opportunity for a future internship or an employment position. A number of students have found that their marketing plan project has eventually turned into a part-time and even a full-time position. The student has proved themselves through their ability to work with the organization and therefore has lowered the risk to the organization of hiring an unknown individual. The largest advantage is the direct benefit to the various organizations. The marketing plan has forced the client organization to re-evaluate their marketing and fund raising strategies. As a result, the student has discovered insights and recommendations that can have immediate positive impact for the organization.

DISADVANTAGES OF THE MARKETING PLAN STUDENT APPROACH

Perhaps the biggest disadvantage of the marketing plan approach is for the student who doesn’t find an appropriate client in a timely manner and never really “gets out of the gate.” This problem snowballs as the student gets behind and rarely ever catches up. Since every step is built upon the previous step, once students get behind they become very discouraged, as do the clients. The second largest disadvantage stems from clients who have either unclear or unrealistic expectations for the student. This is often demonstrated by difficulty in finding time to meet, being defensive to recommendations, and passing the student on to someone else in the organization. Another disadvantage is the reality that the student may never see their marketing plan implemented. Furthermore, they are not available to discuss potential contingency plans. Finally, there is the disadvantages that exist in every marketing class: the inability to cover all the other important aspects and details of characteristics and strategies that are foregone in order to meet the objective of completing the marketing plan during the semester.

REFERENCES


Business internships: The Employers Perspective

Mark C. Hail, Department of Marketing, Minnesota State University, Mankato, MN 56002-8400 (507)389-1916

Gerald Siles, Department of Marketing, Minnesota State University, Mankato, MN 56002-8400 (507)389-5062

John R. Kuzma, Department of Marketing, Minnesota State University, Mankato, MN 56002-8400 (507)389-5416

Kevin M. Elliott, Department of Marketing, Minnesota State University, Mankato, MN 56002-8400 (507)389-5404

Ann T. Kuzma, Department of Marketing, Minnesota State University, Mankato, MN 56002-8400 (507)389-2318

Abstract

This study assesses practitioner perceptions with regard to business internships. Based on these perceptions, suggestions for internship program development and implementation are presented.

Introduction

A lack of relevant work experience is a common deficiency of college graduates. To overcome this deficiency, and to enhance the educational experience of students, many business schools have added internship programs to their curriculum (Randall and Good, 1991; Hornsby and Johnson, 1991).

The success of any internship is a function of many factors. One of the most critical of these is the degree of congruence between student, employer, and faculty advisor expectations. To the extent that they match, the likelihood of a successful internship experience is increased.

The purpose of the present research is to assess practitioner expectations with regard to business internships. A knowledge of how employers perceive business internships will provide insight to students as they contemplate the internship experience, and to the business school as it tailors internship-related programs and promotions.

Background

The benefits of internships have been widely touted by academicians, practitioners, and students (Taylor, 1986). Equally important, but expounded upon less often, are the negative manifestations of internship programs. Both sides have made some convincing arguments.

On the plus side, internships have been hypothesized to: 1) allow crystallization of vocational self-concept and work values (Hall, 1976; Taylor, 1986); 2) reduce reality shock (Hall, 1976; Taylor, 1986); and 3) increase employment opportunities (Henry, 1979; Taylor, 1988). Additionally, they have been related to increased personal and social efficacy (Beinstein, 1976), and have been touted as a bridge between theory and practice (Groves, Howland, Headly, and Jimison, 1977).

Taylor (1986), in her work, found that interns relative to non-interns; 1) were viewed as better qualified by organizational recruiters, 2) were more likely to stimulate employer hiring actions, 3) were offered higher starting salaries, 4) expressed greater satisfaction with the extrinsic rewards of their position, and, 5) experienced a higher degree of vocational crystallization.

On the negative side, Krohn (1986) maintains that: 1) students are not always serious about their internship, 2) businesses often view interns as a cheap source of labor for menial tasks, 3) university administrators often see internships as a source of revenues without corresponding costs, and 4) on-campus internship supervisors sacrifice time that could be spent on continuing growth, service, and scholarly production. English and Lewison (1979) have expanded on Krohn's final point and maintain that internship program administration is a low pay-off proposition for faculty members.

From the perspective of the employer, internships are increasingly being questioned with regard to: 1) their high costs in terms of budget cutbacks, 2) the difficulty in designing "meaningful" work assignments for three month periods, and 3) the lack of adequate "return on investment" involved with internships (Scott, 1992).

Nonetheless, several factors have been identified that should increase the likelihood of an internship's success. Williams (1976) maintains that effective faculty supervision and participation are critical ingredients for a successful internship experience. He suggests that ideal internship advisors should: 1) work with the interns to define goals and objectives and insure the academic quality of the internship, 2) maintain close contacts with interns, helping them maximize their learning opportunities, providing counseling, and aiding interns in reflecting on their experiences, and 3) establish procedures for evaluating the internship experience. He also advocates quality interaction between the job and academic environments before, during, and after the internship experience. His suggestion is that the advisor, intern, and supervisor act as a committee determining goals and objectives and sharing responsibility for evaluation.

Scott (1992), suggests that there are several key factors that distinguish the most effective internship programs. Internships (and internship programs) should: 1) have clear goals and management support, 2) focus on "real work", not special projects, 3) involve exposure to the whole organization, 4) appropriately match student needs and expectations, and 5) employ critical, ongoing evaluation.

Finally, an understanding of the expectations of the parties involved in the internship is a prerequisite for internship success. In this vein, Hite and Belluzzi (1988) have examined the expectations of students with regard to marketing internships. Based on their results and experiences, they identified the three primary reasons for disappointing internships as being: 1) unclear standards relating to what an internship should involve, 2) misunderstanding or misrepresentation by students of the merits of a job, and 3) misrepresentation by the firm of the duties related to a position in order to gain an intern (Henry, Razzouk, and Hoverland, 1988).
The present study, to a great extent, represents an extension of the Hite and Bellizi (1986) work. Whereas Hite and Bellizi examined student perceptions concerning internships, the present study assesses expectations from the practitioner side.

Methodology

A sixty-two (62) question survey instrument was developed to gather the information used in this study. Respondents were asked to indicate the extent to which they agreed or disagreed with 54 statements dealing with 1) general internship issues, 2) academic requirements, 3) the nature of internships, 4) internship outcomes, 5) employer roles, 6) student roles, and 7) faculty advisor roles. While the majority of these statements were developed specifically for this research, a number were gleaned from the previously mentioned Hite and Bellizi (1986) study. Agreement or disagreement was measured on a five-point Likert scale with one being strongly agree and five being strongly disagree. Additionally, two open-ended questions dealing with internship success/failure factors were asked. Finally, six questions of a demographic nature were presented. A copy of the measurement instrument can be found in Appendix A.

The data was collected through a survey of the Minnesota Chapter of the American Marketing Association. 166 of the 535 questionnaires mailed out were returned and usable for a response rate of 29.3%.

The data was initially analyzed by calculating mean scores and standard deviations for each of the items. As a second step, a series of ANOVAs was conducted to determine if significant differences existed between demographic groups with regard to the items. Next, the responses to the two open-ended questions were consolidated and tallied. Finally, a series of cross-tabulations was conducted between the demographic variables.

Results & Discussion

General Issues

The mean scores for the general internship issues are presented in Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The College of Business should offer internship programs for its students.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>1.221</td>
<td>.478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Internships are meaningful for students who have had much work experience.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>3.283</td>
<td>1.194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Students who have had part-time job experience won't benefit much from an internship.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>4.538</td>
<td>.845</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Employers look to interns as a cheap source of labor.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>3.097</td>
<td>.698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Employers get the money's worth out of interns.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>2.410</td>
<td>.781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Better students are more anxious to do an internship than are poorer students.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>2.563</td>
<td>.947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Internship programs positively impact the link between the business community and the university.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>1.752</td>
<td>.786</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Most internships are a joke, with little learned by the student.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>4.179</td>
<td>.622</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Most faculty members actively support internships.</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>2.673</td>
<td>.737</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Most businesses participate in internship programs.</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>3.490</td>
<td>.833</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Females, and those respondents that had not personally worked with interns in the past five years, agreed to a greater extent with question 1 than did the male respondents or those respondents who had personally worked with interns recently. In the case of question 5, females again agreed to a greater extent than did the males. Those respondents in middle-level management positions disagreed to a greater extent with question 8 than did those respondents in entry-level manager positions. Finally, those respondents whose organizations didn't regularly provide internship opportunities, those respondents in top-management positions, and those respondents employed by smaller organizations (0 to 19 employees) disagreed to a greater extent with question 10 than did those respondents whose organizations provided internship opportunities, those respondents in middle-level management positions, and those respondents employed by larger organizations (500 or more employees).

Academic Requirements

Table 2 presents the means for the issues dealing with academic requirements.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11. Any student in good standing should be allowed an internship, no minimum G.P.A. should apply.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>2.486</td>
<td>1.260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Students should be allowed during the senior year.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>2.003</td>
<td>1.028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Internships should be allowed until a student is done with all coursework in the major.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.952</td>
<td>1.040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Students should be required to establish grades and objectives for the internship prior to its start.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>1.825</td>
<td>.844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Students should be required to do outside reading during an internship.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>2.507</td>
<td>1.067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Students should be required to write a paper as part of the internship.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.379</td>
<td>1.081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Students should be required to make an oral presentation about the internship.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.145</td>
<td>.972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Students should receive a pass/fail grade for the internship rather than a letter grade.</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>2.262</td>
<td>1.156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Employers should have more input than the faculty advisor toward student internship grades.</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>2.289</td>
<td>.870</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Female respondents disagreed to a greater extent with question 12, agreed to a lesser extent with questions 15, 16, and 17, and agreed to a greater extent with question 19 than did male respondents. Those respondents in top-level management positions agreed to a greater extent with question 15 than did respondents in entry-level management positions.

Nature of the Internship

Table 3 provides the statistics dealing with the nature of the internship.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20. An internship should be project-oriented (e.g. research study) rather than job-oriented (e.g. management training).</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>3.186</td>
<td>1.114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. The &quot;environment&quot; in which the student intern is more important than is the &quot;content&quot; of the job assignment.</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>3.300</td>
<td>.885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22. Internship positions should involve duties which are appropriate for a college graduate.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.144</td>
<td>.917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23. To facilitate supervision and interaction, internships should be restricted to the local area.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.465</td>
<td>1.048</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24. It is fair to have a full-time internship experience (not attend classes simultaneously).</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>2.883</td>
<td>1.181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25. An intern should be allowed to withdraw from the program if they personally conflict develops with an employer.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.911</td>
<td>1.297</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26. A written contract between the firm, the employer, and the faculty advisor which establishes pay, hours, and duties contributes to the success of an internship.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>1.814</td>
<td>.913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27. Internships should be granted on a competitive basis.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>2.302</td>
<td>.883</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Those respondents employed by smaller organizations (15 to 99 employees) disagreed to a greater extent with question 20 than did those respondents employed by larger organizations (500 or more employees). In the case of question 25, male respondents and those respondents who had not personally worked with an intern within the last five years agreed to a greater extent than did female respondents and those respondents who had recently been personally involved with an intern.
Internship Outcomes

Mean scores for the items dealing with internship outcomes are presented in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>28. An internship experience is more valuable than a college course.</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>.495</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29. An internship experience is more beneficial than having several good speakers in classes.</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>.741</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. Taking three or four courses will benefit students more than will an internship.</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>.838</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31. A successful internship is just as good as a part-time job offer.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>.890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32. An internship is a valuable learning experience to supplement college coursework.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>4.15</td>
<td>.953</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33. Prospective employers view students with internship experience more favorably than those without.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>4.20</td>
<td>.978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34. Former interns usually have higher starting salaries than those students without internship experience.</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>3.68</td>
<td>.893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35. Internships help students identify job-related skills and opportunities.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>3.86</td>
<td>.927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36. Internship reduces the &quot;scary&quot; of starting a permanent job.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>.576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37. Internships facilitate the development of good work habits.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>.735</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. Students should receive college credit for the internship experience.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>.823</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. College credit for internships should be given when the work done is the same as that done by regular employees.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.56</td>
<td>.900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. Students should be paid at the same rate as regular employees.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.46</td>
<td>1.081</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. Paying an intern helps improve students' resumes and job opportunities.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td>1.099</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Female respondents disagreed to a greater extent with question 30 than did males. In the case of question 34, those respondents employed by smaller organizations (16-49 employees) agreed with the statement to a greater extent than did respondents employed by large organizations (100 to 499 employees).

Employer/Student/Advisor Roles

Means for the questions dealing with employer, student, and advisor roles are found in Table 5.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>42. Employers should provide a formal training program at the beginning of the internship.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>2.44</td>
<td>1.040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. Employers should provide a formal evaluation of student performance at the end of the internship.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>1.677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. Employers should treat an intern as well as they would any permanent employee.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>.958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. Employers should provide fees of an intern than a permanent employee.</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>1.168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

STUDENT ROLE

46. Students should be expected to find an internship opportunity on their own. 143 3.36  .900
47. Students should be allowed to find their own internships as long as they are approved by the faculty advisor. 143 4.05  .615
48. Interns should conform to the same norms ofdress and behavior as permanent employees. 145 3.24  .475
49. Students should be given a chance to evaluate the faculty advisor at the end of the internship. 141 1.95  .935

FACULTY ADVISOR ROLE

50. It is the faculty advisor's responsibility to find an internship opportunity for a student. 143 3.32  1.000
51. Family advisors should visit students on the job during the internship. 144 2.42  1.055
52. Faculty advisors should communicate with the student on a frequent basis during the internship. 145 2.27  .963
53. Faculty advisors should communicate with the student on a frequent basis during the internship. 144 1.83  .710
54. In the internship role (employer/student/advisor), the faculty advisor is the weak link. 135 2.74  .900

Male respondents disagreed to a greater extent with question 46 than did female respondents. In the case of question 47, females and middle-level managers agreed to a greater extent than did males and top-level managers. Question 49 again found females agreeing to a greater extent than males. Top-level managers agreed more strongly with question 51 than did middle-level managers or non-management respondents. Finally, those respondents who had not personally been involved with an intern within the past five years agreed to a greater extent with questions 62 and 53 than did those who had recently been personally involved.

Success/Failure Factors

The responses to the two questions dealing with internship success and failure factors can be found in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Established objectives/expectations</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>.885</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student attitude/motivation</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>2.37</td>
<td>.857</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meaningful work</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>.758</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate communications</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.677</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study skills</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.25</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;A complete&quot; project</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adequate training/supervision</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student interest in learning</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriation of practice experience</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student knowledge/awareness</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No performances evaluations</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employer involvement/engagement</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to work independently</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compensation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intern not part of &quot;team&quot;</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of student flexibility</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of performance evaluation</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship burned as a &quot;good&quot; job</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>.706</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Demographics of Sample

The responses to the demographic questions are presented in Table 7.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>46.3</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>53.6</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide internship opportunities</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>53.8</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>46.2</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of interns in Last Five Years</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>328.8</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>103.3</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Management</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entry-Level Management</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Level Management</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top-Level Management</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization Type*</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Government</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Government</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Producer</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Producer</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consumer Services</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>32.0</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Profit</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>30.8</td>
<td>.916</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Percentages do not add up to 100% due to multiple organization types.
Interestingly, whether the organization regularly provided internship opportunities was found to be related to the organizational position of the respondent. Those organizations that regularly provided internship opportunities were under-represented in the non-management, entry-level, and top-level categories (and over-represented in the case of mid-level management). Conversely, those organizations that didn’t regularly provide internship opportunities were under-represented in the mid-level category (and over-represented in the non-management, entry-level, and top-level).

Additionally, whether the organization regularly provided internship opportunities was found to be associated with the size of the organization. Those organizations that regularly provided internship opportunities were over-represented in the large (500 or more employees) organization size category and under-represented in the small (0-499 employees) size category. On the other hand, those organizations that didn’t regularly provide internship opportunities were over-represented in the small employee size category and under-represented in the large category.

The obvious was confirmed when the relationship between whether the organization regularly provided internship opportunities and the number of interns worked with by the respondent in the past was examined. Those respondents who had previously worked with interns in the past five years were over-represented in organizations that regularly provided internship opportunities for business students. Conversely, they were under-represented in those organizations that didn’t regularly provide internship opportunities.

Finally, a relationship was uncovered concerning the gender of the respondent and the position held in the organization. Not surprisingly, males were over-represented in the top-level management category while females were under-represented. Conversely, males were under-represented in the non-management, entry-level, and mid-level categories while females were over-represented.

Implications

Employer responses regarding their views on internships and the various roles that should be played by the employers, students, and advisors have dramatically highlighted the importance placed on the internship experience. All the questions whose mean response was strongly agree (less than or equal to 2.0) or strongly disagree (greater than or equal to 4.0) indicated that employers consider internships to be a valuable experience. This employer recognition of internship importance creates implications for marketing educators and advisors regarding student information, employer communications, and curriculum development.

Implications regarding students

Since employers have placed such high importance on the internship experience, it becomes the responsibility of all marketing educators to openly promote the internship experience as a valuable educational resource. Students need to be informed of the value attributed to internships by employers. Educators must encourage students to seek out and participate in internship opportunities. Marketing educators must also become more involved in advising students on how to identify and solicit internships. Involvement may include helping to develop more internship opportunities.

Implications regarding employers

Since employers already recognize the importance of internships, educators must work toward establishing communication links with the employers to promote the utilization of interns. They should encourage employers to make more internship opportunities available, not just occasionally but on a continual basis. Marketing is an applications oriented discipline making internships a natural extension of the education process. Marketing educators must maintain an ongoing communication with employers to ensure that student interns arrive with the proper academic tools to make the internship experience successful.

Implications regarding curriculum

The importance accredited to internships by employers suggests that internships should be considered as a required element of marketing education. Practical application has long been a mainstay in areas such as nursing, elementary education, dental hygienics, and sport administration. Why not marketing? Educators must identify how best to incorporate the internship experience into the required curriculum. Understandably, each college and university faces different environmental circumstances which will affect how internships are incorporated. However, educators should strive to recognize the importance incorporating the internship experience.

Conclusions

This research has provided some insight into the expectations and perceptions of business practitioners with regard to internships. Future research could involve an empirical study in which the expectations of faculty, employers, and students are elicited and compared. Bringing the faculty and students into the picture will allow a complete analysis of the internship tried.

References


Scott, M. E. (1992, April). Internships add value to college recruit-

Taylor, M. S. (1988). Effects of college internships on individual
participants. Journal of Applied Psychology 72(3) 393-401.

Williams, T. J. (1978). The faculty advisor's role in intern supervi-
sion. Teaching Political Science 4(1) 101-110.
A COMPARATIVE ASSESSMENT OF THREE ALTERNATIVE SCALING APPROACHES FOR THE MEASUREMENT OF STUDENT-TEAM PEER PERFORMANCE

Stuart Van Auken, Department of Finance and Marketing, California State University, Chico
Chico, CA. 95929-0051 (916-898-5773)

ABSTRACT

Students evaluated themselves and fellow team members through the use of three alternative measurement scales: the semantic differential, constant sum, and anchored expectations. Assessments of convergent validity between the approaches on three traits (extent, quality and overall contribution) revealed moderate correlations, thus suggesting that the properties of the measurement scales were responsible for other than a high convergence. A subsequent factor analysis confirmed the uniqueness of the scaling approaches and helped to suggest that the measurement approaches were tapping different aspects of the measured traits. Based on these findings, it is recommended that multiple measurement approaches for self and peer assessments be considered.

INTRODUCTION

Having resumed the use of student teams in my marketing research classes, I am now able to foster skill building in a way that was lacking in a traditional lecture format or class project assignment. This is because team projects enable students to conceptualize an entire issue and to bring their talents to bear on all of the project's many factors. In my traditional class projects, students were organized into task specialties and they subsequently missed much of what was occurring in other student task groups despite a sharing of information among class members as to task approach and accomplishment. Still, student teams are not without their problems, especially those that relate to performance evaluation. In this study, I contrast three scaling approaches for the measurement of peer evaluation (semantic differential, constant sum, and anchored expectation scales) with an emphasis on an assessment of their relative strengths, weaknesses, and convergencies. My focus will now concentrate on the first of these approaches: the semantic differential.

Semantic Differential

With my resumption of team projects, I used the seven-point semantic differential scale advocated by Haas and Seaglimpaglia (1994) to assess self and peer performance on numerous evaluative traits; however, I found that the resulting peer evaluations tended to truncate around the positive ends of the measured traits. I did note that an underperforming team member or social loafer could be revealed. However, I worried about the truly superior group performer who was typically going unrecognized in team-member evaluations. Basically, if team members were meeting expectations, it appeared that the positive ends of the scale positions (e.g., seven and sixes) were assigned to all group members.

Constant Sum Scale

To help remedy this situation, I developed a constant sum scale for measuring individual team-member performance. (See Figure 1.) This scale forces team members to make comparative judgments as to peer contributions and it represents a significant departure from the semantic differential scale and its absolute evaluations. In the semantic differential scale, each team member is evaluated separately or absolutely and not in relation to other team members. The use of the constant sum scale serves to reveal truly superior performing team members as well as social loafers (Van Auken 1994). As a result, I viewed it as being superior to the semantic differential scale in the making of individual peer and self evaluations.

Anchored Expectation Scale

With the subsequent use of both the semantic differential and constant sum scales for team evaluations, I decided to develop and evaluate a third scaling approach for the measurement of individual team-member performance. This approach is anchored to expectations and embodies "some" properties of both the semantic differential and constant sum scales, although the latter is conceptual and not mathematical. In this new scale, individual team members are evaluated on three traits (extent, quality, and overall contribution); yet, these traits are anchored to group expectations. An can be seen in Figure 2. if a team member meets group expectations on one of the attribute traits, that individual would be placed in the central or middle scale position. Deviations from
group expectations would in turn serve to reveal superior or inferior team-member performance. Thus, this approach forces evaluators to relate each peer and themselves to a group norm. Although team members are being evaluated independently like in the semantic differential scale, the forced comparison with the central scale position results in a judgment as to who met and who do not meet group expectations. Thus, superior and inferior performers with respect to these expectations may be revealed. In this regard, the approach is similar to the conceptual effect of the constant sum scale.

The benefit of this scale is seen in that a class team is forced to consider team expectations at the initiation of a project with respect to a team member's extent, quality, and overall contribution. For example, a team may expect each team member to do their fair share and to provide a quality level of work that would meet an agreed upon grade expectation. Unfortunately, problems may exist as to norm setting. To illustrate, a team may primarily decide on a grade of C effort, while one team member may want the team to pursue a grade of A effort. However, the scale allows the team member who performs at a norm-breaking level to be identified and recognized. In fact, this was one of the reasons that I developed the anchored expectation scale, as I felt that some of my better students were being penalized because they had the misfortune to be on teams that were not high-performing and given a time constraint they were unable to make-up the deficiencies of other nonperforming team members.

Of course, the constant sum scale also permits the revelation of the breakthrough performer, yet it does not foster a setting of expectations. For example, a whole team could submit to me a substandard project effort, yet each team member could still be given identical point allocations. The anchored expectation scale is also open to problems due to a failure of a team to meet initial expectations, yet it does force a consideration of expectations and it may serve to enhance team member performance.

The Task

With the development of the anchored expectations approach, I decided to have ten of my student teams comprised of five students per team employ all three measurement approaches in their final evaluations of the extent, quality, and overall contributions of themselves and fellow team members. That is, they were to evaluate all team members using the semantic differential, constant sum, and anchored expectation scale formats. Of course, my students were informed of this at the initiation of their project and they were given copies of all three measurement approaches. They were also asked to consider group expectations for team performance and after project completion they were formally given the measurement instruments in a rotated sequence. This was done to help lessen the impact of order-bias that is attendant to assessments of alternative scale efficacy.

The project was one that required a breakthrough effort for each team. In this regard, each team was required to run the following SPSS software packages on their collected data: multiple regression, ANOVA, and Chi square. An inability to consummate this step would result in project failure. Additionally, teams were asked to create tables of data and to interpret their results. Thus, a failure to properly interpret statistical data would result in grade reduction. Overall, the project was challenging and provided an opportunity for the revelation of the social loafer (Harkins and Jackson 1995; Jackson and Williams 1985; Latane, Williams, and Harkins 1979) and the breakthrough performer (Van Auken 1994).

SCALE COMPARISONS

Given three alternative approaches for the measurement of team-member performance, I sought to determine the extent of their convergence. If all three approaches when measuring each of the three traits (i.e., extent, quality, and overall contribution) produced highly convergent results, then each measurement approach could be viewed as a surrogate for the other. Conversely if the approaches did not converge, this would suggest that each approach was tapping different aspects of the trait and that the methods were sufficiently different to consider their inherent advantages and disadvantages in the selection of a scaling approach for peer and self evaluation.

To accomplish the assessment of alternative scaling-approach convergence as to each of the three traits, I developed a multitrait-multimethod correlation matrix which is seen in Table 1. As can be noted, the correlations within the heterotrait-monomethod triangles were substantial, thus suggesting a high level of internal consistency among the three traits for each measurement approach. In fact, the Cronbach alpha values for the three alternative methodologies are as
follows: constant sum—.95; anchored expectation—.96; semantic differential—.86. Given that the extent, quality, and overall contribution traits are conceptually related, these alphas are quite expected.

Assessments of monotrait-heteromethod correlations (i.e., the convergent validity coefficients) in Table 1 revealed only moderate convergencies. For example, the correlation between the constant sum scale and the anchored expectation scale as to the extent of one's contribution was only .39. Overall, the lowest convergent validity coefficient equaled .32, while the highest equaled .55. Further, the average convergent validity coefficient equaled .43. These results suggested that the methods of measurement were somewhat different and that they were to some degree tapping different elements of the extent, quality, and overall contribution traits.

To further assess the departure among the three methodological approaches, a principal component factor analysis with varimax rotation was run. The results of this analysis appear in Table 2. As can be seen, three factors emerged. These factors accounted for 88.3% of the variance in the collected data. Further, each methodological approach loaded heavily on a separate factor. The first factor represented the anchored expectation scale, while factors two and three represented the constant sum and semantic differential scales, respectively. These results helped to confirm that the three methods were sufficiently different and that they were revealing different insights into individual team-member performance.

THE APPROACHES: ADDITIONAL FINDINGS

Since the three alternative approaches do not reveal high convergent validity and given that they load on separate factors, a brief description of additional findings is warranted. Consistent with my prior observations, the average scores for the semantic differential scale on the extent, quality, and overall contribution traits were as follows: 5.80, 6.48, and 6.37, respectively. As can be observed, the scores are truncated around the high-end scale position (i.e., a value of seven); thus truly superior or breakthrough performers within each team may be going unrecognized. The semantic differential scale, however, does have the potential for revealing the social loafer. As would be mathematically expected, the average score for the constant sum scale on each of the three traits equals a value of 20 (100 points divided by five team members). However, the range of scores for the extent and quality contribution traits was from 5 to 35. while the overall contribution trait produced a range of 5 to 30. The standard deviations for the extent, quality, and overall contribution traits equaled 3.22, 3.19, and 3.19, respectively. Clearly, the constant sum scale can reveal the superior or breakthrough performer, as well as the social loafer. Further, the anchored expectation scale, in which the meeting of group expectations was anchored to a value of three produced average scale values of 3.30, 3.32 and 3.32 for the extent, quality and overall contribution traits. Scores also ranged from 1 to 5 for each of the traits with standard deviations of .74, .73, and .71 for the extent, quality and overall contribution traits, respectively. This scale also evidence potential in revealing the superior or breakthrough performer as well as the social loafer, yet it is unique in that it addresses team expectations, while the constant sum scale does not.

CONCLUSIONS

The measurement of peer and self performance within student teams continues to be a difficult task. Its complexity is highlighted when it is considered that different scaling approaches for team-member evaluation can yield different insights. Like the biological sciences, different slides of the same phenomena when viewed through a microscope may yield different perspectives. In this case, the constant sum, anchored expectation, and semantic differential scaling approaches may be likened to different slides portraying different insights into peer and self evaluations. With respect to this, the semantic differential scale ignores a relative comparison of individual team members on a given trait, instead each member is evaluated independently on that trait. Alternatively, the constant sum scale forces relative or comparative judgments for each group member on each trait. In other words, each team member is evaluated relative to all other team members. Still, this scale ignores team expectations. A third scale, entitled anchored expectations, which was developed for this study, appears to tap elements of individual and comparative judgments, yet may present a problem with respect to an interpretation of group expectations among team members. Thus, it is suggested that all three variants be used in team member evaluations so as to bring as much information to bear as possible on

104
the peer and self evaluation process. By so doing, some of the perplexing and confounding issues in teammember evaluations may be effectively managed.

REFERENCES


Figures and Tables are available from the author by request.
TEAM LEARNING: BACK ON TRACK

Don Kirchner, California State University, Northridge, Northridge, CA 91330-8245 (818) 885-4998

ABSTRACT

The value of team efforts has been amply demonstrated for many years. Following the Japanese lead, team applications have been widely adopted by US firms in a variety of industries. The literature is rich with publications dealing with team based work systems in marketing especially in the areas of product development, field sales and account management in advertising.

TEAM LEARNING

The education literature indicates in excess of 600 experimental studies of learning teams over the past 60 years in diverse educational environments. However, the literature as well as anecdotal reportage suggests that faculty attitudes toward groups are not uniformly enthusiastic.

Authorities in this area make clear the important distinction between groups and team learning (aka collaborative learning). These authors identify three types of learning environments: 1) individualistic situations in which student learning objectives are independent of their colleagues (as with an established grade scale); 2) competitive grading based on a curve (some win, others lose); 3) team (collaborative) learning which employs small student groups working together to maximize their own and each other's learning.

The team approach implies a clear, realistic set of learning objectives as well as the will to achieve them. Also required is a commitment to the success of each member of the learning team. It implies that students actively assist each other's learning because the fate of the team requires it. Successful teams hold each member personally liable for their share of the work.

PROCEDURE

In each of the previous three semesters, a single section of marketing communications was randomly selected for organization in team learning format. Teams of 3-5 students were assigned weekly goals based on successful completion of a series of forty study guides that were normally prepared for each class at the beginning of the semester. A more complete description of the course transformation, policy and administration is available from the author.

Classes met twice weekly for two 75-minute periods. The first meeting was lecture format, however, the second was set aside for team discussions and exchange of information. The instructor acted as a consultant visiting each team. Completed study guides were collected weekly from a randomly chosen member of each team. They were graded, returned and critiqued the following week. Team members shared corrected study guides. The team component accounted for 35% of the total grade.

An incentive program provided a five point bonus to an entire team when all members achieved a "B" grade of higher on an examination. In addition, students with an earned "B" average were excused from the comprehensive final examination. Teams were permitted to fire recalcitrants, due process observed.

RESULTS

The team format was assessed by comparing the results of the two essay midterms administered to all sections each semester. In the first semester, a comparison of the team vs. lecture section scores indicated a clear superiority for the teams as measured by differences in midterm medians. Student preferences for the team format were high as were the instructor ratings. Surprisingly, the second semester median differences on the first midterm were slightly lower for the team section though the second midterm results indicated a modest superiority. The third semester midterm results again showed a clear advantage for the teams.

Overall, this three semester trial has demonstrated a nearly consistent advantage for the team format. These experiences, data from informal class debriefings at the end of each semester as well as narrative comments on the formal course evaluation questionnaires led to the following guidelines for team teaching:

1. Staffing resources must match class size.
2. Teams should have adequate small group facilities.
3. Teams must develop and enforce clear performance standards.
4. Team based incentives enhance the results.
5. Team assignments should minimize student work avoidance strategies.
6. Teams do not administrate themselves. They require supervision, encouragement, cheerleading.
7. Instructor complacency is deadly.

For references and further information, please contact the author at the above address.

106
TEACHING CONFLICT RESOLUTION SKILLS IN THE BUSINESS CLASSROOM

Sharon Wagner, Department of Business and Economics, (816) 271-5824; Joanne Katz, Department of Criminal Justice and Legal Studies (816) 271-5837; Missouri Western State College, St. Joseph, MO 64507

ABSTRACT

The use of teams is increasing in both business and classroom settings. Successful team participation requires good communication skills, familiarity with problem solving techniques, and the ability to resolve conflicts. While businesses train their employees in these skills, there does not appear to be a systematic effort to develop these skills in students. Conflict resolution skills will provide students some tools to use in resolving problems in team experiences, and provide a basis for further learning. This paper presents a Conflict Resolution teaching module, based on a mediation model.

INTRODUCTION

Many companies use teams to identify, research, and resolve problems. American Express, General Electric, AT&T, Boeing, Citibank, Disney, the U.S. Post Office and Xerox are among the many companies which use teams. Quality and reengineering movements have led companies to realize that there was a need to change old work patterns. Teams are an important part of this movement (Pacanowsky 1995). Wellsins and George (1991) reported on a nationwide survey by Development Dimensions International (DDI), the Association for Quality and Participation (AQP) and Industry Week in which 28% of the respondents replied that they used self-directed teams (SDTs) in at least some of their activities, and expected more than half of their workforce to be working in teams by 1996. Of the Fortune 500 companies with sales of at least $500 million, 52% used SDTs. In order to prepare students to be successful and efficient in this new workplace, the use of team projects in the business curriculum has increased (Greising 1989, Robbins 1994).

Efficient teams provide benefits to the company and to the individual. Robbins (1994) investigated the idea that individual responsibilities and assignments benefited by participation in teams, and found that group work had a positive impact on the team member's appraisal of the task assigned to them. Respondents reported a heightened sense of meaningfulness in their work, a sense of belonging to the team, and higher levels of commitment to a group project than to individual assignments. Studies of companies with successful teams report improved productivity, increased measures of quality, higher levels of job satisfaction and customer service, and higher morale (Mussewhite and Moran 1990, Versteeg 1990, Wellsins and George 1991).

Several authors have identified skills which must be developed for both the individual and the team to be effective. Skills in communication and interpersonal relations are frequently mentioned attributes for success. The major ability, however, that is vital to the effective functioning of a team is the ability to resolve conflicts (King 1988, Mussewhite and Moran 1990, Steckler and Fondas 1995, Versteeg 1990, Wellsins and George 1991).

These important skills can be learned through training and coaching. Wellsins and George (1991) reported that 83% of the companies they studied offered training in problem solving, 62% taught communication skills, and 61% provided specific training in conflict resolution. Insufficient training was given as the number one cause of the failure of a team.

In order to prepare students to be able to work efficiently and effectively in this new workplace, the use of team projects in business classes has increased (Robbins 1994). New curricula at several top business schools emphasize leadership/teamwork training (Deutschman 1991, Kruger 1994).

Many business courses involve team projects. Often, the focus is on successful completion of the project, with little, if any, specific training as to the efficient functioning of the team. A recent literature search revealed 360 references to alternative dispute resolution, and 94 references to conflict resolution. Only nine of these references referred to teaching conflict resolution skills. Of these, four focused on teaching the skills to elementary and secondary students and teachers as a technique to lessen classroom violence, one focused on Eastern Europe, one was limited to nurses, and two were directed toward business managers. The one article which
recommended teaching conflict resolution skills to business students was from a lawyer whose primary concern was the need for future business managers to understand these skills as a method of solving legal disputes (Neslund 1988). There does not appear to be a systematic attempt to teach conflict resolution skills to business students.

Apparently both business leaders and educators understand the importance of team projects. While businesses provide conflict resolution training to their employees, this training does not appear to be given to business students. Training in conflict resolution would help the students develop the skills which would help them deal with the inevitable problems which arise out of team projects. The opportunity to develop confidence and knowledge in this important area will also enhance the students’ performance in the workplace. This paper presents a Conflict Resolution Teaching Module. The module is based on a mediation model. There are four, 90-minute sessions which can be adapted to work within any business class which includes team projects.

SESSION 1: THE NATURE OF CONFLICT

Conflict is an inevitable part of team assignments, and it can hamper or even prevent productivity. While different views may cause discomfort, it also gives everyone an opportunity to view a situation from a different angle. Thus, especially in team work, conflict may bring the opportunity for creativity.

Exercise 1.1 Each student writes down three words they associate with "conflict." These are written on the board and discussed. Words frequently seen are "powerless," "angry" and "scary."

Exercise 1.2 Each student is to write down three positive outcomes of conflict. These words are also written on the board, and discussed.

The Origin of Conflict

Conflict usually involves one of four problem areas. When attempting to resolve a conflict, it is important to identify the origin of the problem. The basis of conflict can be found by examining:

1. People: are the people involved unable to communicate? Is there a cultural or gender barrier involved?
2. Relationship: Do the people have a pre-existing relationship which is getting in the way of working together now? Do they just not like each other?
3. Procedural: is the problem stemming from the manner in which the group works together? How are assignments made? Who is making the decisions?
4. Substantive: Does the problem lie in the content of the decisions which are being made by the group? for the group by the professor?

Exercise 1.3 Students develop a list of common team problems and analyze to which area the problem belongs. Once that area is identified, the solution can be geared toward the problem. The real issue may get lost in all of the bad feelings which have surfaced. Identifying the area of the problem will move the participants to a solution.

Conflict Styles

Each individual has their own personal way of dealing with conflict. Typical Conflict Styles are:

1. Shark: controlling, overpowering, values goals over relationships.
2. Teddy Bear: accommodating, values relationships over goals.
3. Fox: compromise is the only way, everything must be 50/50.
4. Turtle: avoids conflict, will not engage.
5. Owl: collaborator, believes that there can be win/win solutions. Values both relationships and goals.

Exercise 1.4 Each student completes a survey to identify which of the five basic conflict styles fits them.

SESSION 2: NEGOTIATION

Negotiation is a process of discussing or bargaining in an attempt to resolve differences (Webster 1988). When working on team assignments, participants need to be able to negotiate when conflict arises. People tend to approach most conflictive situations with the attitude that they are right, and the other person is wrong, or that if I give in to you, I am giving up something of myself. Fisher, Ury and Patton (1991) suggest three tests of a successful negotiation: did it produce agreement? was it efficient? did it improve the connection between the parties?

Exercise 2.1 The class pairs off into teams. Each team is given a situation to role play, and only told, "Convince the other side to see it your way."
It is very difficult to convince someone of a different point of view when they have an equally strong feeling about their own. This first exercise needs to be stopped after a few minutes, and additional information given.

Exercise 2.2 Each person is to list five things that are important to them about the conflict in 2.1. These may include a good grade, helping a friend, etc. The lists are then shared with their partners to determine if they have any common goals.

People come to most negotiations from their position. This is the end result they hope to get, or think they can achieve. As seen in the first exercise, it is difficult to get a result that both people are happy with when you engage in a positional negotiation. When two people uncover why they are attached to that position, as the teams have done in this last exercise, they start to recognize their interests. Interest-based negotiation has the potential for more positive results than positional based negotiations.

Fisher et al (1991) state that interest-based negotiations are based on a four step method:
1. Separate the people from the problem: redirect personal attacks into attacks on the problem.
2. Avoid positions, discover interests: try to find out why a person has that particular position.
3. Discover options for mutual benefit: once you find out what everyone is actually interested in, brainstorm to determine how many of those interests can be met in a joint decision.
4. Use objective standards: if questions of fact come up, seek out the advice of an expert. If

Exercise 2.3 Students now go back to their pairs and attempt to negotiate a result which will meet as many interests as possible for both parties. When the period is nearly up, the groups are polled to review what each group has accomplished.

Interest-based bargaining can help parties find results which they did not know were possible. Even though the people involved may appear to be hopeless at odds, there may be ways to find solutions that will satisfy at least the major interests of the parties involved.

SESSION 3: MEDIATION SKILLS

Mediation is a problem-solving process where two or more people in a conflict meet with a neutral third party and create a solution to end their conflict. The neutral party is called a mediator and does not make a decision for the parties. The mediator's role is to facilitate the negotiation of the conflicting parties.

Historically, mediation comes from Chinese and Japanese culture, where an emphasis on peacemaking rather than win/lose alternatives, has made it the dominant form of resolution. Grounded in Confucianism, and shared by Buddhism and Taoism, mediation is based in the concept that conflict does not equate to contest (Crum 1987).

Individuals may find themselves playing the role of a mediator, whether by helping individual members of a team who may be having difficulty working together, or using the skills of a mediator in solving personal problems. Mediation consists of four simple steps:
1. Setting ground rules for behavior during the mediation.
2. Letting each party state the problem, and set an agenda for what must be discussed.
3. Developing options for mutual gain.
4. Choosing an option, and creating an agreement.

The mediator uses their skills to help the parties to succeed at this type of negotiation. Two skills which are particularly helpful in negotiation are reflective listening and reframing. Reflective listening is a two step process. First, the mediators listen carefully to the speaker and tries to paraphrase back what he has heard. This reframing assures the speaker that he has been heard. If the content seems to have a lot of emotional underpinnings, the mediator then attempts to state back to the speaker the emotion that he has heard. The stating of the emotion tends to diffuse it, and allow the speaker to be less attached to it.

Reframing is the essential skill of any mediator. Reframing takes emotionally charged language and restates it in a neutral context. For example, Mary might say, "George is impossible to work with. He is never on time, and always blames me that the work isn't done." The mediator might reframe by saying, "It sounds like you and George have had scheduling and work distribution problems." While Mary wanted to blame George, the mediator attempted to discuss the problem, not the people. Reframing can often redirect the negative energy.

Exercise 3.1 Students form teams of two. The first
speaker should discuss why he believes he will do well in a marketing position. The other person should listen, and attempt to paraphrase the content. Then the speaker should continue, and the listener should state the emotion. The roles of speakers and listener are then switched, with the team following the same instructions. The class then reviews the process.

SESSION 4: MEDIATION CONTINUED

These skills which have been developed now need to be practiced by role-playing a mediation situation. Students are formed into groups of three, one acting as the mediator, and the other two are given roles to play.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The teaching module which has been developed is an attempt to raise awareness of the benefits of conflict resolution skills as a method of increasing the efficient functioning of student teams. As instructors gain knowledge of these skills, they can remind the students of what they have learned, and reinforce the principles involved. Students who have developed skills in conflict resolution will be better able to deal with the inevitable interpersonal problems that arise from a team project, whether it is in an academic or business setting.

REFERENCES


